

Infotransformation of Markets

Introduction to the Special Issue on Marketing and Information Technology

Detlev Zwick
York University

Nikhilesh Dholakia
University of Rhode Island

Information and communication technologies (ICTs) are a driving force behind major economic, social, and cultural shifts from the modern to the postmodern, from local to global markets, from production to consumption, and from industrial to informational economies. While much has been written about the relationship between marketing and technology, most of the work regards marketing as an *a priori* category onto which new technologies are simply overlaid as they come along. These instrumentalist–functionalist views of ICTs in marketing are not particularly well suited when—as in macromarketing—the focus is on marketing systems and consumption systems. The present collection of articles provides one of the most insightful one-stop learning shops of the changing character of markets in the information age. From the fractal views of the ethical economy and its emergent collaborative production-provisioning-consumption system to the realities of the persistent digital divide in the age of the mobile phone, articles in this issue touch on important elements of marketing in the age of information. We invite you to enter and enrich these discussions.

Keywords: *information and communication technology; marketing; globalization; consumer culture; co-production; collaboration*

There have been dramatic changes in the nature, availability, and use of information and communication technologies (ICTs)—customer databases, e-commerce methods, information systems, mobile communication devices, and the Internet—especially since the 1980s (Lyotard 1984). Many analyses of the contemporary world consider the emergence of ICTs as the driving force behind major economic, social, and cultural shifts from the modern to the postmodern, from local to global markets, from production to consumption, and from industrial to informational economies. It is not surprising that the rise in information-producing, -manipulating, -distributing, and -consuming technologies coincides with the increasing role of global markets and the unprecedented prominence of global marketing activities (even if targeted locally). Information, the market, and marketing have become dominant institutions and practices not only in the affluent societies of the West but also in large parts of the non-Western world, from Shanghai to Trinidad to Gabon.

With communication technologies dispersing throughout the planet, an ever-growing share of the human experience, including market exchanges, is now operationalized through the concept of “data.” Information, more than at

any time before, has become the essence of the market (Knorr, Cetina, and Preda 2005). Innocuous sounding, almost organic descriptions of information as flowing and circulating, however, make it easy to overlook the dramatically heightened intensity, increased complexity, and growing volume of information brought about by the rise of ICTs and the concomitant burdening effects on members of the information age. Consumers often feel overwhelmed and intimidated by the quantity of information available for consumption. Marketers have responded to information overload with solutions that seem to mimic the problem: a deluge of search tools, buying guides, top-ten lists, and direct marketing formats offering highly targeted (and hence presumably more relevant) digests, summaries, and deals of the week.

Authors’ Note: This special issue would not have been possible without the generous help of many diligent and thoughtful reviewers. We thank them for it. We also would like to thank Yesim Ozalp for the many hours of conscientious editing work she provided to all the articles in this issue. Lastly, we would like to thank the editor of the *Journal of Macromarketing*, Cliff Shultz, for giving this issue a great home and for his encouragement throughout the process.

ICTs have a quixotic duality: information overpowers, yet it also empowers. There is clear evidence that, even as its volume explodes, information empowers consumers in markets for goods, services, experiences, and ideas. Tools that summon, gather, summarize, and arrange information for the purpose of consumption are improving, i.e., are more easily consumable. One could argue that the set of articles in this special issue represents such a tool, “a meta-textual means by which information on a topic can be filtered, collected, and presented for consumption” (Cohen and Rutsky 2005, 2). One of the substantial implications, then, of the rise of ICTs and the concomitant production, reproduction, distribution, and endless consumption of information is that it has become almost impossible to distinguish between the consumption of information and the acquisition of knowledge. In other words, a culture increasingly permeated and diffused by ICTs gives birth to situations where every interaction with information (and data) is as much a type of consumption as is the purchasing of a product. Hence, we offer with this collection of articles to look at the relationship and interconnectivities of contemporary ICTs and modern macromarketing, we first and foremost aim to raise new questions about what it means “to market” and “to consume” in the age of information (Cohen and Rutsky 2005).

