

SECURITY SERVICES REVIEW

PRELIMINARY EMERGING
TOPICS/SOLUTIONS FROM CONSULTATIONS

SEPTEMBER 2022

YORK 



SECURITY SERVICES REVIEW

PRELIMINARY EMERGING TOPICS/SOLUTIONS

PREAMBLE

This document is a subsequent update of the topics and solutions identified in ongoing consultations between February-September 2022. As stated in the previous document, the consultations conducted include written submissions, a dedicated session with York's Community Safety Council, an online education session— attended by York community members as well as other post-secondary institutions, two community online town halls, meetings and group discussions with York students, faculty, and staff. Written submissions, meetings, and focus groups are still underway. It is important to recognize that the issues and solutions identified are undergoing further analysis and identification of detailed options will help to inform the final report. The solutions presented are driven by the community and are also anchored in best practice research and jurisdictional analysis.

QUESTIONS POSED FOR DISCUSSION ON EMERGING TOPICS/SOLUTIONS

1. Any identified topics and/or possible solutions that you have questions or concerns about?
2. Any identified topics and/or possible solutions that you would like to comment on?
3. Any possible topics and/or solutions that are missing?

THREE OVERARCHING TOPICS HAVE EMERGED TO DATE

I. Existing practices, structures, and procedures of York Security Services

- Issues of structural racial bias in security service activities that produce a security response on a variety of calls for services, including call centre rules, IDing practices, and uniforms being triggering for some community members
- Mental health crisis response — inadequacy of law enforcement/security model of response and a need for more involvement of other types of professionals and services
- Further coordination of security services with other departments and services at the university

- Develop more effective relationships with campus communities and groups
- Complaint system — lack of clear process; need for greater independence and transparency; loop back with the community on handling of complaints and broader transparency needed in university complaints system
- Lack of, or perceived lack of, campus community demographic make-up represented in security frontline staff and leadership
- Ineffective university response to address impacts of unhoused people on campus

II. Overarching EDI climate on York’s campuses in relation to security and safety

- Equity-deserving groups have identified the need for their experiences with discrimination to be understood and for better appreciation of this need in planning of security services, risk assessments and other campus services and programs
- Gender-based safety issues — consider the trauma experienced by persons coming from war torn locations
- Unhoused population — address the needs of the unhoused population on campus
- Students with precarious immigration status and vulnerability in the criminal justice system

III. Recommendations from the community on security response to inform the development of an alternate Security Services Model

- Broader range of services to address EDI related safety needs, particularly mental health calls
- Collaboration — student engagement in security and safety initiatives and more formal collaboration with Faculties and departments
- Race-based data collection in security operations
- Training and education — effective anti-racism training/education, de-escalation training/education and trauma informed
- Community and student engagement to build relationships and trust
- Address regulatory limitations of limited security response, which requires an increased presence of Toronto Police on campus to intervene — concern with ‘police’ presence on campus and how to balance this with campus security intervention
- Security services appropriate for when there are escalated safety concerns or needs (e.g., community safety is at risk)

MAPPING YORK SECURITY SERVICES (YSS) RELATED TOPICS WITH COMMUNITY PROVIDED OPTIONS/SOLUTIONS – COMPARING CURRENT STATE WITH PROPOSED SOLUTIONS AND OPTIONS

Topics	Current State	Related Consultee identified options/solutions	Additional options/solutions/details
<p>Potential of structural racial bias in security service activities</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Call centre rules may facilitate racial bias • IDing • Uniforms are triggering 	<p>Training provided annually on racial profiling and human rights through Centre for Human Rights, Equity, and Inclusion.</p> <p>Security Services asks for ID when there is an incident or when required by university approved procedures/policies (e.g., receipt of access cards etc.).</p> <p>Security Officials are required to ask for ID only from the complainant of an incident and are not allowed to randomly ask for ID from community members. All licensed security staff wear uniforms and Personal Protective Equipment for health and safety reasons and to comply with regulated professional standards.</p>	<p>Race based data collection in service delivery.</p> <p>Effective anti-racism training/education rooted in real situations/scenarios on campus. More diverse campus services deployed from call centre (e.g., counselling, administrative assistance etc.)</p> <p>Provide clear and transparent procedures for the community on security procedures and processes and circulate to student groups and leaders. Difficult to distinguish security and police uniforms – consider distinctions and clearly outline respective roles.</p> <p>Engage students more effectively and learn of lived experiences of marginalized and equity- deserving groups and plan services and risk assessments with these experiences in mind.</p>	<p>Communicate clearly and more frequently with the campus community about Standard Operating Procedures and engage with student leaders on these.</p> <p>Review security service procedures, practices, and training for structural racial bias including call centre referrals, stop practices, IDing, searches, use of force, decisions to trespass individuals, and decisions to arrest and call-in police.</p> <p>Ensure job design, hiring criteria, and training so that security management and staff can identify and address systemic racial bias and discrimination.</p> <p>Consider deployment of other types of professionals and non-uniform staff to address issues where appropriate. Establish best practices for collecting race-based data without biases, and with proper training.</p>

