Faculty of Environmental and Urban Change York University UNDERGRADUATE COURSE SYLLABUS

Course: EUC 4310. 3.0/EUC 5070.3.0 Extraction and its Discontents: A Social History and Political Economy

Term: Winter 2024

Calendar Description

This course examines current political, economic and social debates concerning extractive industry, placing these in the context of longer histories of global imperialism and colonialism. Following a review of conceptual approaches to natural resource `extraction`, the course will examine contemporary global regulation and resistance to it, focusing upon the state, the corporation, the resource, the affected community, and the (global) social movement as units of analysis.

Required readings will be available through the York University Library. **An eclass site** will be employed for uploading assignments and to which electronically available readings will be linked. Undergraduate and graduate commentaries will be visible. Students should also pay attention to current information concerning extractive industries, including media coverage of pipelines, tar sands and debates on Canadian global mining activities. See, for instance regular reporting from miningwatch.ca among others as well as business and civil society materials available via newspaper websites.

Prerequisite(s)

Fourth year standing or by permission of the instructor. Students with Third year standing may have access subject to space availability and approval from the Faculty.

Course Director

Dr. L. Anders Sandberg

Office/course consultation hours: Wednesday, 11.30 – 1230, Room: HNE 267

You can also request a Zoom meeting at:

https://yorku.zoom.us/j/98498819335?pwd=Rk9DRIY1MG9OWkNSQ2xFMXR2aDhSUT09

Teaching Assistant

Laura Tanguay, PhD Candidate

Email: ltanguay@yorku.ca

Office/course consultation hours: Thursday, 10-11 at:

https://yorku.zoom.us/j/95034976909

Course Management

Please note that this course will be offered in person. We will meet for the first class on January 11th. This is a seminar course and thus attendance is expected during regular hours. If you are unable to attend on a specific due to connection issues, please let the instructor as soon as possible

Time and Location

Wednesdays 8.30-11:20 am in person in McLaughlin College 112

Purpose and Objectives of the Course

Conceptually, this course defines 'extraction' broadly, to include forms of direct resource harvesting from land/nature that alter the socio-ecological metabolism of that context. The course will assist students to:

- 1. Consider how earth matter is defined as minerals and as objects of extraction and how this may obscure or erase other ways of seeing such matter.
- 2. Define extraction through a socio-ecological lens that considers the ways in which natural resources have been harnessed for the purposes of economic growth and accumulation.
- 3. Gain an understanding of key historical approaches to resource extraction, with particular relation to Indigeneity, imperialism and colonialism.
- 4. Place existing literatures in the context of debates on the construction of race, sex and class hierarchies in the extractive enclave.
- 5. Contextualize theoretical material through an examination of the global and domestic resource extraction and the socio-ecological abuses with which it is associated.
- 6. Consider similarities and variations between varying sorts of resource extraction, including mining, particularly sand and stone (aggregates) and "new minerals" extraction and production and their relationship to contemporary 'land grabbing'.
- 7. Consider the infrastructural dimensions of the mining of aggregates and their relationship to contemporary economic structures, socio-ecological crises, and global capital regulation.
- 8. Identify the various kinds of knowledges produced on extraction and extractive industry and the sociology and politics undergirding schools of thought and communities of knowledge creation (including Corporate Social Responsibility, sustainable mining, critique of industry, human and environmental rights discourse).
- 9. Allow students to place theoretical and empirical cases in the context of their own particular area of interest.

Organization of the Course

The course will be delivered through in-person lectures and seminar discussions. Assigned readings will be posted to e-class. On certain dates external speakers will join the class via zoom. Students are expected to read or view all assigned materials in advance of the class in question and to arrive at class prepared to engage in a lively discussion.

Evaluation

100 word case description	5 % (Ja 31st)
Take home mid-term	25% (Fe 14th)
Essay proposal	10% (Mar 6 th)
Final Essay	25% (Ap 10 th)
Presentation on case	15% (Mar 27 th or Ap 3 th)
Participation	20% (Ap 5 th)

PLEASE NOTE: Final course grades may be adjusted to conform to Program or Faculty grades distribution profiles.

