

## Table of Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>JUDGES AND JUDICIAL DECISION MAKING .....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>2</b>	<b>REVIEW OF QUANTITATIVE RESEARCH ON JUDICIAL DECISION MAKING .....</b>	<b>6</b>
2.1	FIVE MODELS OF JUDICIAL DECISION MAKING.....	7
2.2	MAPPING VOTING PATTERNS OF SUPREME COURT OF CANADA JUSTICES .....	14
2.3	DESCRIBING JUDICIAL DECISION MAKING IN SUPREME COURT OF CANADA .....	22
2.4	EXPLAINING JUDICIAL VOTING PATTERNS OF SUPREME COURT OF CANADA .....	27
2.5	EXPLAINING JUDICIAL DECISION MAKING IN U.S. AND CANADIAN TAX CASES .....	40
2.5.1	<i>Peck on Consistent Patterns in Judicial Decision Making in Supreme Court of Canada Tax Cases.....</i>	<i>41</i>
2.5.2	<i>Altieri and Company on Ideology and Personal Backgrounds in Judicial Decision Making in U.S. Tax Cases.....</i>	<i>41</i>
2.5.3	<i>Ostberg and Wetstein's Recent Attempt in Analyzing Judicial Decision Making in Supreme Court of Canada Tax Cases .....</i>	<i>42</i>
2.5.4	<i>Schneider on the Importance of Personal Backgrounds of Judges in Judicial Decision Making in U.S. Tax Cases.....</i>	<i>44</i>
<b>3</b>	<b>LINKING SOCIO-DEMOGRAPHIC CHARACTERISTICS OF SUPREME COURT OF CANADA JUSTICES TO THEIR DECISIONS.....</b>	<b>53</b>
3.1	AN INITIAL LOOK AT THE DATA AVAILABLE FOR ANALYSIS OF JUDICIAL DECISION MAKING IN SUPREME COURT OF CANADA INCOME TAX CASES .....	56
3.1.1	<i>Case Data.....</i>	<i>59</i>
3.1.2	<i>Vote Data.....</i>	<i>61</i>
3.2	BIVARIATE ANALYSIS OF JUDICIAL DECISION MAKING IN SUPREME COURT OF CANADA INCOME TAX CASES.....	71
3.2.1	<i>Votes Cast by Justices and Prior Taxpayer Wins.....</i>	<i>73</i>

3.2.2	<i>Votes Cast by Justices and When the Votes Were Cast</i> .....	76
3.2.3	<i>Votes Cast by Justices and Political Party of Prime Ministers Who Appointed the Justices</i> .....	78
3.2.4	<i>Votes Cast by Justices and Where Justices Built Their Careers</i> .....	83
3.2.5	<i>Votes Cast by Justices and Their Prior Judicial Experience</i> .....	87
3.2.6	<i>Votes Cast by Justices and Their Law Teaching Experience</i> .....	90
3.2.7	<i>Votes Cast by Justices and Their Experience in Founding Their Own Law Firms</i> ....	93
3.2.8	<i>Votes Cast by Justices and Their International Education</i> .....	95
3.2.9	<i>Summary of Findings of Bivariate Analysis</i> .....	98
3.3	MULTIVARIATE ANALYSIS OF JUDICIAL DECISION MAKING IN SUPREME COURT OF CANADA	
	INCOME TAX CASES .....	99
3.3.1	<i>Full Model: Influences of Socio-demographic Characteristics of Supreme Court of Canada Justices on Decision Making in Income Tax Cases</i> .....	104
3.3.1.1	<i>Prior Taxpayer Win and Judicial Decision Making in Supreme Court of Canada Income Tax Cases</i> .....	107
3.3.1.2	<i>Post-Charter Era and Judicial Decision Making in Supreme Court of Canada Income Tax Cases</i> .....	108
3.3.1.3	<i>Political Ties and Judicial Decision Making in Supreme Court of Canada Income Tax Cases</i> .....	110
3.3.1.4	<i>Regional Ties and Judicial Decision Making in Supreme Court of Canada Income Tax Cases</i> .....	113
3.3.1.5	<i>Judicial Experience and Judicial Decision Making in Supreme Court of Canada Income Tax Cases</i> .....	115
3.3.1.6	<i>Law Teaching Experience and Judicial Decision Making in Supreme Court of Canada Income Tax Cases</i> .....	116
3.3.1.7	<i>Entrepreneurial Experience and Judicial Decision Making in Supreme Court of Canada Income Tax Cases</i> .....	118