Topics	Current State	Related Consultee identified options/solutions	Additional options/solutions/details
<p>Mental health crisis response</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Law enforcement model of response 	<p>Security Services respond to calls and depending on the nature of the call or incident, utilize a pan-University, collaborative approach with Residence Life, Sexual Violence Response Office (SVRO), Division of Students, Office of Student Community Relations (OSCR), and other departments. Security Services call Toronto Police in cases involving the Mental Health Act (self harm or harm to others). Security Officials collaborate with Residence Life/Student Services at the “front end” of calls when the call involves students in residence experiencing crisis. Empathetic de-escalation training, Mental Health First Aid for Adults, suicide prevention, trauma informed, and crisis response training is delivered annually through experts to Security Services personnel.</p>	<p>Broader range of services to address EDI mental health related security needs particularly mental health calls. Student and departmental engagement in security and safety initiatives.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> More student/departmental engagement More collaborations with students/departments in programming <p>Enhanced de-escalation training education</p> <p>Identify ways to reduce calls to bring in police</p>	<p>Consider dedicated mental health/social work staff to support Security officials.</p> <p>Consider partnerships with relevant University department and faculty members with expertise in this area. Consider partnerships with faculty members from social work and health to provide student experiential learning placements.</p> <p>Consider development of joint procedures and training with other departments and professionals.</p>

Topics	Current State	Related Consultee identified options/solutions	Additional options/solutions/details
<p>Inability to address impacts of unhoused people on campus</p>	<p>Security Services are often called to respond to unhoused individuals.</p> <p>A pilot project was initiated with Security Services, Faculty of Nursing and local social services agencies to provide services and supports to unhoused individuals.</p> <p>The CORSAFE Program – a well-received university partnership between YSS and HNES was piloted in 2019 and was active until the COVID-19 pandemic. Nightly inspections conducted by Security Services of some campus buildings before overnight closure.</p> <p>YSS contacts City of Toronto outreach teams to assist with unhoused people on campus. The “Streets to Homes” team, is a regular resource and contact for YSS.</p>	<p>Broader range of professional services to address EDI related safety needs.</p> <p>More community engagement in security and safety activity.</p> <p>More collaboration with faculty members with expertise in these areas (social work, nursing, unhoused population) and consider student experiential work placements.</p>	<p>Acknowledge that the response to the unhoused requires dedicated and sustainable services that are available on York’s campuses, in addition to enforcement.</p> <p>Develop dedicated programs to support unhoused individuals on York’s campuses in collaboration with other York departments as well as municipal and social services. Consider partnerships with social work and health Faculties to provide experiential work placements.</p> <p>Toronto social services agencies have recommended mitigation against open access to campus buildings and offices overnight, which can create health and safety concerns for both unhoused individuals and the York community.</p>

Topics	Current State	Related Consultee identified options/solutions	Additional options/solutions/details
<p>Complaint system</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lack of clear process Independence and transparency Loop back 	<p>Security conducts internal investigation of complaints and initiates its own investigations of staff to ensure compliance with training, procedures etc.</p> <p>Security Services conducts investigations in conjunction with internal partners including University Human Resources Business Partners, Labour Relations, CHREI, etc., as required.</p>	<p>Consider accountability and transparency more broadly since some complaints involve multiple departments from across the University.</p>	<p>Develop a clear, independent, transparent process for complaints against security services with loop back/communications to the community on handling complaints. Formally analyze complaints to track and analyze systemic issues of concern.</p>
<p>More coordination of Security Services with other university departments and services</p>	<p>Several departments engage with Security Services informally on a regular basis.</p>	<p>More formalized collaboration with the community and enhanced student engagement.</p>	<p>Enhance formal linkages for coordination and collaboration with other campus departments and services aimed at enhancing security service delivery in collaboration with other departments.</p> <p>Consider joint protocols, procedures, and training.</p>