As ICTs continue to diffuse throughout social, cultural, and economic institutions, the “informational reach of marketing” (Arvidsson 2005, 42), driven by advanced market research techniques, new communication techniques, information distribution channels, and data collection, storage, and mining capabilities has expanded in ways unimaginable even just two decades ago (Poster 1995; Zwick and Dholakia 2004b). If we understand macromarketing as a body of knowledge that aims to establish fair systems of provision of the means of consumption, the question we as macromarketing scholars now confront is whether, and if so, to what extent and how new ICTs help to create markets that facilitate how consumers equipped with highly dissimilar economic, cultural, and intellectual resources can join the world of business in general, and goods and services in particular. As Arvidsson (2005, 43) points out, “[I]nformation provides an interface on which marketing can act.”

Information, however, also provides an interface on which poor consumers, micro entrepreneurs, and disadvantaged communities can act vis-à-vis large and powerful marketing systems, contesting and changing existing ones or establishing new, innovative, and locally more relevant ones (see Donner 2006). Consequently, the sort of large-scale, deep transformations in the development, distribution, and deployment of ICTs we have witnessed

over the last twenty years—including dramatic acceleration over the last five to ten years—have led to a significant extension of the ways macromarketing is able to effect systemic-managerial changes.

While much has been written about marketing, technology, public policy, and consumption—with few exceptions—such works have taken the notions and categories of marketing (and consumption) for granted. Marketing, in other words, is regarded as an *a priori* category onto which new technologies are simply overlaid as they come along. New ICTs are discussed in terms of either the ability of companies to improve production, marketing, and distribution or the capacity of consumers to process information and make decisions. The focus of such analyses is on the exploration of instrumental, strategic, and economic outcomes of inserting new information technology into the marketing process. Under this functionalist micro-perspective of marketing (Zwick and Dholakia 2004b), information technologies are evaluated, analyzed, and discussed almost exclusively in terms of their ability to optimize the effect of the marketing mix, provide a competitive advantage, and support strategic tasks such as segmentation, targeting, and positioning. Macromarketing concerns such as those outlined above rarely figure in any serious conceptual manner.

The instrumentalist-functionalist view of ICTs in marketing is not particularly well suited when—as in macromarketing—the focus is on marketing systems and consumption systems. In our view, then, the dominant discourses in the discipline that have traditionally provided the basis for understanding the relationship between marketing and technology have not been able to reveal the changed conditions of the cultural and technological “production of marketing” as a customer relationship technique (for a critical discussion, see Zwick, Bonsu, and Darmody 2008; Zwick and Dholakia 2004a). In particular, the majority in the marketing academy still holds on to the traditional view that consumers aspire to maximize the consumption of material goods (even as these goods contain more “knowledge” and eventually become a service, as argued by Vargo and Lusch [2004]); and that ICTs merely facilitate this mode of consumption as material accumulation. This view has been suspect for a while now (Firat and Venkatesh 1995; Baudrillard 1981, 1988) and recently has become almost absurd, especially in the affluent world where consumers chase symbols, recognition, information, and what Li and Bernhoff (2008) call psychic income, rather than stuff. More to the point, though, the traditional view of marketing insists that production and consumption are two separate, indeed opposed, facets of the exchange coin. This stance has

only been partly remedied by the recent discussion on the service-dominant logic (e.g., Aitken et al. 2006).

In an era where information has come to dominate value creation, the separation of production and consumption has become blurred. The production of information as value depends increasingly on the manipulation and reproduction of information by consumers. In other words, in the age of informational marketing marketers increasingly provide—for a price—the conditions of production by customers. Therefore, in reconsidering what constitutes marketing, or more generally, valuable market exchanges, this special issue attempts to bring notions on market systems and macromarketing into productive confrontation with analyses of information and communication technologies. From this perspective, a fundamental premise of the collection of articles presented here is that the concepts and practices involved in macromarketing and information technologies are, on the one hand, transforming one another and, on the other hand, represent themselves as active forces of social, cultural, and economic transformation. In other words, ICTs are reshaping the macroscopic meanings, metaphors, and practices of marketing even as they continue to mold and refine the microscopic methods and techniques of managing a firm's customer relationships.