- 1. Each student's case will be selected in first month of class with a 100 word description of the case uploaded to eclass by Friday January 31st worth 5%. You can select to do this as a group project with other students, and possibly in conjunction with a community organization. You can modify this as the course proceeds, and this would ultimately contribute to shaping your final essay. Two or more sources should be cited, at least one of which should be a scholarly publication (book, book chapter or journal article); the other may be from media, or an NGO or trade/business source. A topic pertaining to the case will be the subject of your final essay.
- 2. Write a take home mid-term exam. The exam will consist of two essay questions which will ask you to elaborate your understanding of the course material to date. The questions will be distributed in class on February 7th and will be due the Wednesday before reading week, February 14th.
- 3. Prepare a proposal for the Final Essay or alternative format project. **The proposal is due on Wednesday March 6th** on Eclass, 500 words maximum. The proposal must cite 3 course readings and should lay out a thesis statement and key sub-sections for the paper/project. It should also show original library research related to your topic (i.e. from scholarly journals and books).
- 4. **The Final Essay is due on Wednesday April 10th;** essay is 2000 words maximum (or equivalent in alternate format), on a topic related to your case. It must cite at least 3 course readings with reflection.
- 5. **Participate actively** in class discussions (including online eclass). A high grade in this area will be based on frequent and active contributions in seminar, spoken or online, offering comments and questions based on knowledge of the required readings, constructively engaging with fellow students. Attendance is expected at all classes. See the final page of the syllabus for further guidance.
- 6. Provide a presentation on the case you have selected on March 27 or April 3, if you wish as a group project- linking the case to the course materials. The presentation should follow the Pecha Kucha format. This entails using 20 powerpoint slides and using 20 seconds to speak to each one of them. This makes for 6 minutes and 40 seconds presentations. A successful Pecha Kucha presentation puts emphasis on photos, images and illustrations and there should be very little text on your slides. The presentation should be organized, informative and engaging. Employ a clear structure i.e. "In this presentation I (we) will provide information on the x, advancing the following 3 key points." Then do so.

Lateness Penalty

Assignments received later than the due date will be penalized 5% of the value of the assignment *per day* that the assignments are late. For example, if an assignment worth 20% of the total course grade is a day late, 1 point out of 20 (or 5% per day) will be deducted. Exceptions to the lateness penalty for valid reasons such as illness, compassionate grounds, etc. will be entertained by the Course Director.

Missed Tests

Students with a documented reason for missing a course test, such as illness, compassionate grounds, etc., may request accommodation from the Course Instructor. When you contact the Course Instructor, state accommodation arrangement (e.g., allowed to write a make-up test on a certain date). Further extensions or accommodation will require students to submit a formal petition to the Faculty.

Case Selection

The intention of this assignment is to allow you to think through the course material via a particular theme of interest, which will also assist in identifying the final essay topic early in the term. For those already engaged with extraction and environmental justice issues, students may wish to select particular examples or regulatory initiatives from sites and thematic areas of interest or ongoing research. For those who are relatively new to the subject matter, check the websites of organizations such as, Mining Watch, the Polaris Institute, Oil Watch, Indigenous Environmental Network, SOMO Netherlands, London Mining Network, as well as business sources

like infomine for possibilities. Examples of cases include: one of the current pipeline projects in North America, a particular refinery or processing plant under debate, a mining project or type of extractive industry in a particular region or country, a specific voluntary (or binding) code of conduct for extractive industry, questions of racism and sexism in particular industrial structures or in the discourse of those who critique industry, consumption of a particular mineral in various products (including in 'transition' energy systems) an activity or industry less represented in the readings for this week (for instance export processing, genetic mining, organ trading etc – selecting perhaps a particular example as per the aforementioned suggestions, a current legal case underway in Canada or internationally). For Tar Sands and pipelines related cases and legal suits see Yellowhead Institute, Pembina Institute, Polaris Institute, Defenders of the Land, Indigenous Climate Action, Indigenous Environmental Network, Parkland Institute, Sierra Club, Greenpeace, Environmental Defence among others. For other legal cases see law firm Klippenstein's and the International Human Rights Clinic at Harvard among others. Many authors we read in the course have published extensively on subjects related to extraction. Those with specific interests in material related to the scholarship or activism of specific authors are advised to look up their other publications.

