

Enhancing the Role of Municipalities Against Racism and Discrimination

Lorne Foster
York University

In partnership with:
Canadian Race Relations Foundation
Ontario Human Rights Commission
**York University Centre for Public
Policy and Law**



Ontario
Human Rights Commission
Commission ontarienne des
droits de la personne



INVENTORY OF TOOLS FOR EVALUATING MUNICIPAL POLICIES AIMED AT FIGHTING RACISM AND DISCRIMINATION.....	4
Introduction	4
The Ten Commitments.....	7
CASE STUDIES.....	12
Overview of the Top Ten Cities	12
The City of Toronto	12
The City of Montreal	17
The City of Vancouver	23
The City of Saskatoon	26
The City of Thunder Bay.....	32
The City of Stockholm.....	37
The City of Boston	42
The City of Calgary	46
The City of Prince George	49
The City of Hamilton	53
United Kingdom.....	56
A. Statement of Commitment or Vision	56
B. Process for Developing Actions for a 3-year Plan	57
C. UK Examples	59
PRACTICE EXAMPLES	69
Commitment # 1: Increase vigilance against systemic and individual racism and discrimination.....	69
Commitment #2: Monitor racism and discrimination in the community more broadly as well as municipal actions taken to address racism and discrimination.....	72
Tewkesbury, Gloucestershire, UK ⁴	73
Lewisham, London, UK ⁶	74
Richmond upon Thames, London, UK.....	74
Commitment #3: Inform and support individuals who experience racism and discrimination.....	76
Commitment #4: Support policing services in their efforts to be exemplary institutions in combating racism and discrimination.	79
Commitment #5: Provide equal opportunities as a municipal employer, service provider and contractor.....	82
Commitment #6: Support measures to promote equity in the labour market.	86
Commitment #7: Support measures to challenge racism and discrimination and promote diversity and equal opportunity in housing.....	91
Commitment #8: Involve citizens by giving them a voice in anti-racism initiatives and decision-making	94
Commitment #9: Support measures to challenge racism and discrimination and promote diversity and equal opportunity in the education sector and in other forms of learning.....	100

Commitment #10: Promote respect, understanding and appreciation of cultural diversity and the inclusion of Aboriginal and racialized communities into the cultural fabric of the municipality. 105

INVENTORY OF TOOLS FOR EVALUATING MUNICIPAL POLICIES AIMED AT FIGHTING RACISM AND DISCRIMINATION

York University Report presented to

THE ONTARIO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION
AND
THE CANADIAN RACE RELATIONS FOUNDATION

CO-SPONSORS OF ROUNDTABLE DISCUSSION ON
“ENHANCING THE ROLE OF MUNICIPALITIES AGAINST RACISM”¹

*Cities are the main focus of ethnic and cultural mixing. They are an ideal place to develop policies, and implement concrete strategies and actions to eliminate racism. By eliminating racism and multiple forms of discrimination, cities are able to build inclusive and respectful societies where everyone has an equal opportunity to participate in the economic, social, cultural, recreational, and political life of the city.*²

Introduction

In the 21st century, one of the most urgent issues affecting international stability and social progress is the claims for recognition by diverse racial and ethnic groups (United Nations Human Development Report, 2004). Today, there are more than 5000 different ethno-racial groups and sub-groups living in 295 countries. In two countries out of three, there is at least one substantial minority group, representing 10% of the population or more. In 150 of 189 nation states there are at least four different ethnoracial groups within their borders. At the same time, there are over a billion people around the world who face some aggravated form of discrimination because of their minority status and identity.

In times of growing globalization and urbanization cities have an important role to play in managing global ethnocultural diversity, and in accommodating people's growing demands for their inclusion in society. Municipal Governments, in partnership with other orders of government and local and national groups, have

¹ The research for this report was compiled by York researcher Dr. Lorne Foster, with research assistance from Barbara Van Tassel, and Shanna-Kay Morgan, in conjunction with Ashley Lukach, Mercy Uwabor and Alfred Fung of the Ontario Human Rights Commission (OHRC).

² Canadian Commission for UNESCO. (2006:2). Call for a Coalition of Municipalities against Racism and Discrimination.

a pivotal role to play in combating racism and creating welcoming and inclusive communities, as they function at the most practical level, and are the most closely involved in the lives of their citizens.³

While primary control of public policy lies with central governments, cities and metropolises do have a certain degree of autonomy in their decision making, and in the methods of intervention and support and solidarity networks that they set up; they have clearly sensed a need to develop their own policies in this way.⁴ Accordingly, the last few years have seen true efforts to conceptualize interventions by cities to manage ethnocultural diversity. These efforts rely on ideologies controlled by the state and on the values of equality, social justice, and respect for pluralism that are endorsed by different international organizations such as the UN and UNESCO, or by national organizations such as human rights commissions. They are also encouraged by the increased involvement of cities in questions relating to minority integration as a consequence of decentralisation and of crises or critical incidents that may arise in urban environments, as well as by the dynamics of municipal policy and internal political relationships.⁵

One of the most significant challenges and significant opportunities experienced in contemporary liberal democracies is coming to grips with issues of social cohesion and questions related to the integration of ethnically and culturally diverse populations that increasingly expect to enjoy the benefits of citizenship on their own terms. Dealing with racism and discrimination may not be of high priority for municipalities, as they cope with a rising workload and limited resources. However, it is an issue, which should not be ignored in Canada, especially at a time when an influx of immigrants and temporary workers is being called for to address labour shortages. The ability of diverse populations to contribute to Canada's economic and social development is a key factor in Canada's prosperity and competitiveness.

The Canadian Commission for UNESCO (CCU) for a Coalition of Municipalities Against Racism and Discrimination (CMARD), is part of the International Coalition of Cities against Racism, launched by the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) in 2004, which shares the goal to help broaden and strengthen our society's ability to protect and promote human rights through coordination and shared responsibility among local governments, civil society organizations and other democratic institutions.

³ Alberta Urban Municipalities Association (2006). Welcoming & Inclusive: Communities Toolkit. Retrieved from http://www.auma.ca/live/digitalAssets/25/25953_WICT_booklet_10232008.pdf.

⁴ Ray, B. (October, 2003). "The Role of Cities in Immigrant Integration." Migration Policy Institute.

⁵ Labelle, M. A., Legault G. (1996). Strategies and discourse on ethnic relations, racism and diversity management within the municipalities of Greater Montreal. General issues of research, University of Quebec at Montreal, Department of Sociology, Les Cahiers du CRIEC, No. 21., p.71.

UNESCO hopes to establish a network of municipalities, in Africa, Latin America and the Caribbean region, North America, Asia-Pacific and Europe, which are interested in sharing experiences in order to improve their policies to fight racism, discrimination and xenophobia.

The CCU, in partnership with a group of Canadian municipalities and Non-governmental Organizations, developed a draft set of Ten Commitments and a Sample Plan of Action Against Racism and Discrimination, modeled after the European Coalition, but adapted to the Canadian context. CCU has identified three categories of commitments.

- The Municipality as a Guardian of the Public Interest
- The Municipality as an Organization in the Fulfillment of Human Rights
- The Municipality as a Community Sharing Responsibility for Respecting and Promoting Human Rights and Diversity

The Ten Commitments⁶

The CCMARD Commitments, listed by category, are as follows:

The Municipality as a Guardian of the Public Interest

1. Increase vigilance against systemic and individual racism and discrimination.

Sample actions:

- Support or establish, in collaboration with community organizations, a monitoring and rapid response system or network to identify and respond to acts of racism, hate crimes and incidents, including bringing such incidents to the attention of the appropriate authorities.
- Support or establish a mechanism for consultation with a network of groups and individuals involved in the struggle against racism and discrimination (e.g. NGOs, Aboriginal organizations, youth, artists, police services, the judiciary, provincial and territorial human rights commissions, etc.).
- Report regularly on the incidence of hate crimes and responsive actions taken.

2. Monitor racism and discrimination in the community more broadly as well as municipal actions taken to address racism and discrimination.

Sample actions:

- Make use of existing data and research, or initiate or facilitate appropriate collection and use of data, on incidents of hate activities, racism and discrimination in the community, and share results in a manner that advances human rights.
- Collect and evaluate data and information on racism and discrimination in specific fields of municipal endeavour, such as housing, recreation, culture and other social programs.
- Define achievable objectives and apply common indicators in order to assess incidents and trends in racism and discrimination, such as racial profiling, as well as the impact of municipal policies and programs.

⁶ Canadian Commission for UNESCO. (2005). *RoadMap: A Call for a Canadian Coalition of Cities Against Racism*. Retrieved from <http://www.yhrc.yk.ca/pdfs/booklet-eng.pdf>.

3. Inform and support individuals who experience racism and discrimination.

Sample actions:

- Use awareness materials and campaigns to inform citizens about their rights and obligations, including available resources and mechanisms for prevention and redress, as well as penalties for racist acts or behaviour and other forms of discrimination.
- Establish or enhance existing complaint mechanisms within the municipality's authority (ombudsperson, anti-discrimination unit, etc.) to deal with allegations of systemic and individual acts of racism and discrimination.
- Establish protocols to liaise with organizations such as human rights commissions, legal clinics, and community advocacy or counseling services that can help facilitate prevention, interventions, and remedies for those who experience racism and discrimination.

4. Support policing services in their efforts to be exemplary institutions in combating racism and discrimination.

Sample actions:

- Consult with local communities to hear concerns and receive input on responsive measures.
- Establish or enhance a comprehensive anti-racism and antidiscrimination vision statement and implement effective policies and procedures (including a complaints mechanism), as well as staff training to help prevent and respond to issues of racism and discrimination in policing services and in the community.
- Implement measures or programs to promote accountability of, and public confidence in, policing services, as well as ensure appropriate representation of Aboriginal and racialized groups in recruitment and at all levels of the organization.

The Municipality as an Organization in the Fulfillment of Human Rights

5. Provide equal opportunities as a municipal employer, service provider and contractor.

Sample actions:

- Develop, implement, promote and enforce anti-racism and anti-discrimination strategies, policies and procedures, including complaints and dispute resolution mechanisms, within the municipal organization.
- Examine equity at a systemic level, such as auditing different aspects of the municipality's operations, including corporate planning, policy and program development, and procedures and practices with respect to

employment, service delivery and contracting, as well as organizational culture; take steps to eliminate barriers; and finally, measure progress.

- Educate and sensitize elected officials and civil servants on mutual respect, citizenship and the obligation to protect and promote human rights.

6. Support measures to promote equity in the labour market.

Sample actions:

- In partnership with local chambers of commerce, set up a certification program for businesses, organizations, and professional bodies to integrate mechanisms into their own organizations for combating racism and building inclusive and respectful workplaces.
- Facilitate monitoring and removal of systemic barriers that impede fair and equitable access for full participation of Aboriginal and racialized communities in the economic life of the municipality, as well as access to professions and trades for foreign trained professionals.
- Make business licensing renewals conditional upon nondiscriminatory policies and practices.

7. Support measures to challenge racism and discrimination and promote diversity and equal opportunity in housing.

Sample actions:

- Examine housing and urban planning policies and practices and address systemic barriers that have a discriminatory effect on Aboriginal and racialized communities, including the further marginalization of those who are homeless or at risk of homelessness.
- Work with landlords and social housing providers, with the assistance of tenant associations and community organizations, including legal clinics, to adopt equitable policies and practices with respect to qualifying applicants and selecting tenants for market rent units consistent with human rights principles.
- Work with homebuilder, realtor, rental, hotel, tourist and hospitality associations to draw up anti-discrimination codes of practice for their respective industry businesses and organizations.

The Municipality as a Community Sharing Responsibility for Respecting and Promoting Human Rights and Diversity

8. Involve citizens by giving them a voice in anti-racism initiatives and decision-making.

Sample actions:

- Take steps to facilitate and increase the representation of Aboriginal and racialized communities on municipal boards, commissions and committees.
- Organize regular community forums in collaboration with existing organizations and mechanisms in order to offer citizens an opportunity to discuss and be heard on issues of racism and discrimination in the municipality, including effectiveness of local policies and programs.
- Empower local NGOs and civil society to share information and take action against racism and discrimination.

9. Support measures to challenge racism and discrimination and promote diversity and equal opportunity in the education sector and in other forms of learning.

Sample actions:

- Encourage the development of teaching materials that promote respect for dignity, human rights, intercultural understanding, dialogue and peaceful coexistence.
- Support partnerships between educators and front-line community organizations to reach out to vulnerable youth whose access to education is adversely affected by bullying and violence or discriminatory discipline policies or practices.
- Create a program to recognize schools for their anti-racism and anti-discrimination initiatives.

10. Promote respect, understanding and appreciation of cultural diversity and the inclusion of Aboriginal and racialized communities into the cultural fabric of the municipality.

Sample actions:

- Provide equitable support to cultural projects, programs, events and infrastructure so that the cultural diversity and heritage of the community can be preserved and diffused in a fair and representative way.
- Support initiatives that increase expertise and capacity within ethno-cultural organizations to effect change in their communities and enable their members to participate fully in society.
- Promote awareness of the fact that integration of a community's cultural fabric, together with its economic, educational, social and security interests, strengthens and benefits the whole community.

The Canadian Commission for UNESCO describes cities as an ideal place to develop policies, and implement concrete strategies and actions to eliminate racism. By eliminating racism and multiple forms of discrimination, cities are able to build inclusive and respectful societies where everyone has an equal opportunity to participate in the economic, social, cultural, recreational, and political life of the city.⁷

The CCU is inviting municipalities from across Canada to join a Canadian Coalition of Municipalities Against Racism and Discrimination (CCMARD) and be part of a larger international coalition being promoted by UNESCO. The Ontario Human Rights Commission (OHRC) and The Canadian Race Relations Foundation (CRRF) have agreed to supporting the CCMARD by working with member municipalities, community partners and the Canadian Commission for UNESCO to strengthen and develop the coalition.

This inventory to follow, draws from prior reports by the Centre for Research on Immigration, Ethnicity and Citizenship (CRIEC), and the Alberta Urban Municipalities Association (AUMA), 2006, which have identify indicators and developed toolkits for evaluating Municipal policies aimed at fighting racism and discrimination. Like the prior reports upon which it is based, it is designed to assist large and small municipalities wishing to take action to reduce racism and discrimination and build welcoming and inclusive communities by:

- Provide an introduction to taking action to build inclusion and reduce racism and discrimination;
- Identifies “good practice” key ingredients to promote inclusion and equity and reduce racism and discrimination;
- Describes ways that municipal governments can develop and implementations to promote inclusion and equity and reduce racism and discrimination;
- Provides examples of strategies, approaches, action plans, and policies that have been developed by other municipalities within and outside of Canada. These are presented to offer ideas for what is possible, as well as providing a guide and templates for local action.⁸

Below are key areas within the three categories outlined by the Canadian Coalition of Municipalities Against Racism and Discrimination: **Municipality as Organization, Municipality as Community, and Municipality as Guardian of Public Interest.**

⁷ Canadian Commission for UNESCO. (2005). *RoadMap: A Call for a Canadian Coalition of Cities Against Racism*. Retrieved from <http://www.yhrc.yk.ca/pdfs/booklet-eng.pdf>.

⁸ Adapted from AUMA (2006).

CASE STUDIES

This section provides an overview of how select urban areas have supported community-directed antiracist organizational change. It also examines the implications of these initiatives in regard to the creation of an international platform of exchange and solidarity against racism and discrimination, by drawing attention to promising practices developed in urban centres in Europe, the United States and across Canada.

Overview of the Top Ten Cities

The Case Studies which follow are for the cities of Toronto Montreal, Vancouver, Saskatoon, Stockholm, Boston, Calgary Prince George and Hamilton. These case studies are intended to provide readers with examples and points of depart to begin discussing a framework for anti-racism and racism prevention initiatives, as they relate to the Common Commitments that Canadian municipalities will undertake in the coming years. The purpose of these case studies is to provide references to policies, programs and activities that may be beneficial to the Canadian municipal community context.

The City of Toronto⁹

1.1. The context

Toronto has about two and a half million inhabitants and is one of the most multiethnic cities in the world. Nearly half of the city's residents were born outside of Canada. Racial groups (defined in the Canadian context as "visible minorities") currently make up over half of the population. They went from 3% in 1961 to 30% in 1991 and to 53% in 2001. Toronto is the principal destination for immigrants and refugees who arrive in Canada (approximately 75,000 annually). Toronto also has more Aboriginals than in any other Canadian city or reservation.

Throughout the years, the City of Toronto has adopted a series of measures in response to the challenges raised by the increasing diversity of its population: a diversity advocate was nominated on the City Council, consultative committees and working groups were established, a policy to eliminate hate activities was adopted, a policy of employment equity was adopted, a program of accessibility and equity in funding was maintained, various awareness and educational campaigns regarding all types of intolerance were supported, stances regarding

⁹ Centre of Research on Immigration Ethnicity and Citizenship. (February 2005). *Indicators for evaluating municipal policies aimed at fighting racism and discrimination*. University of Montreal: Centre for Research on Immigration, Ethnicity and Citizenship. The study took the Ten Point Action Plan, which was adopted in December 2004 by the Coalition of Cities Against Racism as its reference point in evaluating of municipal performance.

propositions to amend Immigration Law were clarified, and many other measures.

In 1998, the six municipalities of the urban community of Toronto joined together to form the new city of Toronto which adopted the motto: *Diversity our Strength*. On March 4, 1998 the new City Council established a Task Force on access and equity. Following broad consultations and various studies, the Task Force presented a report in July 1999 entitled *Diversity Our Strength, Access and Equity Our Goal; Framework and Roadmap to Embrace the City's Diversity*, which made 89 recommendations. The City Council approved the report in December 1999. Eleven recommendations were modified and eight were added. The acceptance of the report and its 97 recommendations marked the end of the Task Force's activities.

The report was structured according to the following guiding principles:

- Strengthening civil society: allocation of resources to community organisations and establishment of seven advisory committees.
- Civic leadership: advocating to the private sector and other levels of government, and shaping public opinion
- Equitable, accessible and accountable governance: diversification of municipal workforce, diversification in the allocation of contracts and subsidies
- Aboriginal self-determination.¹⁰

In December 2001, the City adopted a Social Development Strategy with five underlying principles: equity, equality, access, participation and cohesion; and three major strategic directions: strengthening communities, investing in a comprehensive social infrastructure, and strengthening municipal leadership and partnerships.

Following a request made by the Advisory Committee on Ethnic and Race Relations for a report on the status of preparations for the *United Nations World Conference Against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance* in Durban, the City Council decided to develop a *Plan of Action for the Elimination of Racism and Discrimination* in April 2001. The Council primarily based its work on a study of "ethno racial" inequalities that it had previously commissioned. This study revealed in particular that:

- For "ethno-racial" minorities, a certain level of education did not guarantee stable employment or a higher salary;
- The unemployment rate of individuals with non-European ancestry was nearly twice that of individuals with European ancestry;
- The poverty level of families with non-European ancestry was nearly twice that of families with European ancestry.¹¹

¹⁰ City of Toronto (1999).