<p>Develop effective relationships with campus communities and groups</p>	<p>Security Community Relations Officials engage regularly with student, staff and faculty through events, orientation, staff onboarding and learning sessions.</p> <p>Security Services staff participate in President’s Safety Council.</p> <p>Annual fall and winter events are held on campus during Community Safety Week to engage with the community and foster awareness of services.</p>	<p>Proactive community and student engagement.</p> <p>Enhanced Police Powers</p>	<p>Specific community engagement and trust-building measures:</p> <p>Proactively engage the York community to build trust and enhance the quality of service for marginalized communities</p> <p>Understand community demographics and cultural needs Communicate clearly, how campus security differs from police</p> <p>Consider changes to uniforms to avoid uniforms presenting a barrier for service to community members, who’ve been traumatized or triggered by police activity</p> <p>Communicate more clearly and effectively, the services that are provided by security staff and the scope of their enforcement Review job descriptions and recruitment selection criteria to ensure positions emphasize skills in diverse community engagement and understanding of racial, system bias and discrimination</p> <p>Potential engagement of a few security officials with full police powers can enhance community safety without the need to involve Toronto Police Services</p>
--	---	--	---

Topics	Current State	Related Consultee identified options/solutions	Additional options/solutions/details
Lack of, or perceived lack of, campus community demographic make-up, represented in security frontline staff and leadership	Staff census of all staff exists but no analysis or reporting conducted.	Data collection	Review/revise recruitment and selection practices to enhance representative hiring. Report on racial, Indigenous, gender and other EDI-focused demographic make-up of security staff and leadership.

Additional information gathered from consultations that provide context:

It is important to note that York Security Services coordinates with other law enforcement and security actors on campus, such as:

- Police are frequently called in on matters that go beyond the mandate, powers, and/or resource limitations of York Security Services
- Private security guard operators may be employed by private businesses that operate on York facilities, primarily in York Lanes, or they may be contracted as part of security for large events organized by the University, University groups, or by independent actors renting York facilities.

Under the current legal and policy mandate, York Security Services staff are empowered to use force only on a defensive basis and are unable to aggressively use force or effect arrest.

- Without Special Constables on staff York Security Services staff do not have powers to apprehend individuals experiencing mental health crisis under the Mental Health Act and must routinely call-in police to address such mental health concerns.

The need to focus on equity and inclusion

Many consultees from equity deserving groups expressed a general concern with the overall equity environment at York University. Many consultees from these groups expressed concern that the same kinds of biases and prejudices found in the broader society were widespread at York. Issues referenced included:

- lack of representation in faculty and staff
- academic focuses and curriculum infused with views and attitudes that reflected the norm of dominant groups
- personal experience of micro-aggressions and inter-personal discrimination, and
- lack of serious administrative efforts to address issues of equity, diversity, inclusion, and decolonization.

The need to enhance personal safety protection for campus members experiencing threat or harassment

Some consultees identified situations where they or others they knew had experience threats to their personal safety. Such as:

- domestic violence
- harassment from campus and non-campus members
- threats from state actors related to scholarship or activism
- negative personal interactions

The need to ensure acceptance of Black and other racialized people from neighbourhoods adjacent to the Keele Campus

Some consultees expressed concern that the York University Keele campus was an unwelcome place for Black and other racialized communities living in its vicinity particularly from the Jane and Finch community. The appearance of security officials with their police-like uniforms contributes to this perception. In addition, one consultee indicated that there had been incidents experience of young, racialized youth from adjacent neighbourhoods who had been questioned regarding their presence at campus recreational fields.

Individuals with precarious immigration status

- York University should officially declare itself ‘sanctuary campuses and institute ‘don’t ask don’t tell’ policies and procedures consistently across the university including in activities of YSS and CSD
- SOPS and follow up training should be instituted in YSS to follow through on ‘don’t ask don’t tell’ approach

Hate related reporting

Immediately improve hate incident data collection and reporting processes to ensure that hate incidents are distinctly reported on annually with accompanying narratives

Trespassing

Concerns were raised by some consultees that major security decisions like trespassing of individuals are influenced by racial profiling and contribution to criminalization of individuals from equity deserving groups