Course Schedule and Readings

Class topic,	Readings
Week 1	What is meant by the terms extraction and discontents? What is meant by the
January 10	terms political economy/ecology/geology? How may they help us understand extraction and its discontents? How do we acknowledge the land in the context of "extraction and its discontents"?
Introducing and Defining Extraction, Discontents, Course Organization, and Land Acknowledgement	Recommended readings: Mining Watch et al (2020). "Voices from the Ground: How the Global Mining Industry is Profiting from the COVID 19 Pandemic" at https://miningwatch.ca/sites/default/files/covid-19 and mining - snapshot report.pdf Moore, J. (2017). Who is Responsible for the Climate Crisis? In Maize What is Capitalocene at https://www.maize.io/magazine/what-is-capitalocene/
	POEM AND FILM: Project Shift, Poetry by Pablo Neruda (Standard Oil) https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=rFc-afPmrso
Week 2 January 17	On Soils, Stones, Symbols and Earth Matter. What constitutes earth matter? How have minerals come to be defined as minerals? What other conceptions of earth matter and minerals exist? How have minerals come to be seen more as natural resources rather than life-forces? What is gained and lost when minerals are reduced to natural resources? Do minerals and earth matter have agency? Do minerals and earth matter listen and speak?
	Tacon, P. (2013). Ochre, Clay, Stone and Art: The Symbolic Importance of Minerals as Life-Force Among Aboriginal Peoples of Northern and Central Australia, pp. 31-42.

Boivin, N. (2013). From Veneration to Exploitation: Human Engagement with the Mineral World, pp. 1-29. In *Soils, Stones and Symbols: Cultural Perceptions of the Mineral World*, edited by Nicole Boivin and Mary Ann Owoc. London: Routledge.

Saunders, N. (2013)., pp. 123-141. In *Soils, Stones and Symbols: Cultural Perceptions of the Mineral World*, edited by Nicole Boivin and Mary Ann Owoc. London: Routledge. The chapter offers "a brief overview of the role of geology and geography in a worldview that [is] a fusion of what in Western understanding are indissolubly separate spheres of natural phenomena and cultural activity. What emerges ... is a view of a cultural world composed of complex and nuanced ideas concerning the nature and role of various kinds of minerals and landforms that challenge simplified Western conceptions of nature/culture distinctions" (124).

Video: The Legend of the Sacred Mountain, Ancient Native American Wisdom. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ifiEP8sGQts

Video: Minerals for Kids – Classification and Uses - Science https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=xbkEITV7sok

Recommended Reading

Boivin, Nicole and Mary Ann Owoc, eds., *Soils, Stones and Symbols: Cultural Perceptions of the Mineral World*. London: Routledge. This book illustrates "the complex ways in which the materiality of minerals links together monuments, rock art, technologies and landscapes into a unified story that contradicts traditional archaeological [and geological] categorisations of the material world"(3).

Week 3

Sacred Traditions: The Case of the Red Pipestone Quarry

January 24

How do Indigenous people conceive of earth matter? What is their relationship with the earth? How is it similar and different from the way in which settlers and mining companies view minerals? What lessons can we learn from the history of the Red Pipestone Quarry? What is there to despair, regret, and celebrate about this place?

Grant, D.M. (2017). Writing "Wakan": The Lakota Pipe as Rhetorical Object, *College Composition and Communication*, 69(1), 61-86.

Corbett, William (1978). "The Red Pipestone Quarry: The Yanktons Defend a Sacred Tradition," South Dakota History, 8, 2, 99-116.

Film: Pipestone: An Unbroken Legacy. 22.55 minutes. https://www.nps.gov/pipe/learn/photosmultimedia/pipestone-an-unbroken-legacy.htm

Recommended reading:

Creese, J. (2016). "Making Pipes and Social Persons at the Keffer Site: A Life History Approach," pp. 27-49. In E.A. Bollwerk and S. Tushingham, editors, *Perspectives on*