¹¹ Ornstein (2000).

Other studies also revealed direct and systemic racism and discrimination, and notably highlighted racial stereotypes in the media, hate crimes and systemic racism in the criminal justice system. The City Council decided to adopt a holistic approach and included racism and all forms of discrimination. It set up a Reference Group that involved all City advisory boards and working groups affected by these questions. This Reference Group invited residents, organisations and community groups to give their opinions on the Plan of Action. Over one thousand people participated in the consultations. The report of the consultations was submitted in November 2002¹² and the Plan of Action was adopted in April 2003.

1.2. Municipal policies to fight discrimination and concrete measures to combat racism

The *Plan of Action* adopted in 2003 consisted of eight points:

1. Applying the 97 recommendations of the final report of the Task Force on access and equity.
2. Continuing measures that strive to build a city administration capable of responding to the diversity of its residents: employment equity, reasonable accommodation of religious diversity, educational programs, etc.
3. Taking into account demographic changes in the population (publishing an annual report on diversity, establishing indicators to track the socio-economic status of groups, carrying out specific studies, holding biannual seminars on the most successful practices).
4. Encouraging stronger economic participation from minority groups through partnerships with aboriginal community organisations, greater dialogue with other relevant authorities and levels of government, mentoring programs and a greater effort to work with ethnic businesses.
5. Offering better support to organisations that support minority groups in order to help them build strong communities.
6. Educating the public.
7. Advocating activities (adequate financing of affordable housing, childcare services, programmes regarding entry into the job market, teaching official languages, improving literacy, recognizing equivalence of diplomas and work experience, participation in the electoral process, education, etc.)
8. Follow-up on the application of the Plan of Action¹³.

¹² City of Toronto. (2002). *Just Do It: Report of the Community Consultations on the Plan of Action for the Elimination of Racism and Discrimination*.

¹³ City of Toronto (2003).

1.3. Tools to evaluate such policies and their indicators

We will now consider the follow-up measures retained in both action plans. For access and equity, these measures are explained under the heading “Monitoring and Evaluation,” which includes the following recommendations:

- That City staff modify the report template for all City reports to include a statement on the impact on access, equity and human rights;
- That the City administration prepare comprehensive demographic profiles of all wards to guide policy development, program planning and services;
- That in order to guarantee an external view on progress made in the areas of access, equity and human rights, the City will organize an annual consultation on these issues, the results of which will be taken into account in the planning and development of future policies and programs;
- That each department, agency, board or *ad hoc* body submit an Access, Equity and Human Rights Plan of Action to the City Council.
- That each department evaluate its policies, programs and services in order to identify barriers encountered by designated groups, and that measurement tools be developed for this purpose;
- That City Council request that all groups answering to it provide an annual report on how they implemented measures to increase employment equity, equality, access and human rights;
- That the annual employment equity report to City Council on the status of designated groups include data on its workforce as a whole and by departments regarding representation, occupations, promotions, compensation, training, benefits, departures and opportunities;
- That the City produce an annual consolidated report of access and equity measures in a report card format.¹⁴

Under the heading “Implementation and Follow-up” the following is recommended:

- That each term the City Auditor oversee an internal assessment of the performance of the administration in achieving its goals relating to access, equity and human rights;
- That the City’s Chief Administrative Officer provide a status report on the implementation of recommendations, twelve months after approval of the report by City Council.¹⁵

As far as the Plan of Action for the Elimination of Racism and Discrimination is concerned, the follow-up on its implementation is carried out by the City Council Reference Group that meets each trimester for this purpose. Internally, the

¹⁴ City of Toronto. (1999). The City of Toronto is currently developing guidelines for this report card, which would cover seven areas.

¹⁵ Ibid.

interdepartmental access and equity team coordinates the implementation of the Plan of Action.

The City of Montreal¹⁶

During the last three decades, the government of Quebec has equipped itself with several legal, political and consultative measures to assert its national identity and acknowledge the diversity of the Quebecois people. These include the francization of public space with The Charter of the French Language (Law 101) and the implementation of a legal framework to fight discrimination, promote equality and guarantee cultural rights (joining international conventions and pacts on human rights, the Quebec Charter of Human Rights and Freedoms in 1975, the Declaration on Ethnic and Race Relations, etc.). These measures have been completed by programs of employment equity, intercultural training and adaptation of public services, by reasonable measures of compromise, and by the commitment to international solidarity.

The Quebec government's Plan of Action for 1991-1994 recommended that the entire governmental system implement specific measures to develop consultations with Quebecois municipality unions and groupings, in order to encourage administrations and municipal services to adapt. Having public institutions and municipalities adapt to diversity has been a leitmotiv of public discourse since the 1980s.

2.1. The Context

Montreal has a unique position in North America, situated at the intersection of French speaking and English-speaking cultures. As the principal economic force in Quebec, Montreal attracts the great majority of immigrants who arrive in the province. Approximately one quarter of the city's population was born outside of Canada and so called "visible minorities" make up a proportional part of the population.¹⁷

Since the mid-1980s, the City of Montreal has increasingly taken into account this diversity through measures that include creating the *Montreal Intercultural Office* in 1998, adopting an *Access and Employment Equity for Minorities Program*, adopting a *Montreal Declaration Against Racial Discrimination* (1989), developing communication strategies through ethnic media, implementing economic development and housing measures, creating an Inter-services Committee and a Consultative Committee on Intercultural Relations, launching *Black History Month* in February 1992, and holding the *Year of Intercultural and Interracial Harmony* in 1993.

¹⁶ Centre of Research on Immigration Ethnicity and Citizenship. (February 2005). *Indicators for evaluating municipal policies aimed at fighting racism and discrimination*. University of Montreal: Centre for Research on Immigration, Ethnicity and Citizenship. The study took the Ten Point Action Plan, which was adopted in December 2004 by the Coalition of Cities Against Racism as its reference point in evaluating of municipal performance.

¹⁷ Statistics Canada, 2001 census.

The City of Montreal's ethnocultural diversity management principles are grounded in the *Montreal Declaration Against Racial Discrimination* adopted by City Council in 1989.¹⁸ The administration's preferred model for intervention and management is based on the social interculturalism approach, which aims to "respect the expression and the influence of every culture and deliberately seek reciprocity among all cultures. The concept of interculturalism seeks to foster encounters among all cultures, using French as the favoured language for communication and exchange."¹⁹ This model also recognizes the "pluralistic nature of values in our society, our city and their institutions." Another principle concerns "the equity and equality of all citizens". In accordance with this principle, the City strives to improve access to services and to adapt them to the needs of members of different cultural communities, thereby encouraging active participation in municipal life and avoiding marginalisation.²⁰ Finally, another principle concerns "recognizing the role of community organisations as privileged partners of municipal action."²¹ Partnerships and consultations with public, parapublic and private institutions are also favoured.

Subsequent years have also seen numerous developments in Montreal's municipal action.

A distinction must be made between the City of Montreal, the Island of Montreal, and the Greater Montreal Region (Island of Montreal, North- and South-Shore). Until 2002, the municipalities of the Island of Montreal were grouped together in the Urban Community of Montreal (CUM), which was primarily responsible for public transportation and police services. Diversity was a concern for the CUM, however, awareness about diversity varied greatly among the Island's different municipalities.

On January 1, 2002, the 28 municipalities of the Island of Montreal merged and a new city with 1.8 million inhabitants was born, having grown from 9 boroughs to 27. In February 2002, the new mayor announced that the *Montreal Summit* would be held as "the first step in a move to implant a true participatory democracy in this new unified city."²² The following four-step process was to be followed in order to do so:

- Holding borough-level and sector-based summits;
- Integrating the propositions made during the borough-level and sector-based summits;
- Integrating priorities of action into a strategic plan during the actual Summit;

¹⁸ Montreal (1994), p.18.

¹⁹ Ibid.

²⁰ Ibid.

²¹ Ibid.

²² City of Montreal (2002a).

- Achieving this plan; this will be assigned to working groups responsible for setting up the essential conditions for achieving these orientations (idem).

During the *Montreal Summit* which was held in June 2002, the work on equity, accessibility and diversity was based on the following proposition: “In order for the development of a city to equally benefit all inhabitants, public decisions must be made in accordance with the diverse characteristics of its population. Equality and accessibility are principles that must be applied to the organisation of the new city and its boroughs from the very start.”²³

These were the major orientations of this workshop:

- To adopt a transversal approach based on human rights
- To understand each problematic using an approach that differentiates between genders
- To recognize the richness that ethnocultural diversity represents and ensure that this reality is reflected when determining issues and strategies
- To fight discrimination and foster harmonious intercultural relations based on respect and understanding
- To take into consideration the problems and the human resources that are unique to certain social groups, such as young people, elderly people, handicapped people, “visible minorities”, gays and lesbians, and to strive for inclusion and social cohesion
- To guarantee true citizen participation in all decision making, and notably among the most underprivileged.²⁴

A plan was submitted in September 2002. In the spring of 2003, the *Montreal Intercultural Council* was set up.

However, the City was otherwise preoccupied. The election of a new government in Quebec, one that was not in favour of the process of municipal mergers, created an unstable climate that delayed the implementation of certain policies. Following a referendum held on June 20, 2004, 15 former cities chose to separate. Even though 90% of the inhabitants of the Island of Montreal chose to remain part of the new city, the referendum result had revealed a linguistic and social divide between the wealthy and the poor, whereas social justice was precisely one of the goals of the Island of Montreal unification project. Other problems also delayed the implementation of the orientations adopted at the *Montreal Summit*, notably the question of the boroughs’ true autonomy and the fact that the various issues had such unequal influence.

²³ City of Montreal. (2002). Sommet de Montréal. Retrieved from <http://www2.ville.montreal.qc.ca/ldvdm/jsp/sommet/index.htm>.

²⁴ Ibid.

2.2. Municipal policies to fight discrimination and concrete measures to combat racism

On March 21, 2002, the new City of Montreal declared March 21st as the *International Day for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination*.

An ombudsman's position was created on September 10, 2002 and on December 10, 2003, the City presented a proposal for the *Montreal Charter of Rights and Responsibilities*, a direct result of work done on democracy during the *Montreal Summit*. This draft of the Montreal Charter designated the ombudsman as being responsible for its application, thereby placing the Montreal Charter in a different category than other municipal instruments relating to human rights, even internationally.

In particular, the proposal for the *Montreal Charter of Rights and Responsibilities* sets out that Montreal, in a joint effort with all of its citizens, must pay close attention to the quality of its democratic, economic, social and cultural life, to the environment and sustainable development, to the security of its citizens and to the quality of the municipal services it offers.

On March 22, 2004, the City presented the *Montreal Declaration on Cultural Diversity and Inclusion* which was to replace the *Montreal Declaration against Racial Discrimination* of March 21, 1989. In this Declaration, the City agrees:

- To instate employment access and equity programs as a way of welcoming into its midst a more representative portion of its population;
- To implement a vigorous administrative policy to ensure framework imputability and “zero tolerance where racism is concerned;”²⁵
- To take measures in order to guarantee equality of dignity and human rights – for individuals and groups – wherever necessary within its territory. Particular attention is granted to housing, employment and services in the proximity (public security; fire safety; sports and entertainment; environment and sustainable development; cultural, social and community development; and transportation);
- To promote non-violence and inclusion through programs and through its institutions in their respective areas of competence, and in particular on scientific teams, in its network of cultural centres, in its libraries and in different areas of direct citizen services;
- To solemnly proclaim its participation in *International Day of Tolerance* on November 16, and to highlight it each year;
- To develop its institutional training program, an essential tool for guaranteeing the transmission of a culture of diversity within the administration, in order to raise awareness among staff and provide

²⁵ The merger cancelled the former City of Montreal's Access to Equality Program. The new city therefore had to recreate it.

practical means, including intercultural competencies, for staff members to appropriate modes of diversity management in daily life (City of Montreal, 2004).²⁶

As regards intercultural relations and the promotion of diversity, the *Montreal Summit* essentially proposed to “Make the ethnocultural diversity of the population a central element of the economic, cultural and social planning of the new city and its partners.”²⁷

To achieve this, the following was proposed:

- Implementation of measures to guarantee equity, accessibility and diversity management.
- Equitable participation of under-represented groups within decision-making proceedings and consultations in Montreal.
- Implementation of a *Montreal Plan of Action for Intercultural Relations*.
- The socio-economic inclusion of groups living in exclusion.

The necessity for a new partnership framework with the Quebec government was also highlighted.

2.3. Tools to evaluate such policies and their indicators

The work plan described anticipated results, which could be considered as embryonic indicators. With regard to equitable participation of under-represented groups within decision-making proceedings and consultations in Montreal, we note the following indicators:

- An increase in the number of nominees from under-represented groups;
- The number of contributors and young people aware of human rights and diversity.

With regard to the implementation of the *Montreal Plan of Action for Intercultural Relations*, the indicators will be:

- The number of local action plans implemented at the borough level;
- The number of new projects created locally;
- The quantity of appropriate services, by borough;
- The number of employees trained in interculturalism;
- The number of new cultural projects that reflect diversity and that are supported in each borough.

²⁶ City of Montreal. (2004). *Diversité montréalaise*. Retrieved from <http://interculturel.ville.montreal.qc.ca>.

²⁷ City of Montreal (2002c), p.9.

For the socio-economic inclusion of groups suffering from exclusion the indicators could be:

- The number of projects supported annually by the *Reference Centre for the Support of Visible Minority Projects*;
- The increase in the number of scholarships granted by the *Mayor's Youth Foundation*;
- The annual number of internships created by companies for "visible minorities";
- The annual number of companies and organisations made aware of "visible minority" hiring policies (City of Montreal, 2002c).

We remind the reader that the Montreal Plan of Action for Intercultural Relations is not yet completed. In fact, it depends upon the plans of action adopted by each borough, and the majority have not yet adopted one. Furthermore, it seems that there is a certain lack of clarity regarding the role of each body responsible for monitoring these policies, i.e. the Working Group Monitoring Committee, the Montreal Intercultural Council and the Division of Intercultural Affairs.

The City of Vancouver²⁸

3.1. The Context

Ethnocultural diversity has long been a reality in Vancouver, but this diversity has increased since the mid-1980s because of international immigration and inter-provincial migration. In terms of percentages and as compared with other Canadian cities, Vancouver has the second largest population of immigrants, i.e. persons born outside of Canada (45% in 2001), and of members of “visible minorities” (49% in 2001). In the last few years, immigrants who settle in Vancouver are primarily of Chinese, Filipino and Indian ancestry. In the 2001 census, 50.6% of Vancouver’s population identified a language other than English as their native language. 26.6% of the population speaks Chinese at home. French is far behind at just under 2%.²⁹

Recent Chinese immigration to Vancouver has a particularity that must be highlighted. In 1984, mainland China and Great Britain officially announced that Hong Kong would be returned to China in 1997. Numerous Hong Kong residents immigrated to Canada as immigrant-investors and primarily established themselves in Vancouver, the largest Canadian city on the Pacific Ocean. They made significant investments in real estate, hotels, catering services, manufacturing, and the media. Towards the end of the 1980s they were followed by immigrants from Taiwan and this tendency has been sustained throughout the 1990s. Thanks to this flood of capital, Vancouver was able to avoid the recession that affected Canadian cities throughout the 1980s.

3.2. Municipal policies to fight discrimination and concrete measures to combat racism

In a document published in 1980 and entitled *Goals for Vancouver*, the *Vancouver Planning Commission* highlighted ethnic diversity as one of the fundamental aspects of the city’s unique character.

In 1988, the City Council adopted a *Civic Policy on Multicultural Relations*.³⁰ This Policy dealt with the necessity of recognizing diversity as a strength, of providing access to services for all the city’s inhabitants, regardless of their background and including those who face linguistic barriers, and of the possibility to live free of all prejudice. It requested that all City staff respect these principles in their

²⁸ Centre of Research on Immigration Ethnicity and Citizenship. (February 2005). *Indicators for evaluating municipal policies aimed at fighting racism and discrimination*. University of Montreal: Centre for Research on Immigration, Ethnicity and Citizenship. The study took the Ten Point Action Plan, which was adopted in December 2004 by the Coalition of Cities Against Racism as its reference point in evaluating of municipal performance.

²⁹ Statistics Canada, 2001 census.

³⁰ City of Vancouver. (2006). *Multiculturalism & Diversity. Civic Policy on Multicultural Relations*. Retrieved from <http://vancouver.ca/commsvcs/socialplanning/initiatives/multicult/civicpolicy.htm>.

work and encouraged efforts undertaken to ensure quality services for residents whose native language is not English.

During the 1980s and 1990s, the City of Vancouver undertook a series of measures to take into account the growing diversity of its population. The Hastings Institute was created in 1989 to offer diversity training programs to City staff. The Institute is open to staff from other municipalities and provincial government ministries. A program for employment equity was also established. In 1993, the City hosted a community conference entitled *From Barriers to Bridges* and reaffirmed its civic policy on multicultural relations. In 1995, a Communication Strategy that took diversity into account was adopted. The City set up a multi-lingual information and reference service (in four languages) and took an inventory of staff members who spoke a second language. Directives on interpretation and translation needs were drawn up. Special efforts were made to consult members of diverse “cultural communities” during the drafting of the City Plan in 1993-1995, as well as during municipal elections. The City’s *Special Advisory Committee on Cultural Communities* was also made responsible for the annual *Cultural Harmony Award* and the celebration of the *International Day for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination* on March 21st.³¹ In 2001, a *Newcomer’s Guide* was published in five languages.³²

The City Police Department also undertook several initiatives and set up a Diversity Relations Unit, whose mandate is to: a) work to maintain and build positive relations with the community in all of its diversity, b) guarantee that every individual receives respectful and equal treatment in discrimination or harassment cases, c) guarantee that the entire community has access to police services and, equally, that police services have access to the different communities, d) work to eliminate any obstacles that might make cooperation between police services and the community difficult. Since 1994, a position for an agent in charge of relations with aboriginal communities exists.³³

At the administrative level, the Social Planning Department handles community and social issues that affect underprivileged groups. It must make sure that issues related to multiculturalism and diversity remain one of the administration’s priorities; it also assists the City Council, other departments and community organisations in handling such issues. The staff members of this Department are responsible for:

- Recommending inclusive policies and strategies to City Council and other authorities concerned with such questions;

³¹ The AMSSA (Affiliation of Multicultural Societies and Service Agencies of BC) plays an active role in the March 21st celebration.

³² Ibid.

³³ Ibid.