The Macro Perspective

We start from the premise that the impacts of ICTs on markets and consumption are much more pervasive than the issues brought to light as a result of the prevalent focus on instrumental effects of ICTs on marketing strategies and consumer choices. ICTs are altering the very nature of markets, the fabric of consumer culture, and the global contextual fields of human activities. Very little research has looked at the social, cultural, and political innovations that new information technologies have brought to marketing in the macro sense: as a *system of provisioning* mediating between business and society (Applbaum 2004; Slater 1977). Yet, particularly scholars approaching marketing as a discipline concerned with the “delivery of a standard of living,” as White (1981, 11) classically proposes, need to concern themselves with the effects of new ICTs on the ability of the marketing system to improve quality of life, enhance distributive justice, improve the environment, assist in crisis situations of all kinds, and more generally, help ensure the future welfare of the planet and its inhabitants (cf. Fisk 2006).

This special issue of the *Journal of Macromarketing* offers an initial starting point for what hopefully will become a more sustained and broader engagement of the

research and practitioner communities with the macro level impacts of various forms and types of new information and communication technologies. The Internet in particular has the potential to touch on and to generate new avenues for addressing pressing social, environmental, and political challenges. Indeed, George Fisk (2006)—one of the great luminaries of macromarketing scholarship—recently singled out the Internet as a significant development that will affect the future of macromarketing. He states (Fisk 2006, 215), that “Internet market searching by buyers and sellers is transforming transaction routines in high-consumption-level countries and in global markets.”

Fisk is of course right in his assessment but the Internet, as we will see in the articles in this issue, is not just about improving transaction efficiencies for industrial partners or affluent consumers. In its latest incarnation, the Internet provides new forms of socialities and experiences—individual as well as collective ones, at once globally networked and intensely local (e.g., Sassen 2007)—transforming how people, including marketers and consumers, relate to each other, create value, and potentially enhance quality of life for everyone. While the digital divide (van Dijk 2005; Warschauer 2004) remains relevant, the influence and reach of the Internet—as system of worldwide communication flows—nevertheless are becoming global. In less than a decade, billions around the world have emerged from dark ICT hinterlands and are becoming connected through handheld devices of all sorts. From an unabridged chasm, the digital divide is transforming into a terrain of digital differentiation. There are noticeable high peaks of ICT excellence strewn amongst a variegated global infoscape. Indeed, on many dimensions, the mighty United States does not represent the highest peak of technological advance in ICTs when compared to South Korea and some Scandinavian countries. In terms of sheer adoption numbers, China and India—developing nations—have become the largest bases for mobile connectivity. And even the poorest nations, through the processes of technological leapfrogging and appropriate technology adoption (including community oriented—rather than individual oriented—ICT adoption and use), are beginning to open for their citizens at least small electronic windows to the world. So even as the empirical sites of investigation from which authors draw in this issue constitute a “usual suspect” list of companies like Second Life, Facebook, or eBay, the theoretical insights and conceptual contributions made in these essays will soon be (or in many cases already are) as relevant for consumers in India, Brazil, or China as they are for populations in Europe and the United States.

Global and Ubiquitous Infospace

The Internet can do (and be) all this and more because it is ubiquitous—almost everywhere and anywhere—expanding the market, marketing, commerce, and commercial communication into almost every nook and cranny of the globe (Barber 2007). Indeed, the Internet has morphed from a basic communication medium with slow connection speeds and very limited geographic reach into an ethersphere (Gilder 2000), which, fuelled by almost infinite bandwidth, provides consumers, citizens, and businesses with increasingly fast communication formats.