	the Archaeology of Pipes, Tobacco and other Smoke Plants in the Ancient Americas. Switzerland: Springer International.
	Roth, S. (2015). Argillite, faux-argillite and black plastic: The political economy of simulating a quintessential Haida substance, <i>Journal of Material Culture</i> , 20, 3, 299-312
	Sandberg, L. Anders, "The Ties that Bind: The Wendat Ancestral Present in the Toronto Region," Unpublished paper, 2024.
Week 4	Historical and Critical Perspectives on the Science of Geology. What is and what are
	the origins of the concept of the mining cycle and its various phases? How do the
January 31	properties of different earth matters influence the mining cycle?
	Zeller, Susan (2000). The Colonial World as Geological Metaphor: Strate(gems) of Empire in Victorian Canada. <i>Osiris</i> , 15, 85-107.
	Bobbette, A., Gamble, R., Lee, C-T, and Wilson, C. (2021). Decolonizing Geology: A Discussion, <i>GeoHumanities</i> , 7 2, 647-655.
	Akong, C. (2020). Reframing Matter: Towards a material-discursive framework for Africa's minerals. <i>The Extractive Industries and Society</i> , 7, 461-469.
	Kuyek, Joan (2019). <i>Unearthing Justice: How to Protect Your Community from the Mining Industry</i> (Toronto: Between the Lines), chapter 2, The Mining Sequence.
	Recommended readings/viewings:
	Bobbette, A. and Donovan, A., editors (2019). <i>Political Geology: Active Stratigraphies and the Making of Life</i> . Cham, Switzerland: Palgrave Macmillan.
	Braun, Bruce (2000). Producing Vertical Territory: Geology and Governmentality in Late Victorian Canada, <i>Ecumene</i> , 7, 1, 7-46.
	VIDEO: Video Artist Amie Siegel in conversation with Beatrice Galilee. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=TznEK4df2Fc
	inclps.//www.youtube.com/watchrv=12HER4GIZFC
	Amie Siegel: Quarry. Quarry https://www.sfu.ca/galleries/audain-gallery/past1/amiesiegel-quarry.html
Week 5	Indigenous People and the Extractive Industry: Compatible or Incompatible? Friends or Foes? Faustian Bargain or Necessary Compromise? Assimilationist or Integrative?
February 7	End or Means to End?

Simpson, Michael (2019). "Resource Desiring Machines: The Production of Settler Colonial Space, Violence, and the Making of a Resource in the Athabasca Tar Sands," *Political Geography*, 74, 102044.

Kuyek, Joan (2019). *Unearthing Justice: How to Protect Your Community from the Mining Industry* (Toronto: Between the Lines), chapter 4, Mining and Colonialism on Turtle Island.

Guardians of Eternity. 45 minutes. Sheebafilms. http://www.toxiclegacies.com/project/the-guardians-of-eternity-film/ What is perpetual care? What shape should it take?

Recommended readings:

Cayh, E. (2021) The Aesthetics of Extractivism: Violence, Ecology, and Sensibility in Turkey's Kurdistan, *Antipode*, 53, 5, 1377-1399.

Huber, Matthew (2022). Theorizing the subterranean mode of production, *Political Geography*, 94 (Complete), 1-3. Introduction to special issue on "Earth Politics: Territory and the Subterranean.

Keeling, A. and Sandlos, J. editors (2015). *Mining and Communities in Northern Canada: History, Politics, and Memory*. Calgary: University of Calgary Press. Chapters to be determined. This is an Open Access E-book. https://library.oapen.org/handle/20.500.12657/57489

Neale, T. and Vincent, E. (2017). Mining, indigeneity, alterity: or, mining Indigenous alterity? *Cultural Studies*, 31, 2-3, 417-439

Pasternak, S., Collis, S, and Dafnos, T. (2013). Criminalization at Tyendinaga: Securing Canada's Colonial Property Regime through Specific Land Claims," *Canadian Journal of Law and Society*, 28, 1, 65-81.

Sandlos, John, Arn Keeling, Caitlynn Beckett, and Rosanna Nicol. "There is a Monster Under the Ground: Commemorating the History of Arsenic Contamination at Giant Mine as a Warning to Future Generations" *Papers in Canadian History and Environment*, no. 3 (October 2019): 1-55. DOI: dx.doi.org/10.25071/10315/36516

Week 6

Grey Extractivism: The Case of the Aggregate Industry, the State, and Discontents

February 14

- 1. Why is aggregates extraction considered to be an important (integral) part of the global capitalist economy?
- 2. Companies in the aggregates industry often emphasize their efforts to reduce carbon emissions during the production of aggregates products, and to restore/rehabilitate land once a quarry is abandoned. Why is this described as "environmental rhetoric"? What would need to be included for a fuller picture of environmental impact?

- 3. What is the 'spatial fix' described in the Sandberg and Wallace paper, and what is it 'fixing'?4. The authors discuss examples of aggregate extraction in India, Southern
- 4. The authors discuss examples of aggregate extraction in India, Southern Ontario, and Northern Scotland. Although they do not explain it directly in these terms, their analysis reveals the contradictory tendencies of spatial differentiation and equalization that Neil Smith identified as inherent in capitalism. How are these tendencies manifest in the aggregates industry?