- Working with the Special Advisory Committee and other levels of government to identify emergent issues and needs of cultural communities, and recommending appropriate actions and responses;
- Liaising or working with other departments on questions relating to cultural diversity and the challenges it creates;
- Liaising with different communities and organisations and, when necessary, assisting them with existing or emergent needs and problems in these areas;
- Recommending financing or seeking out resources to respond to critical or emergent issues concerning different communities.
- The *Funding Program for Community Services* grants support to over one hundred nonprofit organisations. The City encourages and expects all organisations to offer services to all residents. Priority is given to eliminating obstacles that prevent members of different communities from accessing existing services and to supporting the integration of newcomers into community life. Developing these capacities is also a priority for newly-arrived groups who are faced with serious problems, but who do not have sufficient resources to deal with them.

3.3. Tools to evaluate such policies and their indicators

We were not able to obtain information on the tools used to evaluate these policies.

The City of Saskatoon³⁴

Saskatoon is the largest city in Saskatchewan; it has a population of 231,203 people, is located in the heart of the Canadian prairies and was originally inhabited by aboriginal peoples. Saskatchewan and its neighbouring province, Manitoba, have the highest populations of Aboriginals, who make up approximately 14% of the population. The aboriginal population is growing in Canada, and rose from 3.8% of the total population in 1996 to 4.4% in 2001.³⁵

Saskatchewan was the first Canadian province to include aboriginal peoples in its definition of multiculturalism (in fact, this definition includes everyone, whereas standard multiculturalism policy is geared primarily towards communities of more recent immigration).

Another unique aspect of Saskatchewan is that descendants of the French and the English do not make up the majority of its population. The population is very diverse. Many citizens in this province are descendants of immigrants who came in waves from the Ukraine, Russia and Scandinavia to develop agriculture at the beginning of the 20th century.

Saskatoon is the only city we found that has a developed program intended to address race relations above all other diversity issues. While most cities have begun to move toward more general 'diversity' programs, Saskatoon has identified racism as a particular problem for its community, and has recently reaffirmed its commitment to an anti-racist agenda.

4.1. The Context

According to the 2001 census data, Saskatoon has the highest proportion of Aboriginals of any Canadian city: 7.5% of the total population. This is a very young population and 40% are under the age of 14, which weighs heavily on the school system, but which also represents a future work force in an aging population.

In 1989, the City of Saskatoon created a *Race Relations Committee*, in response to a request from ethnocultural groups, schools, police services, social services and non-governmental organisations.³⁶ The activities of this Committee included

³⁴ Centre of Research on Immigration Ethnicity and Citizenship. (February 2005). *Indicators for evaluating municipal policies aimed at fighting racism and discrimination*. University of Montreal: Centre for Research on Immigration, Ethnicity and Citizenship. The study took the Ten Point Action Plan, which was adopted in December 2004 by the Coalition of Cities Against Racism as its reference point in evaluating of municipal performance.

³⁵ For information, this percentage is 2.2% in Australia, 1.5% in the United States and 14% in New Zealand.

³⁶ City of Saskatoon (2000).

the creation of a *Race Relations Division* in the municipal administration, the celebration of March 21st, a “Living in Harmony” award, a training program for municipal employees, and the adoption by City Council of an *Equity and Anti-Racism Policy* on December 1, 1997. A sub committee for relations with aboriginal groups was set up in June 1992. Members of this sub committee were consulted on the issue of relations between police services and young Aboriginals (1993), and they organised a seminar on Aboriginals in the business sector for the Federation of Canadian Municipalities in 1996. The City hired an individual to encourage and facilitate participation in municipal elections among Aboriginals.

The mandate of the Race Relations Committee included reviewing City policies, practices and programs. The related reports mostly focused on creating appropriate services and eliminating obstacles in access to these services. The Committee also published a certain number of brochures and worked in partnership with various relevant organisations.

In May 2001, external experts evaluated the City of Saskatoon’s race relations program. They concluded that the prerequisite for any future decision was the need to mobilise the entire community on a long-term project. The year 2002 was devoted to major consultations and a new *Cultural Diversity and Race Relations Policy* with a plan of action came into effect on February 9, 2004.³⁷

The City of Saskatoon also took innovative steps when it finalised agreements on land use and services with the First Nations in order to create “urban reserves”, the goal of which was to facilitate the development of First Nation economic and business projects. The first agreement was signed in 1988. It was so successful that agreements have been signed for five similar projects and negotiations are under way for other initiatives. These “urban reserves” have become the symbol of the First Nations’ contribution to the city’s development.³⁸ In September 2002 and as part of its urban strategy in favour of Aboriginals, the Canadian Government announced a joint program with cities and provinces to reduce the high poverty rate among Aboriginals living in urban environments. The first funds were allocated the following year.

4.2. Municipal policies to fight discrimination and concrete measures to combat racism

We will briefly outline the major axes of the policies and the *Plan of Action* adopted by the City of Saskatoon in February 2004.³⁹ Sections 4.2 and 4.3 are

³⁷ City of Saskatoon (2000).

³⁸ Sully and Emmonds (2004).

³⁹ City of Saskatoon (2004).

condensed versions of official city documents, as they appear on the city's website⁴⁰:

The City of Saskatoon recognizes that Saskatoon has always been a society composed of people from many different backgrounds and that this diversity will continue. The participation and contribution of all citizens in the development of our community is vital to meeting the challenges of the future.

Saskatoon has a highly developed Race Relations Program, and is the only city that we came across that emphasises anti-racism over other diversity issues (though, of course, not to their exclusion). Since its inception, the Race Relations Program has had both an organizational and community focus, with a recent expansion of its efforts in the community. The city is currently revitalizing its 15 year-old program, following the recommendations of an external audit conducted in 2001, and a related community consultation held in 2002.

Saskatoon's Race Relations Committee was created in 1989, as an advisory body for City Council. The mandate of the Race Relations Committee "includes the review of policies, practices and programs of the City to recommend amendments and/or new action with respect to: Personnel, Law Enforcement, Leisure Services, Housing and Community Services, Education and Training, Use of municipal facilities, and Planning and Zoning."⁴¹ It was recently renamed as the Cultural Diversity and Race Relations Committee.

An Equity and Anti-Racism Policy, ratified in 1999, was intended to serve as a framework for the development of measures to deal with the issues of equity and anti-racism. Following the audit and consultations conducted in 2001-02, however, it was decided that a new policy should be drafted. In early February 2004, City Council resolved to adopt the Cultural Diversity and Race Relations Policy, which maintains the character of the former policy, but expands its purpose to include more community-based initiatives. The City has identified four community goals, and the means through which they hope to achieve them. The goals are: a workforce that is representative of the population of Saskatoon; zero tolerance for racism and discrimination; community decision-making bodies that are representative of the whole community; and the establishment of awareness and understanding in the community regarding diversity issues, and the acceptance of the various cultures that make up Saskatoon. To achieve these goals, the City plans to be: a leader in the community by communicating the City's vision and role with regard to diversity issues; a leader in the community by achieving its goals within its own organization; a facilitator to bring other agencies together to work jointly towards its goals; a coordinator or clearing house for information sharing; and a granting agency through existing grant programs.⁴²

⁴⁰ City of Saskatoon. Retrieved from http://www.city.saskatoon.sk.ca/org/leisure/race_relations.

⁴¹ City of Saskatoon. (1999). *Ten Years in Review: Tenth Anniversary Report of the City of Saskatoon Race Relations Committee*.

⁴² Saskatoon Race Relations Office. (March 2004). *What's New in Race Relations?*

Several of Saskatoon's programs are innovative, and many are designed to address the needs of the city's Aboriginal community specifically. A good example is the Peacekeepers Youth Camp, an initiative of the Saskatoon Police Service, which pairs Aboriginal youth with members of the police force on a camping trip, with the intention of creating trust between the two groups. Another initiative related to, but not restricted to, the Aboriginal community, is a new program to address the specific needs of minority women, who face multiple fronts of discrimination, which is funded by the Status of Women Canada, and administered by Federation of Canadian Municipalities. The Federal Department of Indian Affairs, through its Aboriginal Workforce Participation Initiative, has provided additional funding. Research findings from the project will be used to help develop a national toolkit designed to increase the participation rates of marginalized women of all backgrounds.

The City of Saskatoon will work with community organisations, the business and working sectors, other levels of government and other relevant authorities to create an inclusive society, where ethnocultural diversity is welcomed and valued, and where all citizens can live with dignity and be fulfilled without having to face racism and discrimination.

The community will work together to achieve the following objectives:

- The workforce will be representative of the population of Saskatoon.
- There will be zero tolerance of racism and discrimination.
- Community decision-making bodies will be representative of the entire population of Saskatoon.
- The community will foster awareness and understanding of issues regarding the different cultures that make up Saskatoon, and the acceptance of these cultures.
- The City of Saskatoon will continue to play its role in employment equity and in the fight against racism. In order to carry out its Strategic Plan and satisfy the needs of the citizens of Saskatoon, the City will play a central role in promoting harmonious race relations in the community. Other implicated authorities will also have to define their role in order to achieve the stated goals.

The City of Saskatoon will be a community leader by spreading its vision and expanding its role through an inclusive communication strategy. In order to do so, it will have to review its communication methods to make sure that the information is accessible to the entire population.

The City will be a community leader by achieving the stated goals within its own administration, through employment equity and staff training. The Employment Equity Program is supervised by the Saskatchewan Human Rights Commission. The Policy on Harassment in the Workplace provides support to all employees. A program of intercultural training will be offered to all staff members, including

managers, in order to work towards eliminating systemic obstacles and creating a work environment that welcomes all.

The City will take the initiative to bring together other authorities in order to work together to achieve the stated goals, through cooperation and partnerships. The first step will be to set up a committee or a coalition of agencies in order to develop strategies and action plans.

The City will centralise information-sharing and the development of joint training programs in order to increase intercultural comprehension and reduce discriminatory acts.

It will also be a sponsor by allocating funds to existing funding programs in order to include activities relating to race relations and by increasing awareness of such programs.

Existing City strategies and action plans, like the Employment Equity Program and the Housing Program, complete this Policy. These programs will be reviewed in the context of the City's initiatives on cultural diversity and the fight against discrimination. The Cultural Diversity and Race Relations Policy that the City of Saskatoon adopted must be periodically reviewed and evaluated in order to determine its success.

4.3. Tools to evaluate such policies and their indicators

The Plan of Action also identifies the evaluation tools and principal indicators for the four major axes of this policy:

- The presence of ethnocultural groups in the Saskatoon workforce and municipal administration will be representative of their proportion in the demographics of the city.

Evaluation tools: data from Statistics Canada and the Federation of Canadian Municipalities, labour force surveys.

Indicators: employment rates of ethnocultural groups, underemployment of ethnocultural groups based on work done in jobs below skills and training level, long-term retention of members of ethnocultural groups by employers.

- Zero tolerance of racism and discrimination.

Evaluation tools: statistics from police and other organizations, such as the Human Rights Commission, of incidents of racism.

Indicator: decrease in the number of reported incidents of racism. (Systems of reporting must be coordinated and a user friendly and non-intimidating system must be developed.)

- Community decision-making bodies will be representative of the entire population of Saskatoon.

Evaluation tools: the composition of City Council and committees by ethnic background, followed by an increased participation in neighbourhood decision-making bodies based on neighbourhood demographics, estimation of the City of Saskatoon's success in achieving these goals within its own administration

Indicator: increase in the number of people from a variety of ethnocultural backgrounds who participate in local government such as City Council, advisory committees, community associations, school boards, etc.

- The community will foster awareness and understanding of the different cultures that make up Saskatoon, and will understand related issues.

Evaluation tools: surveys, evaluating the effect of City awareness programs, monitoring best practices from various agencies and other cities.

Indicators: There are no indicators for this tool.⁴³

The Cultural Diversity and Race Relations Office was made responsible for implementing this policy, which was officially launched on October 6, 2004 and which could make the City of Saskatoon a true model.

⁴³ Ibid.

The City of Thunder Bay⁴⁴

5.1 The Context

Thunder Bay is a city of approximately 120,000 in Northwest Ontario. Aboriginal peoples comprise approximately 12% of the population. According to the 1996 Census, the Aboriginal population is 8,605. However, the figure is assumed to under-represent the Aboriginal population. Recognize that racism has effects on some of our community's most vulnerable residents, and a real cost to the community as a whole.

Thunder Bay also has a significant multicultural component with a number of European and non-European cultural societies. There were 2,680 persons who responded to the 1996 Census as members of a visible minority.

Thunder Bay was one of the important sites of the fur trade with European settlement occurring for more than 250 years. This history has implications for the political and social relations among Aboriginal peoples and Euro-Canadians. The town has since been a centre of commerce, transportation, and resource extraction, experiencing slow population and economic decline over the last two decades. Recent out-migration of Euro-Canadians has occurred in concert with increased immigration of non-European settlers and high birth rates for Aboriginal peoples. Therefore, Thunder Bay has experienced changing social demographics and racial composition. Projections into the future indicate that these trends will continue. Therefore, race relations will be increasingly important for the community.

A Community of Acceptance has three purposes. First, it will understand the current status of race relations in the community. Secondly, the study will enable Diversity Thunder Bay to orient its actions to more effectively address racism and foster community development. Third, the study is designed to be a catalyst for public discussion. We do well to ask ourselves what sort of community do we want to be, and what should be done about any racism found to be present in the community?

5.2 Municipal Policies to Fight Discrimination and Concrete measure to Combat Racism

There are many recommendations that are appropriate for all residents of Thunder Bay, in most situations. Racialization affects all of us as it affects the

⁴⁴ Diversity Thunder Bay. (March 2002). *A Community of Acceptance: Respect for Thunder Bay's Diversity*. Prepared by Randolph Haluza-DeLay CSoP Research & Consulting. Retrieved from www.csop.ca.

community in which we live. Yet, racialized people experience this racializing in different ways. Addressing the situation will also be multifaceted. Three broad areas in particular are important.

First, addressing systemic factors is necessary. Such factors are bigger than Thunder Bay. But it dramatically affects Thunder Bay and both individual lives and community development. A diverse Canada is the country that Canadians will increasingly encounter. An increasingly diverse Thunder Bay will happen as the Aboriginal population grows and both in-migration and out-migration change the demographics of the population. There are many societal conditions that affect racialization. It is bigger than and not based on common sense. Policies are only a first step. Adequate implementation of policies and evaluation of their effectiveness are also needed. Evaluation means that the policies can be revised. For example, employment equity policies have been shown to be effective in hiring more minority employees, but ineffective at increasing retention.⁴⁵

Along with, and maybe more important than policies, is educating people as to why the policies are being implemented. What is the philosophy behind the policy? What is it really trying to address? If systemic factors tend to be “abstract and opaque,” helping people peer through the clouded windows would appear to be relevant. Educational practices that help people become critical thinkers, would be beneficial, particularly as they take place at all sorts of social locations. Ironically, critical thinking can be a very productive workplace skill, besides its benefit in becoming more aware of complex social issues.

Second, taken-for-granted social practices need to be recognized. Address institutional cultures. All social institutions - workplaces, school systems, small and large business, the police, health care - involve social norms of how they do things. Since social practices and cultural norms are often unrecognized and taken-for-granted, a more thoughtful consideration than “commonsense” is called for.

Racialization should be acknowledged rather than defensively denied, or the victim blamed for being out-of-line or a trouble-maker. This requires listening, respecting, self-examining, and acting to improve conditions. It may mean stepping against accepted practices or norms, or refusing to be involved in offensive conversation. Since most racialization is subtle, individuals need to think often about how they are doing things, and whether that contributes to the racializing.

Third, strong leadership is demanded. Leaders need to be models of inclusiveness and awareness of social practices. Leaders will show the citizenry that a community of acceptance is important. Strong and prophetic measures

⁴⁵ Canadian Race Relations Foundation (2001).

maybe called for to address taken-for-granted and systemic factors. Since moving from some level of low cohesion to a higher level of social cohesion will take considerable effort, courageous and innovative leaders who are prepared for the long haul are needed.

Public Education Challenges:

[Reports of the presence of racism in schools, colleges and universities show that education alone will not change the world.]

Non-formal learning could be important in teaching people about race and ethnicity. Organizations outside of schools could engage in intentional anti-racism education, with perhaps fewer of the challenges than schools. Such organizations include churches, multicultural agencies, youth groups, service clubs, Guides, Scouts, and other associations.

Given the growing diversity in Thunder Bay and across the country, multicultural and anti-racism education can be seen as an investment in the future.

Therefore, the strongest recommendation possible is to work on improving race relations in Thunder Bay at the levels of institutional culture and social practices.

- First, addressing systemic factors is necessary
 - Second, taken-for-granted social practices need to be recognized.
 - Third, strong leadership is demanded.
-
- *Retail Establishments* - stores, restaurants - proved to be the most frequent sites of racism.
 - *Police Services* - Police services are another very significant site of racialization. Clearly, the institutional culture of the police force must be addressed.
 - *Schools* - Schools are the dominant sites of societal reproduction. Schools should also be specific in their actions.
 - *Other Social Locations* - Each place, large and small, has a duty as members of a community, to reflect on how others are treated at their establishment. Why are racialized people not present in many settings? This is a question for each store, service club, sports league, and voluntary association to consider.
 - *Municipal Government* - Again, most of the recommendations for other institutions apply here. Government services have some work to do to serve racialized people better – investment of resources into social cohesion.

Community Education

The data show that the public is only partly aware of processes of racialization. Even racialized people may not have a solid handle on systemic racism.

- Presentations and public education should be done with the non-racialized majority through clubs, organizations, business associations, churches and youth groups.
- Public education should include the complexity of racism. This education should address systemic racism, as this aspect was referred to relatively infrequently by study participants.
- The public would appear to need a better understanding of historical factors, for example, around abuses that occurred to Aboriginal peoples and racist immigration laws.
- The focus on social practices in this report can illuminate how all of us may tacitly affect others. This provides a handy, experiential vehicle for awareness-building without blame. But unconsciousness and lack of racist intent does not excuse the negative effects of racialization.

Work with Institutions

Diversity Thunder Bay should also help to clarify certain aspects of life in Thunder Bay that impact on racialized people

- Work with the institutions identified as social locations in which racialization occurs. Good initial focuses would be schools, workplaces, retail establishments and police. Later focuses could include churches, recreation settings and so on.
- Offer suggestions about how handle racialized treatment. Rather than focussing on race relations policies and blatant racism, such suggestions should also address the more common subtle, marginalizing and systemic manifestations of racialization.
- Assist the Chamber of Commerce to work with retail establishments and the business sector.
- As the use of Status cards as this is one of the clearest types of systematic discrimination, clarifying rights, responsibilities and issues regarding Status cards would be very helpful.
- Producing an explanatory brochure for retail staff might be a good start.

Build Social Capital

Diversity Thunder Bay could also engage in creative programming that help to build relationships among people who otherwise have less contact. This is a conscious way of creating social capital.

- Open houses regarding this report.
- Sharing circles where people can hear each other's experiences across cultural and ethnic boundaries.
- Healing circles where people can go to talk about the racializing they have experienced, and its impact on them.
- Although many events are announced as open to the public, many people feel uncomfortable attending because they do not know how they will be welcomed. Diversity Thunder Bay could be a partner, assisting the process of participation through such programs as information booths at events.
- Finding ways to create welcoming environments for full participation of all people.