3.3.1.8	<i>International Education and Judicial Decision Making in Supreme Court of Canada Income Tax Cases</i> .....	119
3.3.1.9	<i>Summary of the Outcomes of the Full Model</i> .....	122
3.3.2	<i>Reduced Model: How Important Was Each of the Decision-Influencing Variables?</i> .....	123
3.3.3	<i>Voting Scenarios of Supreme Court of Canada Justices in Income Tax Cases Based on the Full Model and Reduced Model</i> .....	127
3.3.3.1	<i>Voting Scenarios of Composite Supreme Court of Canada Justices</i> .....	129
3.3.3.2	<i>Voting Scenarios of Current Supreme Court of Canada Justices</i> .....	139
3.3.4	<i>An Interim Report of the Exploratory Data Analysis of Judicial Decision Making in Canadian Income Tax Cases</i> .....	143
<b>4</b>	<b>LINKING SOCIO-DEMOGRAPHIC CHARACTERISTICS OF TAX COURT OF CANADA JUDGES TO THEIR DECISIONS</b> .....	<b>145</b>
4.1	AN INITIAL LOOK AT THE DATA AVAILABLE FOR ANALYSIS OF JUDICIAL DECISION MAKING IN TAX COURT OF CANADA INCOME TAX CASES .....	148
4.1.1	<i>Votes Cast by Tax Court of Canada Judges</i> .....	149
4.1.1.1	<i>Votes Cast by Tax Court of Judges Per Year</i> .....	150
4.1.1.2	<i>Votes Cast by Individual Tax Court of Canada Judges</i> .....	151
4.1.2	<i>Socio-demographic Characteristics of Tax Court of Canada Judges</i> .....	153
4.2	EXPLORATORY DATA ANALYSIS OF JUDICIAL DECISION MAKING OF TAX COURT OF CANADA INCOME TAX CASES .....	155
4.2.1	<i>Political Ties</i> .....	156
4.2.2	<i>Regional Ties</i> .....	158
4.2.3	<i>Prior Judicial Experience</i> .....	160
4.2.4	<i>Prior Law Teaching Experience</i> .....	162
4.2.5	<i>Entrepreneurial Experience</i> .....	164
4.2.6	<i>International Education</i> .....	166

4.2.7	<i>Gender</i> .....	168
4.2.8	<i>Social Networking</i> .....	170
4.2.9	<i>Tenure</i> .....	172
4.2.10	<i>Government Law Practice</i> .....	174
4.2.11	<i>Years in Government Law Practice</i> .....	176
4.2.12	<i>Private Law Practice</i> .....	178
4.2.13	<i>Years in Private Law Practice</i> .....	180
4.2.14	<i>Interpretation of Multinomial Logistic Regression Results</i> .....	182
4.3	SIMULATED VOTING PATTERNS OF CURRENT TAX COURT OF CANADA JUDGES.....	185
<b>5</b>	<b>REFLECTING ON QUANTITATIVE ANALYSIS OF JUDICIAL DECISION MAKING IN CANADA</b> .....	<b>191</b>
5.1	REFLECTIONS ON SOCIO-DEMOGRAPHIC CHARACTERISTICS OF SUPREME COURT OF CANADA JUDGES AND THEIR DECISION MAKING.....	193
5.2	REFLECTIONS ON SOCIO-DEMOGRAPHIC CHARACTERISTICS OF TAX COURT OF CANADA JUDGES AND THEIR DECISION MAKING.....	195
5.3	LIMITATIONS OF QUANTITATIVE DATA ANALYSIS OF JUDICIAL DECISION MAKING.....	196
5.4	A MIXED APPROACH IN EMPIRICAL RESEARCH ON JUDICIAL DECISION MAKING.....	201
<b>APPENDIX I:</b>	<b>PROBIT REGRESSION ANALYSIS OF JUDICIAL DECISION MAKING OF SUPREME COURT OF CANADA INCOME TAX CASES</b> .....	<b>211</b>
<b>APPENDIX II:</b>	<b>MULTINOMIAL LOGISTIC REGRESSION ANALYSIS OF TAX COURT OF CANADA INCOME TAX CASES</b> .....	<b>212</b>
<b>APPENDIX III:</b>	<b>SOCIO-DEMOGRAPHIC CHARACTERISTICS OF 25 CURRENT TAX COURT OF CANADA JUDGES, 2007</b> .....	<b>213</b>
<b>BIBLIOGRAPHY</b>	.....	<b>215</b>