The effects of escalating reach and speed of the Internet cannot be reduced to quantitative changes of performance. The Internet has been transformed in a deeply qualitative sense as consumers (in the age of YouTube, Second Life, iPhones, Wi-Fi, and soon WiMax) embrace it as a complete entertainment solution and as a bedrock element of their lifestyles. Citizens view it as a direct channel to political participation (including through Web sites like moveon.org, votesmart.org, and calvoter.org and the new wave of so-called citizen journalism) (Hague and Loader 1999; Burns 2008). Businesses consider it a universal platform for managing global supply chains and distribution channels, customer and employee relations, and increasingly complex and globally distributed knowledge work such as innovation and new product development (von Hippel 2005; Tapscott and Williams 2006). The Internet has come a long way from the static websites and early text-based, noncommercial communities to a point where it permeates all of communication so deeply that it is almost synonymous with representing all of new ICTs, even communication itself.

Not surprisingly, then, the Internet's central role in shaping global consumer culture and market environments in the twenty-first century is well represented by the scholarly contributions in this special issue. Half the articles deal directly with the transformative logic of this new information and communication medium, albeit taking rather starkly different positions on the medium's promise and its potential effects on relevant macromarketing concerns. Two additional articles at least partially discuss the impact of the Internet. We believe that such a significant representation of things Internet is less a sign of scholars' lack of imagination than clear evidence of the Internet's intense gravitational pull and historical importance. In the final analysis, however, we should point out that none of these articles really is "just" about the Internet. They deal with questions of community, consumer power, insidious and/or empowering marketing practices, and the

effects of new types of communication formats for creating meaningful marketing activities benefiting the disenfranchised and abjectly poor of the world (see also Prahalad 2005). In other words, the articles deal with ongoing changes in market systems and consumption-scapes that ICTs—quintessentially represented by the Internet—are facilitating.

For the purpose of this collection of essays on macromarketing and new ICTs we insisted that authors tackle important questions concerning such technologies not merely from a "technical-capabilities-and-functionality" perspective in the narrow "how-does-this-work" sense. Such analyses are no doubt important and should have their place in the macromarketing scholarship. We wanted the outlook of this special issue to be broader, though, encouraging examinations of new ICTs as they relate to notions of consumer empowerment, exploitation, and possibilities for value co-creation as well as exploring opportunities for marketers and entrepreneurs to deliver relevant products and services to new markets. We aimed at exploring what new forms of knowledge the new ICTs create; what kind of social, cultural, and economic possibilities they open up and for whom; and whether forms of marketing are encouraged that are less about "the global expansion of McWorld" (Barber 2007, 219; Ritzer 2004) and more about delivering enriching and valuable consumer experiences, promoting social justice, foster innovative forms of collaboration among market participants, encourage civic engagement, and increase economic opportunity for the many. In short, this issue explores *macromarketing* concerns of new ICTs.

The Articles

The articles in this special issue on Marketing and Information Technology explore, from a diverse set of intellectual starting point and methods of analysis, how both marketing and ICTs have been transforming each other. From net-archic business models (Bauwens 2005) to the newly defined role of customer participation in the innovation and production of goods and services to marketing as the art of managing autonomous and networked brand communication to massive virtual lifeworlds, the articles presented here discuss the macroscopic transformational momentum of ICTs. Viewed collectively, the articles portray a world where ICTs have come to represent—if not to constitute—the social, the cultural, and the economic, and our conceptions of marketing as a system of provision are beginning to change in ways of which we academics as well as the managers out there are not always entirely aware.