5.3. Tools to Evaluate Such Policies and Their Indicators

We were not able to obtain information on the tools used to evaluate these policies.

The City of Stockholm⁴⁶

Quite quickly, Sweden went from a relatively homogenous society to a multiethnic and multicultural one. After World War II, and particularly during the 1960s, Sweden received an important wave of labour migration. The 1970s was a decade of reuniting families and in 1975, the first official policy based on equality, liberty of cultural choice, cooperation and solidarity was adopted.⁴⁷

During the 1980s and the early 1990s, most people arriving in Sweden were refugees. As of 1986, non-European refugees outnumbered European refugees. Immigration reached a peak in 1994, the year when 78,987 new arrivals were counted, 80% of them coming from non Nordic countries.

In 1995, Sweden joined the European Union and the Maastricht Treaty. Accordingly, members of the Union enjoyed more freedom to circulate, but people coming from outside the European Union faced major restrictions. Nonetheless, Sweden continued to reunite families of refugees who had already been accepted.

Today, nearly 11% of Sweden's population was born outside of Sweden and if one includes children born in Sweden to at least one immigrant parent, nearly 20% of the population has ancestry different from that of the majority. This diversity is mainly concentrated in large cities, and primarily in Stockholm and Malmö.

6.1. The Context

The end of the 1980s in Stockholm saw the beginnings of a certain residential segregation. Dormitory towns, built in the 1970s and badly designed, lacking public services and set in poor physical environments, housed a concentration of impoverished people and immigrants. The economic recession of the 1990s saw a rise in xenophobia and racism. A relatively high unemployment rate among minorities and the need to rely on social assistance laid the foundations for social problems and for a sentiment of exclusion among young minorities.

In 1997, the Swedish government adopted a new policy entitled: *Sweden, the future and diversity: from immigration policy to integration policy*. From then on, general policy would be based on the ethnic and cultural diversity of the society and integration policy would have the following major objectives:

⁴⁶ Centre of Research on Immigration Ethnicity and Citizenship. (February 2005). *Indicators for evaluating municipal policies aimed at fighting racism and discrimination*. University of Montreal: Centre for Research on Immigration, Ethnicity and Citizenship. The study took the Ten Point Action Plan, which was adopted in December 2004 by the Coalition of Cities Against Racism as its reference point in evaluating of municipal performance.

⁴⁷ Jederlund (1998).

- Equal rights, obligations and opportunities for all, regardless of ethnic or cultural background.
- A community founded on diversity.
- A society characterised by mutual respect and tolerance, in which each individual can have an active and responsible role, regardless of his/her background (Government of Sweden, 1997).

In 1998, the National Integration Office was made responsible for tracking advances made on the integration policy's goals, for developing procedures to improve the arrival of new refugees and to promote integration. The goals were to reduce unemployment and the number of social assistance beneficiaries, raise awareness among different organisations and adopt an attitude of understanding towards difference in society.

6.2. Municipal policies to fight discrimination and concrete measures to combat racism

In February 1997, the Stockholm City Council adopted its Integration Program: *An Integration Programme: Promoting Free Choice and Cooperation in the City of Stockholm*. Revised in May 1998 and in October 2001, this program essentially aims to stop the tendency towards social and ethnic segregation and it is based on the following principles:

- Everyone is needed, everyone has a job and everyone enjoys the same right and obligations (better employment opportunities).
- Everyone shares a common rule of law, has access to a common language and has common meeting places (crime prevention).
- A City that is free of racism and discrimination, in its role as employer and as service provider.
- All children and young people can enjoy a good childhood with good care, meaningful leisure activities and equal opportunities for education and future employment.
- Everyone can live in a safe, attractive neighbourhood.

The procedure that was followed consisted of depicting the current situation, analysing that situation and defining a strategy, striving for continuity, facilitating the coordination of measures adopted in different areas, sharing experiences with neighbouring cities and other municipalities, developing competencies in schools and kindergartens, obtaining a consensus within the municipal administration and, finally, ensuring that this commitment did not stifle creativity.

The key factors identified as being critical to the success of this policy were a) a long term perspective, b) taking into consideration the perspectives of the base and c) result oriented management and periodic evaluations.

In December 1998, the government presented a unified municipal policy: *Development and Justice: A Policy for Metropolitan Areas*.⁴⁸

With this policy, the government launched a consultation of all participants in order to lay down the foundations for sustainable development in metropolitan regions, put a stop to social and ethnic segregation, and work to create comparable living conditions and to guarantee gender equality among city residents. The *Commission on Metropolitan Areas* gave priority to the second objective and proceeded to sign agreements with major cities, including Stockholm. These agreements are valid for periods of three to six years, but are revised annually.

6.3. Tools to evaluate such policies and their indicators

Since April 1999, the *National Integration Office* has ensured the coordination and evaluation at a national level.

At the beginning of December 2004, the City of Stockholm was to acquire new policies and new indicators on integration, discrimination and diversity. However, the Integration Program already contained objectives and key figures. The following documents have been taken from the official City of Stockholm document.⁴⁹

A— No individual should be permanently shut out of the labour market; all users should receive information on possible options.

Key figures

Percentage of people in the population aged 20-64 gainfully employed in each district

Percentage of households in each district that were dependant on income support for 10 months or more during the year

Number of evictions per 1,000 households in each district

Participation in municipal elections

Median income for residents aged 20-64 in each district

Highest educational level achieved as a percentage of the population aged 16-64 in each district

Responsible authority

District Councils

Social Services Committee and District Councils

District Councils

District Councils

District Councils

District Councils

⁴⁸ City of Stockholm (2001).

⁴⁹ Ibid.

B— A common language, common meeting places, a safe city for all.

Key figures

Percentage of the population within each district brought up on charges for penal code or drug offences

Number of residents per local police officer

Number and percentage of students who successfully complete the Swedish Language for Immigrants course

Responsible authority

District Councils

District Councils

Education Board

C— To the extent possible, City administration employees should reflect the composition of society, and there should be no discrimination in City activities.

Key figures

Percentages of managers and officers with non-Swedish ethnic or cultural background

Number of unlawful discrimination judgements annually in the City of Stockholm

Responsible authority

Integration Committee

Integration Committee

D— All young people should leave school with an approved level of competency in the Swedish language; all young people with a native language other than Swedish should be given an opportunity to develop active bilingualism.

Key figures

Percentage of students who receive instruction in Swedish as a second language who pass the « Stockholm test » for year three students

National tests: percentage of passing marks in Swedish, English and mathematics

Number and percentage of ninth-year students who receive passing marks in Swedish (or Swedish as a second language), English and mathematics

Responsible authority

Education Board

District Councils

District Councils

E— All districts should be functioning social units, with access to housing, transportation, businesses, public authorities, and various services and democratic institutions.

Key figures

Percentage of citizens who consider their district to be clean, safe and well-kept

Responsible authority

District Councils

Local services as measured by the number of banks, post offices, convenience stores, special housing for the elderly, recreation centres, schools, child-care centres and after-school leisure centres

District Councils

The Integration Committee of the City of Stockholm is responsible for coordinating, monitoring and evaluating the City's efforts.

The City of Boston⁵⁰

The genocide of indigenous peoples, slavery and decades of institutionalised discrimination have made racism one of the fundamental characteristics of American society, and have made inequality based on skin colour one of the biggest challenges for the United States of America. However, from the resistance of indigenous peoples to the struggle of slaves with African origins, from the Civil War to the Civil Rights Movement, this country's history is also filled with initiatives to fight discrimination. For African Americans and minorities of more recent immigration, these problems are raised with particular acuity in the urban environment.

The *National League of Cities* has made the fight against racism and discrimination a priority for the past fifteen years. It has published several documents destined to help American cities face this challenge, by focusing as much on individual attitudes and behaviours as on policies and institutional frameworks. While it acknowledges that each city's situation is very different and that initiatives must be taken with consideration of local realities, the League recommends that cities go beyond the denial stage, adopt a vision and take action. It recommends that cities face up to reality and portray their situation with the help of objective and subjective indicators, that municipal administrations become a part of the solution by setting examples and by adopting and implementing plans of action, and that cities seek and obtain the cooperation of other implicated bodies, both governmental and non-governmental.

7.1. The Context

Boston, with its numerous elite universities, is very proud of its image as a liberal enclave and it sees itself as the birthplace of the American nation. It was here that the idea of American independence was born and that the key strides in this direction were made as early as 1773. Slavery was abolished in Boston in 1783.

Boston is the city that created the American public education system, but also the first city to establish segregation in schools. Boston was the first city to abolish segregation in its public schools, but it was also the city where, one century later, the fight to end segregation in the entire educational system was one of the most difficult and violent. This happened in 1974 and resulted in the exodus of citizens qualified as "white."⁵¹ Even today, the city of Boston has a reputation in the United States for being rather unwelcoming to persons of colour, and the

⁵⁰ Centre of Research on Immigration Ethnicity and Citizenship. (February 2005). *Indicators for evaluating municipal policies aimed at fighting racism and discrimination*. University of Montreal: Centre for Research on Immigration, Ethnicity and Citizenship. The study took the Ten Point Action Plan, which was adopted in December 2004 by the Coalition of Cities Against Racism as its reference point in evaluating of municipal performance.

⁵¹ Hill (1981).

metropolitan region of Boston comes in third among the most “white” metropolitan regions in the United States.

After the incidents in the 1970s, numerous community and business leaders, NGOs and residents worked to revitalize Boston, hoping to create a new solidarity among residents and to guarantee a better future for the city. They succeeded in revitalizing real estate and commercial neighbourhoods, in building new institutions and in creating a new community spirit.

Today, the City of Boston is one of the most diverse cities in the world: nearly 50% of its residents belong to a racial group. This diversity is strongest in younger age groups: according to the 2000 census, 75% of young Bostonians between the ages of 14 and 17 are classified as being “of colour”. More than one quarter of Bostonians were born outside of the United States. However, while Boston is becoming a city of minority and racial groups, most political positions are held by individuals with Irish or Italian backgrounds; power is still “white” in this city of double standards. It must be specified that the Boston suburbs are 90% “white.”⁵² In 2000, Boston had two of the wealthiest neighbourhoods in the United States, but 70% of students in its public school system qualified for free or reduced-rate meals. More than 84% of young people in Boston public schools belong to a racial minority. The disparities are great between ethnic and racial groups in regards to education, revenue, health, and access to information technology. In 1990, the per capita revenue of “whites” was twice that of “blacks” and Asians, and more than twice that of Latinos.

The Boston region must face quite a few challenges: lack of accessibly priced housing, lack of English language skills among newcomers, problems relating to the legal status of many immigrants, etc. In the Boston Metro, residential segregation is high and racial groups are concentrated in a dozen communities.

7.2. Municipal policies to fight discrimination and concrete measures to combat racism

The *Office of Civil Rights* was created in 1995. It is an umbrella organisation in charge of implementing and coordinating all policies and measures to fight discrimination and racism in the City of Boston.⁵³ Its mission is to eliminate discrimination and to guarantee equal access to housing, public services and participation in city activities. It strives to reduce barriers in communication, attitudes and procedures for all people living and working in the city. It offers its services to develop a vision of understanding, accessibility and mutual respect among the city’s residents.

⁵² City of Boston: Office of Civil Rights: <http://www.cityofboston.gov/civilrights/>.

⁵³ Ibid.

The Office of Civil Rights is made up of three main sectors: the Boston Fair Housing Commission, the Boston Human Rights Commission and the Commission for Persons with Disabilities.

The Boston Fair Housing Commission works to eliminate discrimination and ensure better access to housing by coordinating among agencies, using positive marketing, conducting surveys and implementing decisions. It centralises a computer-based list of housing possibilities in the region aimed at low income households.

In 1998, it analyzed barriers to achieving equity in the dynamics of the housing market. The principal recommendations detailed actions to take to overcome obstacles in low rent government housing, private housing, housing for handicapped individuals, insurance policies and mortgages. The study also examined discrimination, zoning, lead paint issues and real estate agency practices. It strongly recommended measures to facilitate equitable access to housing since this is such a fundamental condition for ensuring equity in education, the workplace and many other areas. The Commission also made reference to other agencies offering resources likely to favour autonomy, such as those relating to diploma equivalencies, continued education and job searches.

The *Boston Human Rights Commission* works to ensure public accessibility to City services. It receives and investigates reported complaints, resolves cases through mediation or hearings, and carries out advocating activities relating to human rights questions in close collaboration with agencies at other levels of government.

The *Commission for Persons with Disabilities* facilitates the participation of persons with disabilities in all City of Boston activities. It strives to reduce any obstacle related to architecture, procedures, attitudes or communication that may affect such persons. It ensures that the City of Boston respects all laws and regulations relating to persons with disabilities.

7.3. Tools to evaluate such policies and their indicators

At the beginning of 1997, the City of Boston and the *Boston Foundation's Community Building Network*, with the support of the *National Neighborhood Indicators Partnership* of the *Urban Institute* in Washington, set up a project to develop indicators for the City, furthering a 1996 proposal on indicators of sustainability that the City had drafted. The idea was to create a widespread tool to collect data, analyses and the resulting reports in order to guide and measure changes.

Accordingly, an entire series of indicators was developed, making it possible to measure:

- civic involvement;

- social and racial confidence;
- representation of minorities in top-level positions of large companies;
- representation of minorities within the City Council and State Legislature;
- representation of minorities in top-level positions of cultural organisations;
- hate crimes;
- residential segregation;
- multilingualism in large public institutions;
- training and the capacity to speak English;
- revenue according to race;
- educational level according to residential neighbourhood;
- unemployment according to race and educational level;
- participation in higher education according to race and ethnic background;
- the waiting list for English classes and adult education;
- access to mortgage credit according to race;
- percentage of residents without health insurance according to gender and race;
- presence of interpreters in large hospitals and health centres;
- infant mortality and infant birth weight according to race and ethnic background;
- rate of hospitalisation for asthma according to race, ethnic background, age and residential neighbourhood;
- rate of hospitalisation and death rate according to race and ethnic background;
- obesity according to race, age, gender and ethnic background;
- access to a computer and to Internet at home;
- duration of the home-workplace commute according to race, revenue, age and reliance on public transportation;
- user-friendliness of bus services.⁵⁴

This series of indicators is currently being reworked in order to create a civic agenda.

⁵⁴ Boston Foundation (2000).

The City of Calgary⁵⁵

8.2. The Context

Calgary has a diversity program internal to the city, but it is the effort of the Calgary community that is especially innovative. A major initiative, called Diversity Calgary, was launched in early 2003 after several years of planning. It is intended to bring together 'champions of diversity' from each of its four target sectors: public, private, community, and non-profit. These champions form the membership of both the Diversity Calgary Leadership Council, and the initiative's 'inter-sectoral teams'. One notable characteristic of Diversity Calgary is that, even though the City has played a significant role in its development and funding, the initiative is nevertheless an independent, non-profit organization, with a mandate to serve the community as a whole.

In 1992, a coalition of concerned citizens, city officials, and community groups created Calgary's Committee on Race Relations and Cross-Cultural Understanding. Though backed by the City, the Committee was, and remains, a community initiative. In 1999, with the help of the City of Calgary, the Committee created a Cultural and Racial Diversity Task Force, "aimed at creating a community that is free of cultural and racial barriers, where all people are valued and respected."⁵⁶

After conducting some basic research, the Task Force contracted with a consulting firm to design and manage the project. It was completed in July 2002, with a report titled "Diversity Calgary: Moving Forward" as its end product. The report is thorough, carefully detailing each of the five phases of the project, which included in-depth community consultations, and a conference that brought together the project's four target sectors. It concludes with a set of recommendations for the creation of a new organization, called Diversity Calgary, designed to bring all four sectors together in a 'distinctly Calgary' approach to diversity, headed by a leadership council.⁵⁷

In early 2003, Diversity Calgary became a functional organization. The Diversity Calgary Leadership Council is comprised of members from all four sectors and, because it sets the agenda, it is at the heart of the initiative. Equally important are Diversity Calgary's 'Inter-Sectoral Teams', which initially numbered 12 (to match the 12 diversity strategies identified by the Task Force), but which have

⁵⁵ Laurier Institution. (March 2004). *Municipal anti-racism and diversity programs in Canada*. Vancouver: The Laurier Institution.

⁵⁶ Springboard Consulting Inc. (July 2002). *Diversity Calgary, Moving Forward: Project Report*.

⁵⁷ The Task Force wanted its work to be useful not only to Calgary, but to other cities as well. As a result, a stand-alone workbook derived from the project, titled "Moving Forward", is now available from Diversity Calgary as a guide for other cities interested in developing an initiative similar to their own.

now been consolidated into six. These teams, again comprised of members from all four sectors, are intended to “provide forums for considering diversity issues and developing plans to advance the 12 strategies that have been endorsed for achieving Diversity Calgary’s aims.”⁵⁸ The teams are as follows: Diversity Training; Employment; Improved Access; Organizational Policies & Practices; Partnerships & Stakeholder Involvement; and Teaching Resources. The most active at this time are the Teaching, Partnerships, and Employment teams. Two consultants, a Project Coordinator and an Assistant Coordinator, have been hired to assist the Leadership Council, its committees and the Inter-sectoral Teams.

8.2. Municipal policies to fight discrimination and concrete measures to combat racism

On September 11, 2006, the City of Calgary signed a declaration to join the Canadian Coalition of Municipalities against Racism and Discrimination (CCMARD). Since this date, an internal advisory team has been commissioned, which includes municipal and community representatives. This committee has had several meetings and is formulating a plan to identify how the municipal government can enhance the work it is doing to ensure that as an employer, a government leader, and a service provider it is creating an inclusive city and workplace.

The initial focus will be on The City of Calgary’s internal processes and practices arises from consultations conducted with members of the community.

On June 1st, 2007 Calgary hosted the 13 municipalities who have signed on to the CCMARD to date. This includes Wood Buffalo, Brooks, Edmonton, Drayton Valley, Lion’s Bay, Thunder Bay, Oshawa, Windsor, Toronto, Gatineau, Montreal, and Halifax.

Representatives from these centers met and discussed how they could move forward with their commitments to CCMARD, either individually or together.

A Coordinator has been hired to oversee Calgary’s CCMARD response. Over the next year the Coordinator will work closely with City of Calgary’s management and staff to develop an organizational framework and action plans, including the development and distribution of a a monthly newsletter to keep community, city employees and concerned citizens updated. (Questions can be referred by email at: cam.stewart@kanataint.ca).

8.3. Tools to evaluate such policies and their indicators

⁵⁸ Diversity Calgary. *Our DiverseCity*, 1(1), p. 3.