## List of Figures

<i>FIGURE 1:</i>	<i>NUMBER OF INCOME TAX CASES DECIDED BY SUPREME COURT OF CANADA BY YEAR, 1920-2003</i>	60
<i>FIGURE 2:</i>	<i>VOTING RECORDS OF 57 SUPREME COURT OF CANADA JUSTICES IN INCOME TAX CASES, 1920-2003</i>	62
<i>FIGURE 2A:</i>	<i>TOP TEN AND BOTTOM TEN JUSTICES RANKED BY NUMBER OF VOTES CAST IN ALL INCOME TAX CASES IN THE STUDY PERIOD</i>	64
<i>FIGURE 2B:</i>	<i>TOP TEN AND BOTTOM TEN JUSTICES RANKED BY VOTING PERCENTAGES FOR TAXPAYERS IN INCOME TAX CASES IN THE STUDY PERIOD</i>	65
<i>FIGURE 2C:</i>	<i>TOP TEN AND BOTTOM TEN JUSTICES RANKED BY NUMBER OF VOTES CAST IN UNANIMOUS INCOME TAX CASES IN THE STUDY PERIOD</i>	66
<i>FIGURE 2D:</i>	<i>TOP TEN AND BOTTOM TEN JUSTICES RANKED BY VOTING PERCENTAGES FOR TAXPAYERS IN UNANIMOUS INCOME TAX CASES IN THE STUDY PERIOD</i>	67
<i>FIGURE 2E:</i>	<i>TOP TEN AND BOTTOM TEN JUSTICES RANKED BY NUMBER OF VOTES CAST IN NONUNANIMOUS INCOME TAX CASES IN THE STUDY PERIOD</i>	68
<i>FIGURE 2F:</i>	<i>TOP TEN AND BOTTOM TEN JUSTICES RANKED BY VOTING PERCENTAGES FOR TAXPAYERS IN NONUNANIMOUS CASES IN THE STUDY PERIOD</i>	69
<i>FIGURE 3:</i>	<i>VOTING RECORDS OF JUSTICES IN CASES WITH AND WITHOUT PRIOR TAXPAYER WIN</i>	74
<i>FIGURE 4:</i>	<i>VOTING RECORDS OF JUSTICES IN PRE-CHARTER AND POST-CHARTER YEARS</i>	77
<i>FIGURE 5:</i>	<i>VOTING RECORDS OF JUSTICES APPOINTED BY TWO GROUPS OF PRIME MINISTERS</i>	80
<i>FIGURE 6:</i>	<i>VOTES IN UNANIMOUS CASES OF JUSTICES BY PRIME MINISTERS WHO APPOINTED THEM</i>	82
<i>FIGURE 7:</i>	<i>VOTES IN NONUNANIMOUS CASES OF JUSTICES BY PRIME MINISTERS WHO APPOINTED THEM</i>	82
<i>FIGURE 8:</i>	<i>VOTING RECORDS OF JUSTICES WITH AND WITHOUT TIES TO QUEBEC</i>	84
<i>FIGURE 9:</i>	<i>VOTING RECORDS OF JUSTICES WITH DIFFERENT REGIONAL TIES</i>	86
<i>FIGURE 10:</i>	<i>VOTING RECORDS OF JUSTICES WITH AND WITHOUT PRIOR JUDICIAL EXPERIENCE</i>	87
<i>FIGURE 11:</i>	<i>VOTING RECORDS OF JUSTICES DIVIDED BY TYPES OF PRIOR JUDICIAL EXPERIENCE</i>	89
<i>FIGURE 12:</i>	<i>VOTING RECORDS OF JUSTICES WITH AND WITHOUT LAW TEACHING EXPERIENCE</i>	91
<i>FIGURE 13:</i>	<i>VOTING RECORDS OF JUSTICES DIVIDED BY TYPES OF LAW TEACHING EXPERIENCE</i>	92
<i>FIGURE 14:</i>	<i>VOTING RECORDS OF ENTREPRENEURIAL JUSTICES AND OTHERS</i>	94
<i>FIGURE 15:</i>	<i>VOTING RECORDS OF JUSTICES WITH AND WITHOUT INTERNATIONAL EDUCATION</i>	96
<i>FIGURE 16:</i>	<i>VOTING RECORDS OF JUSTICES DIVIDED BY LOCALES OF EDUCATION</i>	97
<i>FIGURE 17:</i>	<i>SUMMARY OF FINDINGS OF THE BIVARIATE ANALYSIS</i>	98
<i>FIGURE 18:</i>	<i>FULL PROBIT MODEL OF INFLUENCES OF JUDICIAL DECISION MAKING IN INCOME TAX CASES</i>	105
<i>FIGURE 19:</i>	<i>SUMMARY OF FINDINGS OF THE PROBIT REGRESSION ANALYSIS</i>	122
<i>FIGURE 20:</i>	<i>IMPORTANCE OF EXPLANATORY VARIABLES</i>	124