The collection opens with an article by Adam Arvidsson that provides the reader with a firm theoretical foundation from which to read and assess the subsequent articles. Arvidsson has been one of the most original and provocative analysts of contemporary consumer culture (including the online Web 2.0 culture) and his discussion in this issue again delivers a theoretical *tour de force* that should be required reading for anyone interested in the historical and cultural conditions that have given birth to a specific mode of contemporary capitalism premised on the productive collaboration between businesses and consumers enabled by ICTs. Arvidsson's contribution can be broken down into two main discussions. First, he traces the rise of a new form of capitalism that takes as its fundamental resource of surplus value creation the creative and productive capacity of the masses, a resource he variously refers to as social production, General Intellect, or mass intellectuality. He draws on Marx to demonstrate the historical importance of social forms of labor for the development of industrial capitalism. He shows that from its inception, capitalism has relied on productive energies that go beyond the atomistic labor output of each worker and instead include forms of social cooperation, shared competences, and knowledge exchanges between the workers within and without the time and space of work. Because of its collaborative character this form of social production, while crucial for the firm's successful maximization of surplus value, can never be fully controlled by the capitalist. Arvidsson argues, however, that with the global diffusion of ICTs the possibilities for social production that takes place completely outside the walls of the factory (including high-tech knowledge "factories" like Microsoft) and outside the immediate control of corporations, have increased dramatically. Furthermore, these new spaces of autonomous collaboration have become centers for innovation and creativity that firms struggle to reproduce inside their own walls. Arvidsson, hence, identifies a fascinating, and inevitable, dialectic tension haunting contemporary capitalism where firms—while unwilling to becoming community institutions—will come to rely increasingly on communal productive resources that they cannot truly control. In the second part of the article, Arvidsson provides a thorough analysis of this world of social production, introducing in detail the concept of the ethical economy. The fundamental question he asks is this: if participants in social production are not (mainly) motivated by money, what fuels this abundance of creativity and productive energy? In the concluding section, Arvidsson draws out some intriguing implications of the ethical economy for the theory and practice of marketing. From

the perspective of marketing as a system of provision, what is at stake in this ethical economy is the construction of radically new types of collaborations between businesses and consumers where the resources of each participant are mobilized to tackle pressing social and environmental issues of our time, rather than to create the next consumer gadget for the wealthy.

Following Arvidsson's stage setting piece, we have grouped the essays by Kozinets, Hemetsberger, and Schau; Bonsu and Darmody; and Molesworth and Denegri-Knott, which all focus on specific sites and formats of social production. Kozinets, Hemetsberger, and Schau's article in particular represents an almost seamless transition from Arvidsson's meta-level theorization of capitalism's relation to social production to a detailed conceptualization of the various types of creative online consumer collaboration. The authors meticulously excavate the logic of consumer creativity in virtual consumption spaces, drawing on anthropological and sociological theory to identify the conditions of possibility from which such creativity ensues. In particular, Kozinets, Hemetsberger, and Schau argue convincingly that in the age of information the consumption of information becomes inseparable from its production (see also Cohen and Rutsky 2005), agreeing with Arvidsson that the value of these collective and individual processes of production are not adequately conceptualized in purely economic terms but include things like community, a sense of belonging, and social recognition. In the second part of their article, Kozinets, Hemetsberger, and Schau accomplish the rare feat of developing a theoretically rich and managerially useful classification of four types of online creative consumer communities: Crowds, Hives, Mobs, and Swarms. Under each of these headings the authors organize myriad and diverse online consumer behaviors, thereby providing a clear blueprint of the divergent ways in which ICTs organize the interactions of consumers with other consumers, and with marketers. They conclude that, in the age of online communities, collective innovation cannot be reduced to the creative efforts of a few talented and motivated individuals, or even groups of innovative e-tribes, but can also be found in the easily overlooked aggregated byproduct of everyday information consumption. This has significant implications for marketing scholars concerned with the social impact of existing and new marketing systems as well as the consequences of these emerging ICT-aided systems of market provision for cultural and social change. At the beginning of the twenty-first century, ICTs are ushering in important structural changes to the way marketing and market systems function. Kozinets, Hemetsberger, and Schau represent an empirically detailed and conceptually

sophisticated roadmap for macromarketing scholars to follow, interpret, and understand these transformations as they unfold virtually daily before our eyes.