At present, the Diversity Calgary initiative is still at an early stage of growth, but it is nevertheless one of the most innovative community approaches in Canada. Its current goals include the development of a social infrastructure in Calgary that ensures that the benefits of cultural and racial diversity are fully realized, the provision of anti-racism education and the reduction of systemic discrimination, and the removal of barriers to full participation in work and community, by promoting best practices and policies of inclusiveness in organizations, institutions and the community. The fact that so many different interests have been successfully brought together to work towards a common goal is impressive in itself, but it will be particularly interesting to see where Diversity Calgary is a few years from now, when it has firmly established its place in the community.

The City of Prince George⁵⁹

Known as BC's northern capital, Prince George is a bustling city of over 83,225 situated at the crossroads of Highway 97 (north-south) and Highway 16 (east-west), and at the confluence of the Fraser and Nechako Rivers. As a major city of the Pacific Rim, Prince George is firmly tied to the global market (<http://www.city.pg.bc.ca/>).

City Council has established key focus areas and project priorities to define the City of Prince George strategic direction through 2011. Administrative work plans and budgets will be developed to ensure alignment with the strategic plan vision, objectives and priorities. The Strategic Plan is divided into Core Focus Areas. The second focus area is:

Building Stronger Neighbourhoods.

The strength, resilience and interconnectivity of neighbourhoods define a vibrant city. Strengthening neighbourhoods involves the recognition, celebration and protection of neighbourhood identities. Strong neighbourhoods give people a sense of ownership and responsibility.

The City will develop a comprehensive crime reduction strategy in conjunction with the RCMP.

9.1 The Context

Prince George's diversity program is driven by an active and influential Intercultural Committee, which frequently partners with community organizations in the research and development of new initiatives. The City places equal emphasis on the city as an organization and as a community, but it is the community activities of the Intercultural Committee that are of particular interest.

The City's Intercultural Committee is an advisory body to the Mayor and City Council. Membership consists of individuals of various ethnic backgrounds, who are appointed based on their own merits, and do not represent any outside organizations in their capacity as committee members. The Committee itself does not deliver projects or events, but it can partner with other groups if the project fits the committee's mandate.

In the past, the Committee has partnered closely with the Multicultural Heritage Society, the mandate of which is to promote multiculturalism, diversity and anti-racism education.

⁵⁹ Laurier Institution. (March 2004). *Municipal anti-racism and diversity programs in Canada*. Vancouver: The Laurier Institution.

The partnership started in 2000 with a project titled “Creating Community Awareness of Hate Activities in Prince George.” As part of this project, the Committee requested that Council create a task force to investigate issues surrounding hate activities, an initiative that went on to win the 2001 End Racism Award from Multiculturalism BC. One particularly interesting initiative that came out of a later collaboration with the Multicultural Heritage Society is a rental clause that states that “The licensee will not use or allow others to use [public facilities] in any manner that is contrary to the applicable laws, statutes, bylaws, ordinances, regulations or other lawful requirements of any government authority having jurisdiction.”⁶⁰ This clause applies, for example, to groups that would propagate hate speech.

The Committee’s current focus is to work with the local manager from Immigration Canada to establish who the new immigrants to the City and area are, what their needs are, and how the City can be promoted as a destination point to attract entrepreneurial or highly skilled immigrants.

Prince George has a particularly active Committee for a city of its size, and it has been obviously beneficial to the community. The Committee successfully partnered with community organizations to address specific issues of concern, and has won several awards for its efforts. One unusual benefit is that the existence and work of the Committee helped to refute a suggestion made recently by a Member of Parliament, that there were ‘crosses burning’ in Prince George.

9.2. Municipal policies to fight discrimination and concrete measures to combat racism

The City of Prince George Intercultural Committee’s mandate is to review, monitor and recommend programs that would foster improved relations among our culturally diverse citizen groups; and

1. To improve communications among municipal agencies, local institutions and ethnic / racial groups;
2. To promote nondiscriminatory policies and practices within the municipality;
3. To encourage participation of ethnic groups in local government;
4. To promote harmonious intercultural groups relations; AND
5. To support City Council’s proclamation that Prince George is a hate activities free zone.

⁶⁰ Email correspondence with the a representative of the City of Prince George.

A. Objectives

1. To act as a Clearing House / Information Centre:

- Becoming and staying informed
- Developing and maintaining a research inventory in a central place / Community Reading Room

2. To Act as a Voice:

(a) Identify Issues and Recommend Solutions:

- Advocate for local research
- Utilize local expertise

(b) Impact on the Corporation of the City of Prince George:

- Zoning
- Housing
- Personnel (i.e. proactive hiring)
- Promote nondiscriminatory policies within the municipality

(c) Promote harmonious intercultural relations at all levels of the City:

- Raise awareness
- Organize workshops

(d) Advocate education internally and externally

3. To provide recommendations to Council on the Hate Activities Task Force report, specifically pertaining to the following:

I) Designate Prince George as a Hate Activities Free Zone

II) The continuation of the Intercultural Committee

III) Demonstrate leadership in regards to ongoing education in the community

IV) Demonstrate leadership by developing proactive responses

4. To develop a closer working relationship with Council:

(a) As an Advisory Committee to City Council, inform as to issues, providing advice through executive summaries with appropriate support information.

(b) Reporting Process:

- Identify ways to report effectively and regularly to Council, semi-annually
- Bring issues and suggest possible solutions to Council
- Reply to requests of Council as referred.

B. Structure Membership

- 1 The membership shall be representative of a broad range of cultural groups and/or services within Prince George.
- 2 The Chairperson(s) shall be selected by the committee from its membership.
- 3 The process for recruiting new members will involve advertising for resumes according to the City Clerk's office guidelines. The committee will review and make recommendations to Council for appointments to the committee.

C. Procedure and Operation

- Meetings shall be held once monthly or at the call of the chairperson.
- Continuous absence of a member at three (3) consecutive meetings, without prior consent of Chairperson / Committee or reasonable need (eg: illness), will be reviewed by the committee, which may request the member's resignation from the committee.
- If unable to attend a meeting of the committee the member must contact the Recording Secretary no later than the day prior to the meeting.
- A quorum shall consist of five (5) committee members including the Chairperson. If a quorum cannot be formed for a meeting of the committee, the Chairperson shall be notified by the Recording Secretary and all other members will be notified that the meeting has been cancelled.
- Should the Chairperson be unable to attend a meeting of the committee the members shall select an Acting-Chairperson from its members for that meeting

9.3. Tools to evaluate such policies and their indicators

We were not able to obtain information on the tools used to evaluate these policies.

The City of Hamilton⁶¹

One of Ontario's largest urban centres, the City of Hamilton has undergone transformations similar to other urban centres in North America and the United Kingdom. In particular, there has been a significant increase in the number of subordinate racialized groups within Hamilton and increasing evidence of discrimination against these groups, including violent hate crimes. Responding to these matters, the City's Mayor established a Community Roundtable comprising leaders from across the Hamilton community, i.e., representatives from business, education, law enforcement, academics, community service providers and advocates. The City has also instituted the Committee Against Racism (<http://www.inform.hamilton.ca/record/HAM0080>).

10.1 The Context

The City of Hamilton is at a critical crossroad. Like other large urban centres, its population has become increasingly diverse and the events following September 11, 2001 have prompted the City's leadership to review how best to address this changing community. While the City of Hamilton has a number of resources currently in place to address anti-racism issues, there is now an opportunity for the City and its institutions to work together on a comprehensive strategy aimed at ensuring anti-racist institutional change is implemented in a comprehensive framework across the City. This will undoubtedly involve developing new working relations between communities and institutions as well as between different institutions. It will require leadership, commitment, trust, education of those integrally involved and ongoing communication to the public. It will require clarity and clear goals with objectives and timeframes and accountability mechanisms that serve as opportunities for information exchange as well as for monitoring results and ensuring compliance (Hamilton Community Foundation, 2003).

10.2. Municipal policies to fight discrimination and concrete measures to combat racism

The City of Hamilton, drawing upon the draws upon promising practices developed in urban centres in the United Kingdom, the United States and across Canada, has recently instituted the Committee Against Racism (which is alternatively called the City of Hamilton Advisory Committee) the role of the committee is to advise, advocate and consult on relevant issues in the community of Hamilton relating to racism and its consequences and anti-racism strategies its benefits.

⁶¹ Hamilton Community Foundation. (February 2003). *Hamilton At The Crossroads: Anti-Racism And The Future Of The City – "Lessons Learned" From Community-Based Anti-Racism Institutional Change Initiatives*. Prepared by Charles C. Smith Consulting. Hamilton Ontario, Canada.

Goals

- Encourage every person, regardless of their race, ancestry, place of origin, colour, ethnic origin, citizenship and/or creed, to participate in programs for the improvement of community relations and the fulfilment of Human Rights
- To consult with individuals and/or groups with respect to complaints regarding racism and to make referrals within the community for complainants

Responsibilities

- To work actively with institutions and all other relevant organizations, including education, police services, emergency services, public, private, voluntary sector and all levels of government to advise, consult, advocate and to promote proactive measures pertaining to racism and its consequences
- Initiate and facilitate discussions between individuals and/or groups to address issues and concerns of racism and/or while promoting respect and understanding in the community.
- Make recommendations to the City of Hamilton on issues relating to Equity in Employment as well as issues relating to anti-racism.

Values Statement

Members of the Committee will be vigilant about the need for equitable treatment for all without discrimination on the basis of race, ancestry, place of origin, colour, ethnic origin, citizenship, creed, sex, sexual orientation, age, marital status, family status or ability level.

The particular issues and challenges in the anti-racism work experienced by that City of Hamilton – exposed through the efforts of such organizations as the Working Group on Racial Equality, the United Way of Burlington and Hamilton-Wentworth, the Settlement and Integration Services Ontario, and the City's Advisory Committee Against Racism are – are summarized below.

1. **Providing Leadership and Developing/Maintaining Coalitions for Action** – anti-racist community building and institutional change can easily die out or lose focus and change direction in a leadership void.
2. **Developing Strong Communities** – the research makes it clear that anti-racist initiatives are critical for issue identification, community building, leadership, public education and advocacy
3. **Role for the Voluntary Sector, Business and Institutions** – since the changing competition is critically linked to the immediate as well as long-term health of the City, it is critical that all sectors of the community take on the challenge of anti-racist work
4. **Role of Local Government** – in the literature local government has been seen as a major and critical ally in the development and implementation of anti-racist initiatives

5. **Developing Strategic Actions and Starting Points for Institutional Change** – strategic anti-racist institutional change is initiated by those organizations represented within it
6. **Anti-Racism Education and Training** – antiracist education and training is important for building alliances, fostering leadership and developing and implementing institutional change
7. **Public Education** – it is important to assess, understand, respond to and influence public attitudes and opinions regarding the importance of anti-racism work
8. **Community Safety and Elimination of Racial Violence** – much of the work on anti-racism is in response to racist violence
9. **Developing Clear Roles, Responsibilities and Sustaining the Work** – it is important to identify the resource and organizational capacities and develop protocols
10. **Accountability: Making it Work and Keeping Faith** – The proof of anti-racist institutional change is in the work being done, the results achieved and lessons learned.⁶²

10.3. Tools to evaluate such policies and their indicators

The City of Hamilton has established a Diverse Hamilton Database. The information in this special purpose database is provided by Inform Hamilton in collaboration with the Immigrant Culture and Art Association (ICAA). Inform Hamilton is committed to provide information that is accurate, up-to-date and comprehensive but is unable to assume any liability resulting from errors or omissions. Inclusion or omission of a program or service is neither a recommendation nor a comment on its quality.

⁶² Hamilton Community Foundation (2003).

United Kingdom

Learning from the UK experience – a ‘good practices’ template

In the United Kingdom, *The Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000* placed a general duty on public bodies to promote race equality. It provided an opportunity to ensure for improved policy making and the provision of public services that placed the needs of the community first.

The following are select good practices from four UK Boroughs:

- London Borough of Tower Hamlets: Valuing Diversity
- Swindon Borough Council, Race Equality Scheme 2005-2008
- Northampton Borough Council, Race Equality Scheme
- London Borough of Lambeth – Race Equality Scheme May 2008 - 2009

Examples of actions are set out in a chart at the end of this section.

A. Statement of Commitment or Vision

VALUING DIVERSITY: OUR POLICY STATEMENT ON DIVERSITY AND EQUALITY⁶³

Our commitment

Valuing diversity is one of the four core values of Tower Hamlets Council. We will promote diversity and equality in everything we do to improve the quality of life for everyone living, working and visiting Tower Hamlets. The borough’s diversity is one of its greatest strengths and assets. We will build upon this by working with the Tower Hamlets Partnership to provide accessible and responsive services that enable everyone to take part in the social, cultural and economic wealth of the borough. Achieving this is central to delivering the Council’s vision, is linked to our Strategic Plan priorities and objectives and forms a driving force within the Community Plan and key to creating a cohesive community.

⁶³ London Borough of Tower Hamlets. *Diversity and Equalities Assessment*. Retrieved from http://www.towerhamlets.gov.uk/lgsi/851-900/861_diversity_and_equalities.aspx.

Our aims and values

As a service provider we will:

- *Promote equality of opportunity and eliminate discrimination in the planning and delivery of our services in terms of age, disability, ethnicity, gender, sexual orientation, religion or belief, health and income status*
- *Promote good relations between communities and address negative stereotyping of any groups*
- *Ensure that all residents have equal opportunity to participate in the democratic process*
- *Tackle harassment relating to a person's age, disability, ethnicity, gender, sexual orientation, religion or belief, health and*
- *income status*

As an employer we will:

- *Develop, review and promote policies and practices that ensure equality of opportunity and eliminate discrimination for our workforce in all areas of employment (including recruitment, retention, learning and development, promotion, grievance, disciplinary and retirement)*
- *Ensure that our workforce reflects the diverse nature of the borough*

We will comply with:

- *The Equal Pay Act 1970*
- *The Sex Discrimination Act 1975*
- *The Race Relations Act 1976*
- *The Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000*
- *The Disability Discrimination Act 1995*
- *The Disability Discrimination Act 2005*
- *The Human Rights Act 1998*
- *The 2004 Employment Regulations on Religion and Faith*
- *The 2004 Employment Regulations on Sexual Orientation*
- *Single Equality Act 2006*
- *Proposed Single Equality Bill 2008*

We will recognise our community leadership role and use this to work towards a cohesive community in which inequality is tackled and equality promoted.

B. Process for Developing Actions for a 3-year Plan⁶⁴

⁶⁴ Swindon Borough Council. *Race Equality Scheme 2005-2008*. Retrieved from <http://www.swindon.gov.uk/yourcouncil/equalitiesanddiversity/equalities-race-equality.htm>.

How will the Scheme be developed over the next three years?

Consultation with service users and staff will be essential in drawing up and implementing policy and service development action plans. The action planning work is being broken down into three often overlapping stages

In Stage 1 the screening process

The Council is going through all its policies and services (functions). For each of these it is considering if any part of the policy or service might be relevant to any of the three parts of the General Duty.

In Stage 2 prioritise

The Council is taking the results of this screening and prioritising which policies and services have the most race equality issues. These are being tackled and monitored.

In Stage 3 decide what actions to take

The Council is also developing action plans about how it will tackle issues, problems and gaps in services. Actions are being linked to available resources.

C. UK Examples

The following are excerpts from the four Borough Council Race Action Plans. We have identified various action items that fit under the 10 Commitments which can serve as a guide for CCMARD members in developing their own plans of action.

1. Increase vigilance against systemic and individual racism and discrimination.

Borough	Description
Tower Hamlets	Undertake equality assessments of new and existing policies/ Monitored by Corporate Equalities Steering Group.
	Positively re-integrate young people who offend by implementing Race Audit action plan agreed by the Police, CPS, YOT and Court to monitor ethnic composition of offenders.
Northhampton	CEO and partners commit publicly to improving equality outcomes and tell the equality story of their community.
Swindon	Sustainable community and other partnership strategies reviewed with community to deliver locally identified equality outcomes.
Lambeth	Ensure that Directorates review and update Race Equality Scheme Action Plans and ensure that the Corporate Race Equality Scheme Action Plan is implemented.
	Support the organisation to eliminate unlawful discrimination, promote equality of opportunity and good race relations between people of different racial groups.
	To design, develop or commission as appropriate, equality and diversity interventions, including interventions for equality.

2. Monitor racism and discrimination in the community more broadly as well as municipal actions taken to address racism and discrimination.

Borough	Description
Tower Hamlets	Human resources produces annual reports and publish the diversity profile on application, short listing and appointments as part of the recruitment process; of staff who have attended training courses. Published on the Queen Mary Websites.
	Benchmark policies and practices against other public bodies with London Councils and other cross-boroughs, regional and national groups to test policies; established the Diversity and Equality Network of local, public, private and voluntary sectors.
	Develop ability of Council and partners to monitor community tension. Review role of Community Cohesion Contingency Planning and Tension Monitoring Group to ensure effective links to other partnership groups.
Swindon	Monitor renovation grants, concessionary fares and applications for taxi licences to ensure access by all communities.
Northampton	Monitor and analyze bullying and harassment in the workplace.
Lambeth	Develop and embed standard methodology, procedures and performance indicators for equalities monitoring and reporting (including race) across the council and embed.
	Ensure that the Equality (Race) Impact Assessment Panel meets at least once every month to review impact assessments for key policies and strategies.
	Ensure that the reports on the outcomes of Equality Impact Assessments are published and feedback on the results of the consultations is consistently provided.
	Ensure responsibility in relation to racial incidents monitoring is shared across all departments of the Council.
	To review corporate complaints procedures on an annual basis and to continuously improve service to BME groups in relation to complaints handling
Improve racial incidents monitoring by reviewing mechanisms for recording and reporting on racial incidents.	

3. Inform and support individuals who experience racism and discrimination.

Borough	Description
Tower Hamlets	Enhance understanding of needs of victims of hate crime via Advisory Group with reps from key partners. Extend “No Place for Hate” communications campaign by incorporating messages in Community Plan marketing campaign. Train 10 Youth hate crime champions to deliver awareness workshops with youth/educational and community groups.
Lambeth	To bring customer satisfaction ratings for ethnic minority customers at the same level as non ethnic groups and ensure customer satisfaction across all racial groups.
	Ensure that the Customer Centre polls and captures the needs of incoming ethnic groups, particularly growing “new” communities.
	Maintain and improve existing system (RESPOND) for recording of racial incidents and reporting on them.
	To carry out, at least annually, an audit of all racial incidents that are recorded on the RESPOND and ensure that further actions are completed.
	Enhance understanding of needs of victims of hate crime via Advisory Group with reps from key partners. Extend “No Place for Hate” communications campaign by incorporating messages in Community Plan marketing campaign. Train 10 Youth hate crime champions to deliver awareness workshops with youth/educational and community groups.

4. Support policing services in their efforts to be exemplary institutions in combating racism and discrimination.

Borough	Description
Tower Hamlets	Develop and deliver Preventing Violent Extremism program in partnership with Police, criminal justice services and voluntary sector.
Lambeth	Develop a partnership with the police and other agencies to ensure that there are standard procedures for recording and reporting of racial incidents in the borough and the sharing of information.