Sandberg, L.A. and L. Wallace (2013). Leave the Sand in the Land, Let the Stone Alone: Pits, Quarries and Climate Change, *ACME: An International E-Journal for Critical Geographies*, 12 (1), 65-87.

Beiser, V. 2019) There is a global sand crisis and no one is talking about it. TEDx talk. https://www.ted.com/talks/vince-beiser_there-s-a-global-sand_crisis_and_no_o-ne-is-talking-about-it

"sand is just one aspect, one element of the much larger problem with over consumption. If we are running out of that, we really need to think about how we are using everything."

Vince Beiser

Recommended readings:

Vince Beiser, The World in a Grain (2018).

Leffers, D., Wekerle, G. and Sandberg, L.A. (2021). Competing Claims in Land-Use Policy: Property Development and Mineral Aggregates Industries, *Journal of Environmental Planning and Management*

Virtual Launch Event, Reform Gravel Mining Coalition (2022). Reform Gravel Mining Coalition. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=r57kOUqlf g

Mira Quarry, Government Silence, and a Community Destroyed. Why? How? (2019) https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=uCikE81WkAM

As I See It: Proposed Mira Quarry Expansion Outside Fredericton, Earthquakes, and Who Decides. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Lm1c52-8ozE

Sandberg, L. Anders (2014). "Environmental Gentrification in a Post-Industrial Landscape: The Case of the Limhamn Quarry, Malmö, Sweden," *Local Environment: The International Journal of Justice and Sustainability,* 19, 10, pp. 1068-1085. Different Concepts of Mineral Resources and the Subterranean Modes of Production

February 21 Reading Break Week 7 Grey Extractivism and its Impact on Black Bodies February 28 El-Hadi, Nehal 2022. Poetics, Politics, and Paradoxes of Sand.

Black materialism is the effect of matter on black people and black geographies black materialist approach takes into consideration how the materiality of sand at its extraction, distribution, and uses specifically affect people of African descer (29.35) "I ask that we consider sand as a repository both of feeling and of experience, of affect and of history, in the Caribbean region. Here sand links us unswervingly to place, to a particular landscape that bears traces of both connection and loss. I imagine it to be "saturated" with the presence of people who have walked on and carried it, but simultaneously "empty" of the archaeological and forensic traces th would testify to that presence. If water is the romantic metaphor that has irredeemably made its place in Caribbean and African diasporic studies, sand is the less embraced referent that returns us to the body's messy realities. Water washe
affect and of history, in the Caribbean region. Here sand links us unswervingly to place, to a particular landscape that bears traces of both connection and loss. I imagine it to be "saturated" with the presence of people who have walked on and carried it, but simultaneously "empty" of the archaeological and forensic traces th would testify to that presence. If water is the romantic metaphor that has irredeemably made its place in Caribbean and African diasporic studies, sand is the
makes clean. Sand gets inside our bodies, our things, in ways at once inconvenient and intrusive. It smoothes rough edges but also irritates, sticking to our bodies' folds and fissures." Vanessa Agard-Jones (2012), What the Sands Remember
Chen, Eve (2022). Sun, Sand and Civil Rights: Uncovering Black History at the Beach and Beyond, <i>USA Today</i> , January 31. https://ca.movies.yahoo.com/movies/sunsand-civil-rights-uncovering-100216695.html
Nesbitt, F. (2021). Black Sand is the California surf crew for justice on the water. <i>United States of i-D</i> , May 20. https://i-d.vice.com/en/article/epnn4j/black-sand-california-surfing-collective-racism
Week 8 The Rise of Green Extractivism: The Case of the Lithium Industry, the State, and Discontents
March 6 Going Green with Lithium Has Environmentalists Torn https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VzrNgJg-25s
Gravitas Plus: The dark side of Electric Vehicles https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RFHvq-8np10
Riofrancos, T. (2022). The Security-Sustainability Nexus: Lithium Onshoring in the Global North, Global Environmental Politics, forthcoming.
Voskoboynik, D. and Andreucci, D. (2022). Greening Extractivism: Environmental discourses and resource governance in the "Lithium Triangle,'" Nature and Space, 2, 787-809.
Week 9 Green Extractivism in Canada: Mining the Peatlands in the Hudson Bay Lowlands: The Case of the Ring of Fire. Guest Lecture by Laura Tanguay.
March 13