In the next two articles, Bonsu and Darmody and Molesworth and Denegri-Knott investigate two sites of consumer-marketer interaction, co-production, and innovation identified by Arvidsson and Kozinets, Hemetsberger, and Schau, as emblematic of the changing social, cultural, and economic system of the information age. It should be noted that these two sets of co-authors have different theoretical perspectives and draw almost opposite conclusions. Bonsu and Darmody take a closer look at perhaps the most discussed and analyzed representation of virtual worlds existing today, Second Life (SL), questioning if the experiences of social production and creative online collaboration do in fact produce a new, more egalitarian type of market system and give birth to a more empowered and less alienated capitalist consumer subject as suggested by Kozinets, Hemetsberger, and Schau and, to some degree, also by Arvidsson. Bonsu and Darmody see much marketer as well as consumer activity, creativity, and innovation at play in SL and use their observational data effectively to indicate that a space like SL offers its inhabitants empowering experiences not because of the possibility to pursue specific consumption goals but because of the possibility to produce, create, and find social recognition (Arvidsson's ethical economy logic at work here). Bonsu and Darmody, however, are anything but sanguine about this form of consumer empowerment provided by the marketing system in ways previously impossible to imagine. Rather, the authors identify in the freedom of the consumer to co-produce and co-create a technology of entrapment by which marketers generate economic value based on the free work of their customers. Bonsu and Darmody conclude somberly that analyses of ICTs that predict fairer and more just capitalist organizations of work, exchange, and consumption fail to acknowledge in appropriate measure that market power still resides with those who hold the means of production, even if these means are no longer the same as before (in other words, it is not the computer that is the means of production but the platform [or brand] on and with which individuals with computers act). Bonsu and Darmody refuse to see in SL's net-archic business model the revolutionary social formation many pundits and scholars have made it out to be. They propose to analyze creative online collaboration in general and SL in particular more realistically as an interloping of the ethical and capitalist economies. Virtual e-platforms and e-brands seem to open up the interactive market exchange spaces to consumer initiatives, but the value co-creation mostly

ends up as value transfer from mostly uncompensated consumers to the brand-owning marketer.

The article by Molesworth and Denegri-Knott also tackles the cultural and social innovations in exchange relations brought about by networked and virtual marketplaces such as eBay. In this respect, the authors follow closely themes and ideas introduced in preceding articles. The ultimate purpose of this article, however, is different in that the authors contend net-archic business models—true to the logic of the informationalized experience economy—undermine an economy's own noteworthy accomplishment, namely the ability of consumers and marketers to engage in truly playful and personally enriching relationships. So, the authors, unlike Bonsu and Darmody earlier, initially take a much more sanguine stance toward ICTs-empowered market systems and their possibilities for bringing about positive social and cultural transformations. The game metaphor on which Molesworth and Denegri-Knott build their dialectic of the experience economy of virtual marketplaces proves effective in indicating how the same mechanisms that enable new ways of socializing and participating in the public life (building into their argument an effective critique of Barber's [2007] infantilization thesis) bear always already "within" them the potential to undermine these possibilities. Through their analysis, Molesworth and Denegri-Knott find that the social, cultural, and economic benefits of the sort of restless play encouraged by places like eBay—what Zukin (2004, 7) described as "turning our shopping into an entrepreneurial investment"—are elusive because play as a business model is hard to sustain. Rationalization processes, characteristic of modern social and economic life, threaten marketplace-induced play by erasing autotelic consumer motivations and replacing them with extrinsic drivers of market participation. If proceeding unchecked, the result of these rationalization processes, according to Molesworth and Denegri-Knott, is consumer boredom. The authors conclude with an attempt to rescue the notion of play in market exchanges because of their belief in its ultimately revolutionary potential to reconfigure social and economic relations between consumers and producers in the age of information, and eventually to abolish the iron cage of modern consumer culture. Thus, if Bonsu and Darmody see the branded electronic play arenas as persistent conduits for extracting value from consumers, Molesworth and Denegri-Knott see such arenas as constantly under the threat of abandonment by consumers as boredom sets in. The ephemerality of brands and business entities in the age of ICTs may ultimately pave the path to an Arvidsson-style ethical economy and market system where enterprises would finally give up attempts

to “game the system” and enter into earnest collaborations with consumers.