5. Provide equal opportunities as a municipal employer, service provider and contractor.

Borough	Description
Tower Hamlets	Embed race in the Human Resources Strategy.
	Complete equality impact assessment on all new or revised codes of practice and ensure policies are compliant with equality legislation
	Embed race equality into the staff and new heads of departments induction program
	Promote diversity in the revision of the Learning and Teaching Strategy
	Avoid scheduling training on days of religious observance
	Careers staff are aware of equality legislation and can offer support and advise to students who have faced barriers to employment based on their racial group.
	Introduce diversity analysis to identify trends, disparities and steps to improve representation—every 5 years
	Team plans incorporate relevant diversity and equality objectives and targets.
	Increase view that the Council is a desirable and accessible place to work. Establish compelling employer brand focusing on local community where local people want to work; establish pool of potential candidates and ensure that unsuccessful racialised candidates are encourage to apply for further jobs.

Tower Hamlets (continued)	Make available high quality interpreting and translation services which meet the needs of all service users.
Swindon	Use of ethnic monitoring information to promote equality of employment and removing identified barriers. Scrutinize recruitment process to ensure there's no discrimination or discouraging of applications from BME (Black, Minority, Equality-seeking) community.
Northampton	Recognize that the current workforce doesn't reflect society; encourage job applications from under-represented groups.
	All Council employees receive race equality awareness training. Senior managers responsible for change to policies/practice must show that they have fully considered race equality implications before putting forward comments for such change.
	All commissioning and procurement processes are monitored to take into account equality issues. Contracts are required to deliver effective and appropriate service fairly and equitably.
	Human rights are considered when delivering services to customers and clients.
	Equity implications inform setting of objectives in management and individual appraisals.
Lambeth	To regularly monitor the recruitment and selection process to ensure that the recruitment and selection policy is being adhered to.
	Collect data on: Number of staff in post and their grades, employment tribunals lodged on the grounds of race , employment tribunals where there is a finding against the Council on the grounds of discrimination , Employment Tribunal applications based upon race, which are settled in advance of a hearing, disciplinary capability decisions taken against BME staff and outcomes , grievances lodged by BME staff and those upheld, the impact of restructuring on BME staff (e.g. voluntary redeployed, voluntary severance and redundancies), workforce by race, grade, service area and work patterns, profile and number of job applications and promotion opportunities, attendance of voluntary training courses, dismissals and resignations, patterns of promotion across the Council
	To ensure consistency and fairness in the recruitment process and to increase the proportion of BME groups in senior posts
	Establish processes to ensure ethnic media is used (periodically) for core appointments
	Review and produce the Council's HR policies and procedures to ensure fairness and equity in the Council's Employment Practices and maximise recruitment from the local labour market.

Lambeth (continued)	To provide consistent and fair advice to managers to reduce employment tribunal action and to encourage positive and production working relationships between staff and managers.
	Continue to implement the Employment Tribunal Review Process to review Tribunal cases and make operational / policy recommendations
	Deliver Valuing Diversity training to all staff.
	Managers trained to manage workplace disputes which includes a module relating to racial harassment.
	Formally record and monitor the ethnicity of staff in respect of recruitment and disciplinary cases.
	To carry out ethnic monitoring of staff training applications and the amount of training received
	Where appropriate, take positive action to ensure that the specific training needs of particular ethnic groups are met.

6. Support measures to promote equity in the labour market.

Borough	Description
Tower Hamlets	Career staff provide information equality guidance on the website (links, guidance on equality issues in the workplace e.g. what to look for in a good employer / how to find equality rated employer.
Swindon	<p>Career staff provide information equality guidance on the website (links, guidance on equality issues in the workplace e.g. what to look for in a good employer / how to find equality rated employer.</p> <p>Checklist of how well organizations bidding for major contracts are promoting race equality, e.g.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Compliance with race equality legislation? ○ Breached anti-discrimination legislation in the last 3 years? ○ Subject of formal investigation by the Commission for Racial Equality? Acted on findings? ○ Recruitment, training and promotion guidelines? ○ Encourages racialised groups to apply for jobs?
Northampton	Council understand the local labour market. Employment objectives set based on internal marketing, staff consultation and assessment of local labour market and barriers.

Lambeth	To inform staff of the requirements of the Race Relations (Amendment) Act and their responsibilities by training Lambeth employees on the General Duty.
	Develop an organisation wide training programme encompassing Management Training, Customer Care training, and Staff Inductions that outlines what the general duty is, and specific requirements of the Act in addition to allowing Managers to explore their responsibility to eliminate unlawful discrimination, promote equal opportunities and good race relations between people of different racial groups.

7. Support measures to challenge racism and discrimination and promote diversity and equal opportunity in housing.

Borough	Description
Swindon	Carried out Impact Needs Requirements Assessments in all major functions. Staff attend meetings with Race Coalition and Equality Advisory Forum to discuss recruitment and service delivery. Develop robust Equalities Action Plan in consultation with stakeholders to be monitored by stakeholders.
	Equalities Group, chaired by the Head of Service (Housing) ensures that teams in his/her Directorate receive regular briefings on equalities legislation issues and initiatives. Housing played lead role in developing new Harassment Policy and has 11 officers trained to deal with reports of racial or other harassment
	Front-line services: customer surveys carried out on regular basis to ensure building maintenance is meeting needs of tenants; Recreation Services introduced Community Coach for BME children; a multi-sport session is held at local field and is open to all. Monthly meetings held with management team to monitor access issues.

8. Involve citizens by giving them a voice in anti-racism initiatives and decision-making.

Borough	Description
Tower Hamlets	<p>Involvement of communities, staff and stakeholders in the design, review and scrutiny of services and employment practices via self-organized staff forums, external forums, Consultation Calendar outlining key active consultations with focussed work on specific diversity and equality issues</p> <p>Council members provide community leadership on diversity and equality. The Group undertakes learning and development on community leadership and as an open space to explore diversity and equality issues faced by the Council Deputy Leader is the lead for Diversity and Equalities Group which includes Council Members</p> <p>The needs and views of equality target groups are effectively reflected in local decision making and service review mechanisms i.e. review governance structures of the Tower Hamlets Partnership.</p> <p>Improve consultation and engagement with young people across Council and partnership services. Produce Participation Toolkit to support services to involve young people in a meaningful way; increase the participation of children and young people in decision making community life.</p> <p>Support and improve access to open spaces e.g. improving public places and spaces, clean streets, accessibility.</p> <p>Increase level of participation in leisure activities by under-represented groups. Strategic review of indoor leisure/sports facilities re programs and future developments.</p>
Swindon	<p>Member of the public can give views on the Council's race equality performance by going directly to the Directorate involved or making a complaint, observation or compliment through the Customer Feedback Procedure. All comments guaranteed careful consideration and will receive written response in 10 days.</p>
Northampton	<p>Consult with communities through e.g. the Council, Racial Equality Council and the Race Coalition – consult with racialized communities to see how well the Council is serving them.</p>
Lambeth	<p>To continually support the review of existing consultation mechanisms through communication and training.</p>

Lambeth (continued)	To provide training/guidance as necessary on consulting with traditionally uninvolved and excluded groups.
	Produce best practice case studies of what consultation has worked well in Lambeth so that staff undertaking consultation are aware of and follow best practice in consulting with their target communities.
	Develop a BME Citizen's into Public Life Programme to increase involvement of BME communities into civic life.
	Organise and run democratic awareness raising sessions with local community groups.

9. Support measures to challenge racism and discrimination and promote diversity and equal opportunity in the education sector and in other forms of learning.

Borough	Description
Tower Hamlets	Extend "No Place for Hate" communications campaign by incorporating messages in Community Plan marketing campaign. Train 10 Youth hate crime champions to deliver awareness workshops with youth/educational and community groups.
	Police services provide: a dedicated Race and Faith Crime Worker; initiate a Hate Crime Research Project; a 24-hour Hate Crime Reporting Line; a multi-agency Hate Incidents Panel to share information.
Swindon	<p>Council has issued "Equal Opportunities in Education: A guide to promoting Racial Equality in Swindon Schools" for ensuring race equality in:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Pupil attainment and progress ○ Curriculum teaching and learning (including language and cultural needs) ○ Promoting good race relations the school and local community ○ Staff recruitment and career development ○ Schools' values ○ Pupil behaviour, discipline and exclusion ○ Racial harassment and bullying ○ Admission and transfer procedures

Swindon (continued)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Membership in the governing body ○ Involving parents and the community in the school <p>Monitor by racial group: staff postings; applicants for employment, training and promotions For schools of 150 or more, monitor number of staff:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Receiving training ○ Benefiting, or suffering a detriment, as a result of performance assessment procedures ○ Involved in grievance procedures ○ Subject to disciplinary procedures ○ Ending employment with these schools
---------------------	--

10. Promote respect, understanding and appreciation of cultural diversity and the inclusion of Aboriginal and racialized communities into the cultural fabric of the municipality.

Borough	Description
Tower Hamlets	Celebrate diversity and promote cohesion. Work with 3 rd party / private sector on events / festivals timetabled through the year.
	Promote and support community cohesion among children and young people. “Tolerance in Diversity” – facilitate short peer led projects themed on discrimination and hate crimes
	Enhance understanding of the profile and needs of new communities through work with the Refugee and New Residents Forum. Develop work program for the Refugee and New Residents Forum
Northhampton	Internal, external and partnership communication strategies designed to promote good relations across all local communities.
	Work to balance diverse, but sometimes conflicting interests in the locality.

The primary emphasis of the U.K experience has been to develop institutional frameworks, particularly required management systems and accountability mechanisms, aimed at ensuring anti-racist work is being implemented with commitment and community involvement.

PRACTICE EXAMPLES

Commitment # 1: Increase vigilance against systemic and individual racism and discrimination.

City	Population	Initiative/Program Name	Description
Kalamazoo, Michigan ¹	77,145	Summit on Racism	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Annual day-long event produced by two subgroups who are each focused on the areas of employment and education • “Aimed at dismantling institutional racism in the Kalamazoo area” • Past achievements of the summit include increased community awareness about racism and new programs to promote equality
United Kingdom ²		Defeating Organised Racial Hatred	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Based on strong leadership from local authorities • Initiatives used include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Building anti-racist alliances through conferences and meetings, building cross-party opposition to political racism through statements, election compacts, community newspapers, leaf-letting, council free papers and media communications, working in partnership to combat far right messages and researching and publishing action guidance • Information pack covers: election issues, case studies, legal initiatives, Islamophobia, anti-Semitism, etc.
Manchester, England ³	464,200	Agenda 2010: Improving Race Equality	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Re-evaluate the implications of City Council’s policies and practices for black communities and to develop fair, equal and just systems

Tewkesbury, Gloucestershire, UK ⁴	76,431	Race Equality Scheme 2008-2011	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ensures that race equality issues influence impact assessments • Raises awareness of equality impact on service delivery • Raises public awareness in all community groups of the Council's commitment to eliminate discrimination against race • Demonstrates progress made as a result of the policy • Ensures the continuing relevance of the policy
Ellesmere Port and Neston Borough, UK ⁵	82,000	Race Equality Action Plan 2008-2011	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Publishes a Race Equality Scheme • Continues to provide equality and diversity training • Arranges training for relevant staff on the general and specific duties of the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000
Lewisham, London, UK ⁶	248,922	Race Equality Scheme 2008-2011 Action Plan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Promotes learning and development programme to every part of the organization • Continues to monitor and review take up of learning and development opportunities • Ensures managers encourage staff to take up learning and development opportunities
Newcastle-Under-Lyme, London, UK ⁷	73,944	Newcastle-Under-Lyme Borough Council Race Equality Scheme 2008-2011	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Publishes completed Equality Impact Assessment and the results of assessments and consultation on the Borough Council's website • Publishes corporate guidelines for gathering ethnicity data in relation to service usage and customer feedback • Reviews existing communication mechanisms taking into account accessibility and inclusivity • Explores options for joint consultation with other strategic partners • Provides Equality Impact Assessment training to all relevant Officers
Staffordshire Borough, UK ⁸	107,700	Race Equality Scheme 2008-2011	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develops racial incident reporting guidance to encompass all hate crimes and ensure awareness of hate incidents

Saskatoon, Saskatchewan ⁹	202,340	AUMA Welcoming and Inclusive Communities Toolkit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Monitors: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Rates of employment and retention for ethnocultural groups ○ Underemployment by ethnocultural groups in regards to work in jobs below skills and training ○ Public awareness and understanding through perception surveys ○ The effect of City of Saskatoon cross-cultural awareness programs ○ Best practices research from agencies and other cities
Hamilton, Ontario ⁹	504,559	AUMA Welcoming and Inclusive Communities Toolkit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A guide to assess and respond to threats to the community's sense of safety and security • Aim is to reduce myths and false impressions about diverse groups through public education
Halifax, Nova Scotia ⁹	372,679	AUMA Welcoming and Inclusive Communities Toolkit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Promotes the Community and Race Relations Policy to all its civic employees and elected officials • Promotes the Community and Race Relations Policy to the Community at large • Promotes Municipal services and programs to its Diverse Communities
Darebin, Australia ⁹	128,067	AUMA Welcoming and Inclusive Communities Toolkit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ensures that community surveys and consultations include appropriate representative sampling of the City's culturally and linguistically diverse communities • Seeks annual community views about City Council's performance in managing diversity and the community's attitude about living in a diverse community • Conducts regular events (seminars, forums) which aim to educate, inform, and expand awareness, knowledge, and understanding of the City's staff and community on issues pertinent to multicultural affairs

Commitment #2: Monitor racism and discrimination in the community more broadly as well as municipal actions taken to address racism and discrimination.

City	Population	Initiative/Program Name	Description
Waterloo, Iowa ¹	68,747	Cedar Valley Diversity Appreciation Team (C.V.D.A.T.)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • CVDAT sponsors study circle program wherein 5-15 people meet to discuss and learn about racism • Graduates of study circle go on to join roundtable(s) to define problems, form plans and take action against racism • Roundtables focus on various subtopics (i.e. schools, business and economics, hate crimes, health policies and criminal justice)
Reading Borough, Berkshire, UK ¹⁰	145,000	Reading Borough Council Race Equality Scheme	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Existing policies are monitored for adverse impact • Individual directorates and services routinely monitor service take up by ethnicity and analyze the results for use in all decision and policy-making • The results of assessments, consultations and monitoring are publicly published in a variety of ways: direct feedback to participating individuals or groups, through forums and meetings and through the Council's consultation web page
Manchester, England ³	464,200	Agenda 2010: Improving Race Equality	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develops policies and strategies that recognise how they impact differentially on different groups and make them flexible so that they can shift as necessary

Tewkesbury, Gloucestershire, UK ⁴	76,431	Race Equality Scheme 2008-2011	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Puts in place the required procedures and mechanisms in order to maintain race equality in all services, policies and functions • Carries out Equality Impact Assessments in order to work towards mainstreaming Equality Impact Assessments into our general work practices • Annual reporting and dissemination of employment monitoring information • Reviews guidelines for undertaking Equality Impact Assessments
Waltham Forest, London, England ¹¹	221,747	London Borough of Waltham Forest Race Equality Scheme 2009-2012	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Undertakes an initial Equality Impact Assessment of the Aiming High for Disabled Children (AHDC) Implementation Plan • Builds a detailed picture of access to mainstream services (e.g. out of school activities and clubs) and take up from Black, Asian, and minority ethnic (BAME) community children with disabilities • Surveys current mechanisms for involving BAME children with disabilities and their families in the planning, development and evaluation of services • Reviews Equality Impact Assessment (EIA) and actions to assess outcomes

Lewisham, London, UK ⁶	248,922	Race Equality Scheme 2008-2011 Action Plan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Analyses recruitment outcomes to understand the impact of recruitment processes on minority ethnic applicants and develop actions to address any disadvantage identified Reviews acting up, deputising and secondment practices to ensure equal access to development opportunities Improves recording, monitoring and analysis of hate crimes reported to public sector agencies “Exploring with Victim Support” and similar community based organisations the most effective and efficient way of measuring satisfaction Regularly monitors and reviews take up and satisfaction of services and uses the results to inform commissioning services to ensure the diversity of need is met
Richmond upon Thames, London, UK ¹²	172,335	Action Plan for Richmond Race Equality Partnership: Sept 2004-Dec 2005	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Works closely with Community Planning Partnership Forum and other key groups to share development of race equality Schemes and Service Plans Annual reporting of equalities monitoring analysis Collation of needs analysis by partner agencies “Celebration of diversity” events
Newcastle-Under-Lyme, London, UK ⁷	73,944	Newcastle-Under-Lyme Borough Council Race Equality Scheme 2008-2011	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Equalities Steering Group oversees and monitors the implementation of a Race Equality Action Plan Extracts race equality actions from Equality Impact Assessments Ensures equality actions available for scrutiny and public consultation

Staffordshire Borough, UK ⁸	107,700	Race Equality Scheme 2008-2011	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Eliminates unlawful racial discrimination by: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Ensuring that no existing or potential employee or service user will receive less favourable treatment than another on the grounds of their ethnic group ○ Encouraging applicants from all members of the community ○ Monitors take up of our services and employment profile • Monitors service users by ethnicity in order to identify whether services are being used by the whole community and to identify gaps in service
Saskatoon, Saskatchewan ⁹	202,340	AUMA Welcoming and Inclusive Communities Toolkit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Monitors reported incidents of racism from organizations, such as the Human Rights Commission
Brisbane, Australia ⁹	1,945,639	AUMA Welcoming & Inclusive Communities Toolkit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ensures that websites reflect City Council's commitment to multiculturalism and provides easy links to multicultural information • Translates key Council information into an identified number of community languages • Develops appropriate multilingual signage in the inner city to reflect Brisbane's diversity • Offers telephone interpreter services
Halifax, Nova Scotia ⁹	372,679	AUMA Welcoming and Inclusive Communities Toolkit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Integrate antiracism and multi-cultural content into existing, ongoing and future training sessions for staff and elected representatives • Prohibit the use of all municipal facilities from individuals and groups that may violate or promote the violations of the rights • Encourage and support the development of programs and projects that promote harmony among its Diverse Communities

Commitment #3: Inform and support individuals who experience racism and discrimination.