FIGURE 21: VOTING SCENARIO I .....	130
FIGURE 22: VOTING SCENARIO II.....	130
FIGURE 23: VOTING SCENARIO III .....	133
FIGURE 24: VOTING SCENARIO IV.....	133
FIGURE 25: VOTING SCENARIO V.....	135
FIGURE 26: VOTING SCENARIO VI.....	135
FIGURE 27: VOTING SCENARIO VII .....	137
FIGURE 28: VOTING SCENARIO VIII.....	137
FIGURE 29: SOCIO-DEMOGRAPHIC CHARACTERISTICS OF CURRENT SUPREME COURT OF CANADA JUSTICES .....	140
FIGURE 30: PROPENSITY TO VOTE FOR TAXPAYERS OF CURRENT SUPREME COURT OF CANADA JUSTICES ...	141
FIGURE 31: VOTES CAST BY TAX COURT OF CANADA JUDGES, 1983-2004.....	150
FIGURE 32: VOTES CAST BY EACH OF THE 34 TAX COURT OF CANADA JUDGES, 1983-2004.....	152
FIGURE 33: SOCIO-DEMOGRAPHIC CHARACTERISTICS OF TAX COURT OF CANADA JUDGES, 1983-2004..... .....	154
FIGURE 34: VOTING PERCENTAGES OF TAX COURT OF CANADA JUDGES AND POLITICAL TIES, 1983-2004..	157
FIGURE 35: VOTING PERCENTAGES OF TAX COURT OF CANADA JUDGES AND REGIONAL TIES, 1983-2004..	159
FIGURE 36: VOTING PERCENTAGES OF TAX COURT OF CANADA JUDGES AND PRIOR JUDICIAL EXPERIENCE, 1983-2004 .....	161
FIGURE 37: VOTING PERCENTAGES OF TAX COURT OF CANADA JUDGES AND LAW TEACHING EXPERIENCE, 1983-2004 .....	163
FIGURE 38: VOTING PERCENTAGES OF TAX COURT OF CANADA JUDGES AND ENTREPRENEURIAL EXPERIENCE, 1983-2004 .....	165
FIGURE 39: VOTING PERCENTAGES OF TAX COURT OF CANADA JUDGES AND EDUCATION, 1983-2004 .....	167
FIGURE 40: VOTING PERCENTAGES OF TAX COURT OF CANADA JUDGES BY GENDER.....	169
FIGURE 41: VOTING PERCENTAGES OF TAX COURT OF CANADA JUDGES AND SOCIAL NETWORKING, 1983-2004 .....	171
FIGURE 42: VOTING RECORDS OF JUDGES AND TENURE, 1983-2004.....	173
FIGURE 43: VOTING PERCENTAGES OF TAX COURT OF CANADA JUDGES AND GOVERNMENT LAW PRACTICE, 1983-2004 .....	175
FIGURE 44: VOTING RECORDS OF TAX COURT OF CANADA JUDGES AND YEARS IN GOVERNMENT LAW PRACTICE, 1983-2004.....	177
FIGURE 45: VOTING PERCENTAGES OF TAX COURT OF CANADA JUDGES AND PRIVATE LAW PRACTICE.....	179
FIGURE 46: VOTING RECORDS OF TAX COURT OF CANADA JUDGES AND YEARS IN PRIVATE LAW PRACTICE.	181
FIGURE 47: SIMULATED VOTING PERCENTAGES OF CURRENT TAX COURT OF CANADA JUDGES IN 2007 .....	186

*FIGURE 48: SIMULATED VOTING PERCENTAGES FOR TAXPAYERS, 2007* ..... 187

*FIGURE 49: SIMULATED VOTING PERCENTAGES AGAINST TAXPAYERS, 2007*..... 188

*FIGURE 50: SIMULATED PERCENTAGES OF VOTING PARTIALLY FOR AND PARTIALLY AGAINST TAXPAYERS, 2007*  
..... 189