Firat and Vicdan’s article is concerned with quite similar issues, albeit engaging with the topics from a different intellectual position. The authors suggest that the rise of ICTs on a global scale raises questions anew about the desires and possibilities of individuals and communities to determine personal and collective identities, shape cultural transformation, and actively participate in forms of social transformation. The authors present a critical distinction between consumption and use of information technology, emphasizing that modernity’s march toward postmodernity brings about subjectivities that no longer perceive themselves to be in a passive, consumerist relationship with ICTs but in an active, and what could be called “userist” relationship. Cultural theorist Raymond Williams (1980) once made a similar point, suggesting that the emergence of the modern industrial system of production gives birth to a new, fundamental choice: that between man as consumer and man as user. Firat and Vicdan extend the consumerist-to-userist idea into the age of Information Capitalism, re-invoking Williams’s haunting observation, and drawing our attention as much to the empowering as to the detrimental possibilities of the global diffusion of ICTs.

This special issue of *Journal of Macromarketing* concludes with an article by Stump, Gong, and Li. Recall our earlier mention in this introductory piece about the planet-wide diffusion of ICTs, including into the numerically vast but economically poor swaths of the developing world, and especially of the “small electronic windows” to the world. This small electronic window, of course, is that of the mobile phone. This is one ICT that has transcended most limitations of income and infrastructure, and is diffusing in all parts of the planet. Stump, Gong, and Li present an empirical study of the multiple factors that influence mobile-phone diffusion and caution against simplistic use of per capita income in formulating corporate strategies and public policies toward ICTs in the developing world. They point out that the computer-delivered range of sophisticated ICT services of the rich countries would have to adapt to the mobile format to make any headway in the developing world.

Invitation to Enter

ICTs in the contemporary world as well as the collection of articles in this special issue are book-ended by the challenges of the rich and the challenges of the poor. In the affluent markets and consumptionscapes, the intellectual and moral struggle is to grasp the transforming

nature of the market system where information has become the central circulating and sustaining resource. The overview and the fractal views of the ethical economy—the emergent collaborative production-provisioning-consumption system—in this collection provide one of the most insightful one-stop understanding of the changing character of markets in the information age. At the other bookend of this collection, the empirical multicountry and multifactor study reminds us that while ICTs have become pervasive, numerous challenges remain in terms of extending the reach of such technologies and their benefits to consumers in developing nations. We invite you to enter and enrich these discussions.

References

- Aitken, Robert, David Ballantyne, Phil Osborne, and John Williams. 2006. Introduction to the special issue on the service-dominant logic of marketing: Insights from The Otago Forum. *Marketing Theory* 6 (3): 275–80.
- Applbaum, Kalman. 2004. *The marketing era: From professional practice to global provisioning*. New York: Routledge.
- Arvidsson, Adam. 2005. Brands: A critical perspective. *Journal of Consumer Culture* 5 (2): 235–258.
- Barber, Benjamin R. 2007. *Consumed: How markets corrupt children, infantilize adults, and swallow citizens whole*. 1st ed. New York: W.W. Norton & Co.
- Baudrillard, J. 1981. *For a critique of the political economy of the sign*. St. Louis: Telos Press.
- Baudrillard, Jean. 1988. The system of objects. In *Jean Baudrillard: Selected writings*, ed. M. Poster. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.
- Bauwens, M. 2005. The political economy of peer production, CTheory. www.ctheory.net (accessed January 12, 2005).
- Burns, Alex. 2008. Select issues with new media theories of citizen journalism. *M/C Journal* 10 (6). <http://www.journal.media-culture.org.au/0804/10-burns.php> (accessed May 28, 2008).
- Cohen, Sande, and R. L. Rutsky. 2005. *Consumption in an age of information*. Oxford and New York: Berg.
- Donner, Jonathan. 2006. The use of mobile phones by microentrepreneurs in Kigali, Rwanda: Changes to social and business networks. *Information Technologies and International Development* 3 (2): 3–19.
- Firat, Fuat A., and Alladi Venkatesh. 1995. Liberatory postmodernism and the reenchantment of consumption. *Journal of Consumer Research* 22 (December): 239–67.
- Fisk, George. 2006. Envisioning a future for macromarketing. *Journal of Macromarketing* 26 (2): 214–18.
- Gilder, George F. 2000. *Telecosm: How infinite bandwidth will revolutionize our world*. New York: Free Press.
- Hague, Barry N., and Brian Loader. 1999. *Digital democracy: Discourse and decision making in the Information Age*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Knorr Cetina, Karin D., and Alex Preda. 2005. *The sociology of financial markets*. Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press.
- Li, Charlene, and Josh Bernoff. 2008. *Groundswell: Winning in a world transformed by social technologies*. Boston, MA: Harvard Business Press.