City	Population	Initiative/Program Name	Description
Reading Borough, Berkshire, UK ¹⁰	145,000	Race Equality Scheme	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Made a commitment to maximize use of services and to make sure citizens are aware of services • Provide information about services in plain language, and in varying formats and languages depending on need • The Council's Customer Care training and guidance includes training on how to provide assistance to those who have difficulty reading and speaking English • The Council has an in house interpretation and translation service • The Council has a designated Equalities Officer to whom enquiries and complaints can be addressed • All managers are responsible for monitoring the impact of their policies and functions on race relations
Manchester, England ³	464,200	Agenda 2010: Improving Race Equality	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Improves access to health and social care for the black and ethnic minority population of Manchester • Develops and nurtures an ethnically diverse workforce that reflects the cultural identity of Manchester's population • Co-ordinates planning, at a strategic level, to meet the needs of black and ethnic minority communities

Waltham Forest, London, England ¹¹	223,200	London Borough of Waltham Forest Race Equality Scheme 2009-2012	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increases the take up of direct payments by people experiencing Mental Health issues • Creates greater awareness to help tackle the negative attitudes to people experiencing mental health issues within some minority communities (particularly Black and Minority Ethnic) and provide information on the availability of improved services and support • Improves engagement by Patient Advice and Liaison Service and Trust Specific Public Involvement Forums with local BAME Communities • Undertakes an equality impact assessment on the cultural strategy to identify opportunities to positively impact on BAME people with mental health issues by participation in leisure and culture activities • Provides a user friendly way of setting out services available to older people including older BAME people
Nanaimo, British Columbia ⁹	78,692	AUMA Welcoming and Inclusive Communities Toolkit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provides information on available options for action when an incident of hate or racism occurs in the community • Makes referrals to other community agencies for assistance as appropriate • Partners with victims to take appropriate action when requested

Ellesmere Port and Neston Borough, UK ⁵	82,000	A Race Equality Scheme (Action Plan) for Ellesmere Port and Neston Borough Council 2008-2011	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ensures that the public have access to information about the services provided by Ellesmere Port and Neston Borough Council Ensures that Ellesmere Port and Neston Borough Council's commitment to Diversity and Equality (including Race Equality) is regularly publicised • Ensures that the council uses robust Equality and Diversity monitoring arrangements through out its operations and service provision
Newcastle-Under-Lyme, London, UK ⁷	73,944	Newcastle-Under-Lyme Borough Council Race Equality Scheme 2008-2011	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Identifies and allocates resources to enable fulfillment of equality actions
Broxtowe, Nottinghamshire, UK ¹³	107,570	Broxtowe Borough Council Housing Race Equality Policy	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Borough Council collates reports of incidents regularly and reports to Resources Select Committee every six months • The Council deals with racial harassment reports in accordance with the relevant standard procedures
Manchester, England ³	464,200	Agenda 2010: Improving Race Equality	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Creates partnerships with the black and ethnic minority voluntary sector • Increases the black and ethnic minority representation on governing bodies • Further develops programmes for learning and other school based mentors from the black and ethnic minority communities • Reviews and revises the teacher training programme • Develops mechanisms to engage black and ethnic minority young people who have been excluded or are at risk of exclusion

Commitment #4: Support policing services in their efforts to be exemplary institutions in combating racism and discrimination.

City	Population	Initiative/Program Name	Description
Ireland ²	4,239,848	PULSE	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Since 1999, the Irish criminal justice system has instigated a crime counting system, PULSE, which is also able to disaggregate crime data with a 'racist motive' • 2003 was the first year in which racially motivated incidents were clearly defined to members of the police force, and recorded through PULSE
Denmark ²	5,497,525	PET Police Monitoring System	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A police monitoring system which compiles a list of racially motivated crime, including racist violence • Provides police training to standardize statistic collection system
Manchester, England ³	464,200	Agenda 2010: Improving Race Equality	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Aim is to reduce the levels of racially motivated crimes and incidents • Increases the level of reporting of racial harassment and subsequent action by the police
Hackney, London, UK ¹⁴	207,000	Corporate Equality Plan 2006-2009	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Aim is to eliminate unlawful racial discrimination • Works with police and other agencies to tackle incidents of racial discrimination • Takes an active role in crime and disorder partnerships • Develops new work with multi-agency Racial Incidents Forum to develop policies aimed at tackling racist crime, and lead initiatives such as research on Islamophobic crime

Broxtowe, Nottinghamshire, UK ¹³	107,570	Broxtowe Borough Council Housing Race Equality Policy	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Borough Council works closely with the police on the collection of intelligence and evidence, and in pursuing prosecutions for racially aggravated offences
York Region, Ontario ¹⁵	933,350	Police Advisory Council	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A volunteer advisory group comprised of approximately twenty-five residents or other stakeholders of York Region representing ethno-cultural, geographical and age diversity • Meets bi-monthly with the Chief with a view to providing informed advice on a variety of matters, including awareness of race relations, perceptions of social equality, assistance in formulating budgetary proposals, specific initiatives and the delivery of specialized programs • Council provides feedback to the community on policing perspectives, facilitates both community awareness programs and community responses to public safety and policing issues, takes every opportunity to remain current with community and policing concerns, and is prepared to guide community members on appropriate procedures to follow should specific concerns arise
Toronto, Ontario ¹⁶	1,162,635	Human Rights Project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A three-year collaborative approach to incorporate human rights and anti-racism perspectives in all policing activities • aims to develop tools and processes in identifying and eliminating discrimination from the recruitment to the retirement of TPS members, and in the delivery of services by the TPS to the larger community • divided into three phases: Phase 1: identifying and prioritizing issues, Phase 2: developing and prioritizing strategies, and Phase 3: implementation with monitoring

Hamilton, Ontario ⁹	504,559	AUMA Welcoming and Inclusive Communities Toolkit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Trains the police and other security services to respond fairly, with respect and balance, to visible minorities and the broader community • Ensures that there is minority representation in police services
Saskatoon, Saskatchewan ⁹	202,340	AUMA Welcoming and Inclusive Communities Toolkit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Monitors police statistics and reported incidents of racism

Commitment #5: Provide equal opportunities as a municipal employer, service provider and contractor.

City	Population	Initiative/Program Name	Description
Seattle, Washington ¹	56,3374	Race and Social Justice Initiative (R.S.J.I.)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Seattle Department of Neighborhoods created the RSJI Neighborhood Matching Fund Project as a pilot program to respond to the issue of citizen engagement, community building, and reducing disproportionality among communities of color” • All city departments created plans based upon these concerns to dismantle institutionalized racism and support multiculturalism
		Undoing Institutional Racism (U.I.R.)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Multicultural, multi-racial program which aims to undo racism through community advocacy and organizational development • Focuses on internal department policies and procedures and assists in the development of community-led programs
Salisbury, North Carolina ¹	26,462	Multiculturalism Training Program	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Training provided for all city employees to recognize, understand and appreciate others' and one's own culture(s) • Goals: promotes cooperation and a pluralistic community, provides a platform for discussion of race and diversity issues, identifies institutional racism and other forms of systemic oppression and discrimination, encourages open communication

Reading Borough, Berkshire, UK ³	145,000	Race Equality Scheme	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Borough Council works from the perspective that all of its policies and functions are potentially relevant to the general duty to promote race equality • Race Equality Scheme has been developed as an overarching scheme setting out the principles and practices applicable throughout the council, irrespective of department or an employee's role
Newcastle-Under-Lyme, London, UK ⁷	73,944	Newcastle-Under-Lyme Borough Council Race Equality Scheme 2008-2011	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Completed Equality Impact Assessments on policies, strategies and services in accordance with corporate priority list • Monitors ethnic make up of the Borough Council's workforce • Monitors the ethnicity of staff that are involved in grievance and disciplinary or cease their employment with the Borough Council

Staffordshire Borough, UK ⁸	107,700	Race Equality Scheme 2008-2011	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ensures employees receive equality, diversity, and cultural awareness training • Promotes equality in the delivery of services in access, provision, and employment • Ensures that race equality is embedded throughout strategic objectives and corporate plans • Ensures that service users and employees are treated with dignity and respect at all times regardless of their ethnic group, without unlawful discrimination • Seeks to ensure that when the Borough Council commissions services, works in partnership or procures goods or services, that the organisations worked with understand, adhere to and practice equal opportunity policies • Ensures marketing materials, literature, and websites reflect the diversity of East Staffordshire and promotes positive images of diverse communities
Broxtowe, Nottinghamshire, UK ¹³	107,570	Broxtowe Borough Council Housing Race Equality Policy	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Borough Council provides training as appropriate, to employees and elected members, e.g. general diversity training
Saskatoon, Saskatchewan ⁹	202,340	AUMA Welcoming and Inclusive Communities Toolkit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Monitors the composition of City Council and committees by ethno-cultural background • Monitors increases in participation on decision-making bodies based on the demographics in neighbourhood profiles • Monitors and reports the extent to which the City has become a leader in achieving the outcomes of the policy within its own organization

Hamilton, Ontario ⁹	504,559	AUMA Welcoming and Inclusive Communities Toolkit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The City of Hamilton aims to be an employer that reflects the diversity of the community
--------------------------------	---------	--	--

Commitment #6: Support measures to promote equity in the labour market.

City	Population	Initiative/Program Name	Description
Reading Borough, Berkshire, UK ³	145,000	Reading Borough Council Race Equality Scheme	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Council uses the National Best Value Performance Indicator (NBVPI) definitions to calculate the numbers of employees in the workforce and in the local community • Data collected (categorized by ethnicity): workforce as representative of the local community (staff in post), recruitment (applicants for jobs), training and development, performance appraisal, employment procedures • Also gather information and analyse the results from: a)grievances; b)disciplinary action; c)performance appraisal which results in benefits and sanctions; d)training; e)dismissals and other reasons for leaving • Conducts a staff survey to monitor a range of staff perceptions (e.g. equality and fair treatment at work) • The Learning, Workforce Development & Equalities Manager uses the full range of data to produce an employment equality audit and propose corporate targets

Waltham Forest, London, England ¹¹	221,747	London Borough of Waltham Forest Race Equality Scheme 2009-2012	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Updates the Enterprise and Employment Strategy with specific reference and proposals to address black, Asian, and minority ethnic (BAME) communities unemployment for groups that suffer greatest disadvantage, e.g. South Asian, Caribbean and West African women • Offers a robust programme for accessing employment & skills with emphasis on long term unemployment, lone parents, persons with disabilities, and ex-offenders within BAME communities • Outreach work will be tailored around niche areas of need and includes key agencies that have a direct link with key groups i.e. BAME communities • Undertakes an Equality Impact Assessment on the Strategy for supporting businesses through the downturn to identify gaps and opportunities to better support BAME businesses in the area • Supports and advises businesses and entrepreneurs to consider innovative ways of working, new trades and products as part of the growth agenda • Attracts and encourages BAME businesses to tender for smaller/medium sized opportunities
Newcastle-Under-Lyme, London, UK ⁷	73,944	Newcastle-Under-Lyme Borough Council Race Equality Scheme 2008-2011	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Monitors the ethnicity of all applicants for employment vacancies using corporate guidelines • Publishes results of all ethnicity monitoring in relation to employment issues • Provides consistent and appropriate diversity awareness training as part of corporate induction for all staff • Regular review of corporate diversity awareness training in line with new legislation and good practice

Lewisham, London, UK ⁶	249,922	Race Equality Scheme 2008-2011 Action Plan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Uses the views and experiences of staff to inform personnel and develop policy • Investigates and takes action, as appropriate, on any adverse impact in such areas as absence, reorganisations/redeployment, disciplinary and capability identified through monitoring • Wider promotion of the management and leadership development programmes • Ensures managers encourage and support their staff to consider management and leadership development training • Encourages staff to apply for management and leadership development programmes
Corby, UK ¹⁷	53,500	Corby Borough Council Revised Race Equality Scheme 2008-2011	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Addresses and takes action in areas of under representation of black and minority ethnic groups in the workforce • Promote a working environment free from bullying, harassment or discrimination • Works closely with staff and recognised Trade Union representatives to promote race relations • Works with the recognised Trade Union to identify and respond quickly and effectively to eradicate any barriers to reporting an incident • Ensures all current and future employees are treated with fairness and given equal opportunity with regard to recruitment and promotion

Staffordshire Borough, UK ⁸	107,700	Race Equality Scheme 2008-2011	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ensures that equality and diversity training meets all legislative requirements with equality embedded within the program • Ensures that no existing or potential employee or service user will receive less favourable treatment than another on the grounds of their ethnic group • System of staff support networks and positive action training • Development of an engagement strategy and customer service strategy
Brisbane, Australia ⁹	1,945,639	AUMA Welcoming & Inclusive Communities Toolkit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provides recruitment, support and career development to people from culturally and linguistically diverse backgrounds • Increases engagement and establishes links between City Council and Brisbane's ethnic businesses • Develops partnerships with key stakeholders including government agencies to enhance participation of people from culturally and linguistically diverse backgrounds in local economic development • Contributes to City Council's knowledge/data in relation to multicultural business within Brisbane • Enhances Council's relationship with international students, to build economic development opportunities

Northern Ireland ¹⁸	1,775,000	Taking Action During Anti-Racist Workplace Week	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A social partnership initiative with key social partner organizations i.e. employers, trade unions and Black and minority ethnic groups • Intended to raise awareness around the issue of racism in the workplace and to encourage employers to develop strategies to achieve equality of opportunity in a culturally diverse workforce • Web-site provides a tool-kit of materials that can used for the week, e.g. training, reviewing policies and provisions and other ideas
Manchester, England ³	464,200	Agenda 2010: Improving Race Equality	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increases access to employment for black and ethnic minority communities • Improves and increases employment support employment information and for black and ethnic minority communities • Improves employment training for black and ethnic minority communities

Commitment #7: Support measures to challenge racism and discrimination and promote diversity and equal opportunity in housing.

City	Population	Initiative/Program Name	Description
Havering Borough, East London, U.K. ¹⁹	230,100	Pre-tenancy workshops	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • New residents are invited to a pre-tenancy workshop to help them understand their responsibilities and provide information in an informal setting and with other new residents • Used to promote resident involvement and it complements the sign up process
Lewisham, London, UK ⁶	248,922	Race Equality Scheme 2008-2011 Action Plan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Builds on improved data collection system in housing services that leads to improvements for all tenants • Ensures all areas under review carry out an equalities impact assessments as the basis for evidence given to the Autumn Equalities Summit • Develops a three-year action plan as an output of the summit
Broxtowe, Nottinghamshire, UK ¹³	107,570	Broxtowe Borough Council Housing Race Equality Policy	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Council will advise landlords and landladies, hostel and hotel owners, or managers that it is unlawful to discriminate on racial grounds • Ethnic record keeping systems will be maintained to identify who has been registered, has received housing, or has been rehoused • Monitoring reports will be available to tenants and local people for public inspection • The Council will arrange safe, good quality temporary housing for victims and witnesses of racial harassment if they fear for their immediate safety • A permanent transfer will be offered if there is no prospect of a safe return

Richmond upon Thames, London, UK ¹²	172,335	Action Plan for Richmond Race Equality Partnership: Sept 2004-Dec 2005	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develop and appoint post of Racial Harassment development Worker, and a borough wide strategy to tackle, prevent, and monitor racist incidents • Racial Harassment Development Worker to work closely with Housing
Tower Hamlets Council, London, UK ²⁰	220,500	Race Equality Scheme 2009-2012	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tackles the disproportionate impact of overcrowding and shortage of social housing on Black and other minority ethnic (BME) communities • Works to reduce levels of overcrowding; works in partnership with Tower Hamlets Borough council to minimise the wider impacts of overcrowding • Works to improve understanding of the future housing needs and demand of BME communities in the borough and ensures that they effectively inform the planning of future housing provision • Ensures there is equal access to social housing for BME communities facing language barriers or who may find it more difficult to understand the system • Improve understanding of the extent and impact of homelessness on different BME communities and ensure that they inform strategies to address homelessness in the borough.
Epsom and Ewell Borough ²¹	72,400	Black and Minority Ethnic Housing Strategy 2002/2003	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Works with partners to ensure that BME tenants are consulted on all aspects of their work and to consult and incorporate the views of BME households in the development of the Housing Strategy • Facilitates the development of a BME tenants forum where demand is identified and/or ensure BME households have the opportunity to participate in residents' associations

Tunbridge Wells Borough ²²	56,500	Ethnic Housing Strategy and Action Plan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Undertakes research into general housing needs • Sustains equality of access to affordable housing through reviews of policies • Updates information on housing services in appropriate languages, and highlight use of the Council's translation service
Ontario, Canada ²³	12,794,000	Housing Policy	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Promotes and enforces the right to live in and enjoy housing free from discrimination • Developed policy on human rights and rental housing, following extensive research and consultation with tenants, housing providers, decision-makers and other partners • Provides tools, practical scenarios and information that can be applied to everyday situations, so that human rights problems can be eliminated quickly or prevented from happening in the first place

Commitment #8: Involve citizens by giving them a voice in anti-racism initiatives and decision-making.