	Scott, Dayna Nadine, "Impact Assessment in the Ring of Fire: Contested Authorities, Competing Visions and a Clash of Legal Orders" (2023). Commissioned Reports, Studies and Public Policy Documents. Paper 229. https://digitalcommons.osgoode.yorku.ca/reports/229 Gwich'in Council (2018). "Emerging Practices of Indigenous-led Review (found here) Wildlife Conservation Society of Canada (2022). CoP15 Event: From Peatlands to the Ocean, A Global Opportunity for Canada. December 11. https://www.wcscanada.org/Latest-News/ID/18432/CoP15-Event-From-Peatlands-to-the-Ocean-a-Global-Opportunity-in-Canada.aspx Recommended Readings Dayna Nadine Scott, Jennifer Sankey & Laura Tanguay (eds.) Operationalizing Indigenous-led Impact Assessment, https://operationalizingindigenous-ledimpactassessments.com (2023). https://operationalizingindigenous-ledimpactassessments.com/reports Graham, Cameron (2022). Featuring Professor Dayna Scott, Podcast or Perish (found here). For a transcript, see https://www.podcastorperish.ca/episodes/episode-036-dayna-scott
Week 10	Green Extractivism around the World: Select Case Studies
	Dragojlo, S. (2022). 'It's [Not] Over': The Past, and Present, of Lithium Mining in Serbia, <i>BalkanInsight</i> , April 13. https://balkaninsight.com/2022/04/13/its-not-over-the-past-and-present-of-lithium-mining-in-serbia/ Soto Hernandez, D. and Newell, P. (2022). Oro Blanco: Assembling Extractivism in the Lithium Triangle, <i>The Journal of Peasant Studies</i> , 49, 5, 945-968.
	Stepanovic, I. (2022). The True Cost of Technology: Double Extractivism and Green Criminology in Serbia, <i>Journal of Criminology and Crime</i> , 60, 25.
	Chiminology in Schola, Southar of Chiminology and Chime, 60, 25.
	Presentations on case
Week 11	
Week 11 March 27	Presentations on case Due in e-class on this date
Week 11 March 27 Week 12	Presentations on case

Required Readings

All required readings will be posted to e-class.

Supplementary Reading

Students without previous courses related to international development and globalization are encouraged to consult Philip McMichael's *Development and Social Change: A Global Perspective*; or P. McMichael and H. Weber's *Development and Social Change: A Global Perspective* as important background reading for the course. Journals that cover material related to course themes include the following:

Annual Review of Environment and Resources

Antipode

Arctic

Canadian Journal of Development Studies

Capital and Class

Capitalism, Nature, Socialism

Comparative Studies in Society and History

Cultural Anthropology

Development and Change

Development in Practice

Development Policy Review

Economy and Society

Economic Geography

Environment and Planning - Society and Space

Extractive Industries and Society

Geoforum

Global Environmental Change

Global Environmental Politics

Historical Materialism

IDS Bulletin

International Journal of Feminist Politics

International Journal of Urban and Regional Research

Journal of Development

Journal of Developing Areas

Journal of Sustainable Development

Monthly Review

New Political Economy

Organization and Society

Political Geography

Politics and Society

Progress in Development Studies

Progress in Human Geography

Public Culture

Review of International Political Economy

RECIEL

Studies in Comparative International Development

Studies in Political Economy

Sustainable Development

Third World Quarterly

World Development

Numerous journals in Area and Country Studies, History, Natural Resource law among others.

Further guidance regarding the participation grade.

18-20 marks	 participates frequently with obvious signs of digesting the readings makes contributions of a high quality (are well conceived and presented, insightful, or beneficial to the group) and are offered in a timely way offers new ideas and responds to others' ideas in a positive manner
16-17	 offers consistently relevant contributions related to the readings offers new ideas and responds to others' ideas in a positive manner makes information available to others in a timely way.
14-15	offers relevant contributions related to the readingsoffers some new ideas and responds to others' ideascontributes information and does so in a timely way
12-13	 makes some relevant contributions occasionally offers ideas and responds to others' ideas. contributes some information to group and does so on time
10-11	 contributions are inconsistent doesn't offer new ideas and responds to others' ideas only when asked to do so. contributes information only after it has been requested OR is monopolizing discussion without listening to others' contributions
8-9	 provides passive or reluctant interaction with others offers little participation does not understand content is contributing little information and rarely on time
7 and under	 ignores responses of others and is disagreeable when participating participates little in discussions contributes information only when insisted upon. doesn't contribute information on time