- Lyotard, Jean-François. 1984. *The postmodern condition: A report on knowledge*. Trans. G. Bennington and B. Massumi. In *Theory and history of literature*, Vol. 10, ed. W. Godzich and J. Schulte-Sasse. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Poster, M. 1995. Databases as discourse, or electronic interpellations. In *Detraditionalization*, ed. P. Heelas, S. Lash, and P. Morris. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Prahalad, C. K. 2005. *The fortune at the bottom of the pyramid*. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Wharton School.
- Ritzer, G. 2004. *The McDonaldization of society*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Pine Forge Press.
- Sassen, Saskia. 2007. *Deciphering the global: Its scales, spaces and subjects*. New York: Routledge.
- Slater, Charles C., ed. 1977. *Macro-marketing: Distributive processes from a societal perspective*. Boulder, CO: University of Colorado Business Research Division.
- Tapscott, Don, and Anthony D. Williams. 2006. *Wikinomics: How mass collaboration changes everything*. New York: Portfolio.
- Vargo, Stephen L., and Robert F. Lusch. 2004. Evolving to a new dominant logic for marketing. *Journal of Marketing* 68 (January): 1–17.
- van Dijk, Jan A. G. M. 2005. *The deepening divide: Inequality in the information society*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- von Hippel, Eric. 2005. *Democratizing innovation*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.
- Warschauer, Mark. 2004. *Technology and social inclusion: Rethinking the digital divide*. Cambridge, MA: MIT.
- White, Phillip D. 1981. The systems dimension in the definition of macromarketing. *Journal of Macromarketing* 1 (1): 11–13.
- Williams, Raymond. 1980. Advertising: The magic system. In *Problems in materialism and culture: Selected essays*. London: Verso.
- Zukin, Sharon. 2004. *Point of purchase: How shopping changed American culture*. New York: Routledge.
- Zwick, Detlev, Samuel K. Bonsu, and Aron Darmody. 2008. Putting consumers to work: “Co-creation” and new marketing governmentality. *Journal of Consumer Culture* 8 (2): 163–96.
- Zwick, Detlev, and Nikhilesh Dholakia. 2004a. Consumer subjectivity in the age of Internet: The radical concept of marketing control through customer relationship management. *Information and Organization* 14 (3): 211–36.
- . 2004b. Whose identity is it anyway? Consumer representation in the age of database marketing. *Journal of Macromarketing* 24 (1): 31–43.

Detlev Zwick is an associate professor of marketing in the Schulich School of Business at York University. He teaches courses on interactive marketing and marketing of high-technology products. His research focuses on cultural aspects of consumer behavior in electronic, mobile, and high-technology markets. He received his PhD from the University of Rhode Island.

Nikhilesh Dholakia is professor in the marketing, e-commerce, and management information systems areas in the College of Business Administration at the University of Rhode Island. His latest book is *Worldwide E-Commerce and Online Marketing: Watching the Evolution* (Quorum Books, 2002). He is currently working on the book *M-commerce in North America, Europe and Asia-Pacific: Cases and Readings* (Idea Group Publishing, forthcoming).