City	Population	Initiative/Program Name	Description
Dayton, Ohio ¹	16,6179	Dayton Dialogue on Race Relations (DDRR)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dialogues held in various locations throughout the city, such as community centers, churches, businesses, homes and colleges • Encourages honest conversations between people of all races and ethnicities, especially members of the black and white communities • Conversations usually revolve around issues of race, reconciliation and responsibility
Gainesville, Florida ¹	95,447	Issues Beneath the Surface, Race Summit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Two-day interactive summit with various breakout sessions • Afterward, attendees formed action teams “to meet over the following 18 months to continue the discussion begun at the summit” • Breakout sessions included the topics of: “manifestations of racism, analyzing internalized oppression, developing a power analysis, race based disparities, and understanding white privilege”
Avondale, Arizona ¹	35,883	Avondale Race Equality Week 2006	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • City-sponsored bone marrow screening, prompted by shortage of donors for people of Hispanic and African American descent • Held “Fair Housing Fair” to address discriminatory housing practices • Hosted day-long event, WorldFest, which celebrated and educated residents about different cultures

Stockton, California ¹	243,771	Racial Harmony and Fairness Task Force	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Task force “consists of 26 top-level administrators of school districts, religious agencies, city and county offices, business groups, and health organizations” who address and attempt to solve racial, religious and cultural tensions • Hosts open forums to address diversity issues and hear presentations on experiences with racism around which policies are developed • Publishes column in local daily newspaper which highlights different cultures in city
Sarasota, Florida ¹	52,715	Sarasota Openly Addresses Racism (S.O.A.R.)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Partnered with local NAACP and Interfaith/Interracial Council • Supported by neighborhood and community development agency • Annual symposium for residents to speak out against racism • Sponsors and develops on-going study circles, mayor's annual prayer breakfast, newsletter, website and youth component of program
New Britain, Connecticut ¹	71,538	Conversations on Race	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Facilitates dialogues between community residents, city, human rights and opportunities commission, local YWCA, a private foundation, local bank, churches, Spanish-speakers • Based on “study circles” model • A coordinator gathers action plans compiled in study circles which are then sent to the local government for implementation • City publishes newsletter in English, Spanish and Polish and sponsors presentations which encourage minority groups to become active members of community leadership by serving on boards and commissions

Flint, Michigan ¹	140,761	Flint Area Citizens to End Racism (F.A.C.T.E.R.)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Program involves residents in discussion to facilitate development and implementation of an anti-racism vision and strategy • Three goals: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ To better understand community perceptions of intergroup issues ○ To increase the active involvement of a group of residents to form a common agenda for change ○ Create mechanisms that facilitate ongoing community participation to address these issues • Local cultural center holds anti-racism events • Public library presents lecture series on topic
Hampton, Virginia ¹	146,437	Citizens' Unity Commission (C.U.C.)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Formed by city council, CUC is comprised of 20 citizens from different ethnic, racial and age groups • City council created Ad Hoc Leadership Group to inform and make a recommendation to the CUC about any incident which threatens to be divisive in the community • Formed to help community appreciate diversity

Omaha, Nebraska ¹	390,007	Commission on Race and Community Relations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Three citizens of different racial and economic backgrounds appointed by mayor to co-chair Commission • 186 business people, community activists and religious leaders invited to participate • Divided into seven committees which researched “race relations in law enforcement/judiciary, education, employment, housing, health care, economic development, and media” and made recommendations to mayor's office • Goal to “produce constructive, fact-based recommendations for progressive, substantive and lasting change” • Mayor issued an Executive Order, making a pledge on the city's behalf to treat people without racism/discrimination and challenged businesses and other organizations to do same • 25+ businesses released their own pledges against racism
Tucson, Arizona ¹	486,699	Tucson Racial Justice Program	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Began with Leadership Registry, a database of interested and qualified people available from all segments of community, whose role it is to ensure that local boards and commissions are ethnically representative • Effort to raise awareness of “unconscious racism” so participants can “unlearn” it • Over 15,000 individuals touched through program's unlearning racism workshops • American Psychological Association and Kellogg Foundation Valuing Diversity Award in 2001

Reading Borough, Berkshire, UK ¹⁰	145,000	Reading Borough Council Race Equality Scheme	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The community and voluntary sector are frequently consulted with and are represented on a number of boards • A variety of methodologies are used in order to consult with the community: boards, steering and working groups with community participation, surveys, focus groups, consultation events, discussion groups, leaflet drops etc.
Manchester, England ³	464,200	Agenda 2010: Improving Race Equality	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Partnership will focus on results in the key priority areas identified by black and ethnic minority communities: health, crime, education and employment • The City Council works with all sorts of agencies towards a community strategy to promote the economic, social and environmental well-being of the City • Gives Manchester's black and ethnic communities an opportunity to shape and influence that strategy
Staffordshire Borough, UK ⁸	107,700	Race Equality Scheme 2008-2011	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Promotes good relations between people from different racial groups by: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Enabling and encouraging all communities to participate in the democratic process ○ Engaging with communities and involving them in the design and delivery of services ○ Working with communities to identify barriers to cohesion and working together to promote inclusion • Achieves more meaningful engagement with organizations and groups across Staffordshire • Gives the community a greater say on the services provided and raises issues of concern, e.g. through consultation

Lewisham, London, UK ⁶	248,922	Race Equality Scheme 2008-2011 Action Plan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Encourages greater involvement of pupils, parents, and community groups when developing strategies • Assesses needs and works in partnership with Lewisham College and Lewisham schools to meet these needs • Targets youth whose views are under-represented and develops processes to enable more effective consultation and feedback • Improves management information services including ethnic monitoring • Ensures representatives from the community are involved in formal planning processes • Offers support and training to community reps to ensure effective representation • Uses the results to help develop an inclusion plan and an anti-racist framework
Hamilton, Ontario ⁹	504,559	AUMA Welcoming and Inclusive Communities Toolkit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Housing, health, education and social services to be more accessible by reducing barriers identified in past consultations by community partners

Commitment #9: Support measures to challenge racism and discrimination and promote diversity and equal opportunity in the education sector and in other forms of learning.

City	Population	Initiative/Program Name	Description
Clarksburg, West Virginia ¹	16,743	Civil Rights Team Project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Facilitated through schools and community groups • Designed to educate youth on topics of diversity and tolerance • The teams are groups of high school students from each grade who meet throughout the school year and work with local civil rights groups to organize activities and events, i.e. Racial Equality Week, the Kindness and Justice Challenge and other volunteer opportunities
Tukwila, Washington ¹	17,181	Free Expressions Project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Youth-oriented and part of National League of Cities' Campaign to Promote Racial Justice • City joined with Superintendent of Schools to introduce project in city's high schools • Original pieces of artwork that focus on expressing personal insights into racism are created by students after they attend interactive workshops exploring the deeper issues of racism

Manchester, Connecticut ¹	54,740	Manchester Study Circles on Race Relations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Collaborative project between Manchester Interracial Council and Manchester Area Conference of Churches • In the 2000-01 school year, six action teams with study circles of 8-10 grade 9 students, moderated by two facilitators, met over a five week period • At the end of the project, the teams meet at the Action Forum to share experiences and make recommendations on the improvement of race relations in their area • Students attended various workshops on different topics: personal identity, family history, stereotyping and designing action plans • Plan to make participation in this program a high school graduation requirement
Boston, Massachusetts ¹	589,141	Peace Games	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In first 8 years, the program served 7,500 children, 1,500 family members and 1,000 volunteers • \$1.5 million annual budget shared by federal government, foundations, individuals and corporations • Teaches young students (K – grade 8) peacemaking skills (i.e. cooperation, communication and conflict resolution) in class • Weekly classes planned and taught by volunteers from Americorps and local college • Participants (students) create community service projects to keep neighborhoods safer • Each year ends with city-wide Peace Games Festival • Also offers: after-school program, monthly newsletter, parent-to-parent Family Leader Program, a teen program wherein Peace Games graduates mentor younger kids, and college leader internship program

Nashville, Tennessee ¹	569,891	Nashville Coalition Against Racism	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dialogue on race and ethnic relations with participants from public and private spheres • Training provided by Vanderbilt University and St. Thomas Hospital • National Conference handles outreach and promotion • “Offers technical assistance including the formation of citizen discussion groups,” from which ideas are compiled by the Urban League before putting them to action • Some resultant ideas: develop multicultural curriculum for public schools, encourage media to have more balanced coverage of race relations, increase minority contacts with city and officially recognize people who have helped improve race relations
Grand Island, Nebraska ¹	42,940	Grand Island Diversity Education Series (G.I.D.E.S)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mayor-appointed “Task Force on Youth” held two town hall meetings held with over 250 attendees who provided input on issues facing youth and families • From town hall meetings, it became known that much of the increase in youth violence was attributable to racial prejudice • This led to the formation of GIDES, which connects colleges, youth organizations and scouting groups with the Ministerial Association and the Multi-National Club to generate information, ideas and stories to reduce resentment, misunderstanding and mistrust • Funding from state Family Preservation and Support grant

Bellevue, Washington ¹	109,569	Cultural Diversity Program	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Various education and outreach initiatives coordinated through this program and carried out by different city departments and organizations • Sponsors workshops, seminars and forums on diversity issues • Participants: professionals, teachers, community organizers and social workers • Radio and TV program, “Voices of Diversity,” features interviews and segments on racism and related issues • Supports community events i.e. Latino Hispanic Heritage Month, Black History Month events • Community calendar reaches over 1,300 people, and covers upcoming events • Offers referrals to translate material(s) • Publishes community newsletter on related topics • Responsible for coordinating Interdepartmental Diversity Team which deals with internal diversity issues
Reading Borough, Berkshire, UK ¹⁰	145,000	Reading Borough Council Race Equality Scheme	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Borough schools must prepare and publish a race equality policy and monitor and assess how policies affect pupils, staff and parents • There is a general duty and responsibility to advise and support schools in developing effective race equality practice as an integral part of school improvement
Waltham Forest, London, England ¹¹	221,747	London Borough of Waltham Forest Race Equality Scheme 2009-2012	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Established a “National Skills Academy for Construction” in Leyton • Explores accessible formats to counter illiteracy and lack of interest in written material, crossing language barriers to black, Asian, and minority ethnic (BAME) community people

Hamilton, Ontario ⁹	504,559	AUMA Welcoming and Inclusive Communities Toolkit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • School Boards develop ways to include intercultural education in curriculum • Schools involve parents in this process • Interfaith communities take the lead in finding ways to increase interfaith and intercultural education throughout the community • Provides more opportunities for adults to learn about different faiths and cultures
Toronto, Ontario ²⁴	1,162,635	Toronto District School Board	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Committed to providing training to administrators of discipline including teachers and all persons in positions of authority on racial stereotyping and profiling, anti-racism, cross-cultural differences, and how to effectively deal with students whose disabilities may cause them to be disruptive in school • Committed to training staff that it is an expectation that staff be aware of and sensitive to the presence of racially biased education in the elementary and secondary school curriculum • Where bias is found to exist, the TDSB will ensure that school principals take corrective measures to make the curriculum inclusive of all of the communities it serves.

Commitment #10: Promote respect, understanding and appreciation of cultural diversity and the inclusion of Aboriginal and racialized communities into the cultural fabric of the municipality.

City	Population	Initiative/Program Name	Description
Little Rock, Arkansas ¹	183,133	Monthly Cultural and Educational Events	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organized by the Racial and Cultural Diversity Commission (RCDC), which is a group of individuals with different ethnic, faith and racial backgrounds • Held monthly, with a shifting focus on a different ethnic group each month • Aim is to educate residents about the contributions, accomplishments and heritage of different ethnic groups • Forum open to general public as well as professionals and community groups • Helps to develop inter-community relationships
		WorldFest	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Annual multicultural festival created to reduce racism and educate residents • Designed to be interactive and stimulating, with different activities such as the Tent of Languages and the Walk of Nations • Breakout sessions included the topics of: “manifestations of racism, analyzing internalized oppression, developing a power analysis, race based disparities, and understanding white privilege”

Federal Way, Washington ¹	83,850	Diversity Commission	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Commission consists of 9 publicly appointed members • Plans and hosts annual Martin Luther King Jr. Celebration and other events • Provides training sessions on dealing with institutional racism • Donates culturally diverse books for young children to libraries
Clarksburg, West Virginia ¹	16,743	Unity Project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provides mentorship and support for different organizations and “existing activities” which have been identified through the project • Facilitates community dialogue with West Virginia Human Rights Commission • Grew out of community's desire to understand racism and diversity after a visit from the Ku Klux Klan • Central tenets are to “add value to existing community activities... to be grassroots driven and to avoid commercial dominance”
Tukwila, Washington ¹	17,181	Equity and Diversity Commission	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Commission consists of 9 members • Designed and distributed multi-lingual community access guide in Vietnamese, Russian, Somali, Arabic, Srpski and Spanish • Promoted and adopted the Tukwila Pledge Against Racism, which community members and visitors are encouraged to sign

Rock Hill, South Carolina ¹	49,765	No Room For Racism	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reflects city's intolerance for racism • First phase included placement of "No Room for Racism" signs at all entrances • 93 businesses, organizations, churches, schools and other groups to sign No Room for Racism Resolutions • Community forum held in 1997 with reps from education, the church and the Catawba Indian Nation to discuss race and multiculturalism
Newcastle-Under-Lyme, London, UK ⁷	73,944	Newcastle-Under-Lyme Borough Council Race Equality Scheme 2008-2011	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Publishes a Community Cohesion Strategy in partnership with key strategic partners to promote race equality and community cohesion
Staffordshire Borough, UK ⁸	107,700	Race Equality Scheme 2008-2011	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ensures services are easy to access, timely and relevant, and are tailored to the needs of each community • Engages with communities and involves them in the design and delivery of services • Works with communities to identify barriers to cohesion and to promote inclusion

Brisbane, Australia ⁹	1,945,639	AUMA Welcoming and Inclusive Communities Toolkit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Works collaboratively across Brisbane City Council to ensure integrated responses to deliver culturally appropriate services • Ensures Council's signature facilities and programs celebrate and promote the city's cultural and linguistic diversity • Advocates to the Federal and State Government on the needs of people from culturally and linguistically diverse backgrounds in Brisbane • Develops and implement strategies to ensure that programs are accessible to and inclusive of people from culturally and linguistically diverse backgrounds • Works with multicultural and refugee communities to ensure Council programs target priority needs of these communities
Hamilton, Ontario ⁹	504,559	AUMA Welcoming and Inclusive Communities Toolkit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Carries out activities that increase people's understanding of the effect of racism on the Hamilton community • Engages Hamiltonians from cultural, religious and racially diverse groups, in community and civic opportunities • Leaders of faith, culture, and other groups are recognized and become partners with leaders from large institutions and organizations

Halifax, Nova Scotia ⁹	372,679	AUMA Welcoming and Inclusive Communities Toolkit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Seeks advice and where possible implements ideas from all its Diverse Communities • Plans and delivers services to its Diverse Communities in a manner reflective of their needs • Actively works towards ensuring participation is representative of its Diverse Communities in civic and community affairs • Communicates information about Municipal programs and activities to its Diverse Communities • Participates in the preservation, integration and celebration of the heritage, cultural and artistic values of all its Diverse Communities • Encourages its Diverse Communities to share their customs, values and traditions with one another
-----------------------------------	---------	--	--

-
- ¹ National League of Cities. (n.d.). *About Cities: City Knowledge Network*. Retrieved from <http://www2.nlc.org/examples/cknsearchtest.htm>.
- ² Law, I. (2007). *The Racism Reduction Agenda: building the framework, signposting good practice, and learning the lessons*. Retrieved from <http://www.sociology.leeds.ac.uk/assets/files/research/cers/racism-reduction-agenda.pdf>.
- ³ The Manchester Partnership. (n.d.). *Improving Race Equality in Manchester*. Retrieved from <http://manchesterpartnership.org.uk/includes/uploads/File/AGENDA%202010%20HISTORY.pdf>.
- ⁴ Tewkesbury Borough Council. (n.d.). *Race Equality Scheme 2008-2011*. Retrieved from http://www.tewkesbury.gov.uk/media/pdf/1/a/Race_Equality_Scheme.pdf.
- ⁵ Ellesmere Port and Neston Borough Council. (n.d.). *A Race Equality Scheme (Action Plan) for Ellesmere Port and Neston Borough Council 2008 – 2011*. Retrieved from www.epnbc.gov.uk/Ellesmere%20Port%20and%20Neston%20Borough%20Council/RaceEqualitySchemeActionPlan.pdf.
- ⁶ London Borough of Lewisham. (n.d.). *Race Equality Scheme 2005-2008 Action Plan*. Retrieved from <http://www3.lewisham.gov.uk/NR/rdonlyres/6DECA480-6343-43CE-9517-5C82E7F7F9E3/0/RaceEqualitySchemeAction.pdf>.
- ⁷ Newcastle-Under-Lyme Borough Council. (n.d.). *Race Equality Scheme Action Plan*. Retrieved from http://www.newcastle-staffs.gov.uk/Documents/Policies%20and%20Strategies/R/Race%20Equalities%20Scheme_SX8F18-A7808A69.pdf.
- ⁸ Staffordshire Borough Council. (2009). *Race Equality Scheme 2008-2011*. Retrieved from <http://www.eaststaffsbc.gov.uk/Services/Equalities%20Documents/East%20Staffordshire%20Race%20Equality%20Scheme%202008-11.pdf>.
- ⁹ Alberta Urban Municipalities Association. (n.d.). *Welcoming & Inclusive: Communities Toolkit*. Retrieved from http://www.auma.ca/live/digitalAssets/25/25953_WICT_booklet_10232008.pdf.
- ¹⁰ Reading Borough Council. (December 2006). *Race Equality Scheme*. Retrieved from <http://www.reading.gov.uk/communityandliving/equalityanddiversity/raceequalityscheme/General.asp?id=SX9452-A7821157>.
- ¹¹ London Borough of Waltham Forest. (n.d.). *Race Equality Scheme*. Retrieved from [http://www1.walthamforest.gov.uk/moderngov/Published/C00000287/M00001823/AI00011327/\\$5RESAppendix4LondonBoroughofWalthamForestRESAPtemplate1.docA.ps.pdf](http://www1.walthamforest.gov.uk/moderngov/Published/C00000287/M00001823/AI00011327/$5RESAppendix4LondonBoroughofWalthamForestRESAPtemplate1.docA.ps.pdf).

¹² London Borough of Richmond upon Thames. (n.d.). *Richmond upon Thames Race Equality Partnership*. Retrieved from http://www.richmond.gov.uk/rep_action_plan.doc.

¹³ Broxtowe Borough Council. *Housing Race Equality Policy*. Retrieved from <http://www.broxtowe.gov.uk/index.aspx?articleid=1569>.

¹⁴ London Borough of Hackney (September 2008). *Corporate Equality Plan 2006-2009 Part 2: Race Equality Scheme*. Retrieved from <http://www.hackneyhomes.org.uk/res-2008-update1.pdf>.

¹⁵ York Regional Police. (2009). *Police Community Advisory Council*. Retrieved from <http://www.police.york.on.ca/PCAC.aspx>.

¹⁶ Ontario Human Rights Commission, Toronto Police Services Board, & Toronto Police Services. (July 2008). *First Annual Status Report*. Retrieved from <https://ozone.scholarsportal.info/bitstream/1873/12458/1/285656.pdf>.

¹⁷ Corby Borough Council. (n.d.). *Revised Race Equality Scheme 2008-2011*. Retrieved from www.corby.gov.uk/CouncilAndDemocracy/CouncillorsDemocracyAndElections/Documents/Race%20Equality%20Scheme%202008_2011.pdf.

¹⁸ Equality Commission for Northern Ireland. (2009). *Anti-racist Workplace Week, 2009*. http://www.equalityni.org/sections/default.asp?cms=news_Campaigns_Anti-Racist+Workplace+Week+09&cmsid=1_21_118&id=118&secid=1.

¹⁹ Audit Commission. (n.d.). *Pre-tenancy Workshops – London Borough of Havering Council*. Retrieved from <http://www.audit-commission.gov.uk/housing/goodpractice/Tenancyandestatemanagement/Pages/pretenancyworkshops.aspx>.

²⁰ Tower Hamlets Council (n.d.). *Race Equality Scheme (2009-2010)*. Retrieved from <http://www.towerhamlets.gov.uk/idoc.ashx?docid=a436c849-0ea4-44bf-9d76-25fdcccef7eb&version=-1>

²¹ Epsom and Ewell Borough Council. (n.d.). *Black and Minority Ethnic Housing Strategy 2002/2003*. Retrieved from <http://www.epsom-ewell.gov.uk/EEBCWeb/FileDownload.aspx?guid=%7B9A41CF9A-BF9B-4536-87C1-BFB438E9FABE%7D>.

²² Tunbridge Wells Borough Council. (n.d.). *Minority Ethnic Housing Strategy and Action Plan*. Retrieved from <http://www2.tunbridgewells.gov.uk/pdf/ME%20HOUSING%20STRATEGY%20AND%20ACTION%20PLAN.pdf>.

²³ Ontario Human Rights Commission. (2009). *Housing*. Retrieved from <http://www.ohrc.on.ca/en/issues/housing>.

²⁴ Ontario Human Rights Commission. (n.d.). *Backgrounder – Human Rights Settlement Reached with Toronto District School Board*. Retrieved from <http://www.ohrc.on.ca/en/resources/news/Nov142005Backgrounder>.